

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. 554-5184  
Fax No. 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

July 10, 2020

**File No. 200510**

Lisa Gibson  
Environmental Review Officer  
Planning Department  
1650 Mission Street, Suite 400  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Gibson:

On July 9, 2020, the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 3, 2020, Election was amended by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee:

**File No. 200510**

**Charter Amendment (Fourth Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to create the Department of Sanitation and Streets to succeed to specific duties currently performed by the Department of Public Works; to create a Sanitation and Streets Commission to oversee the Department of Sanitation and Streets; to create a Public Works Commission to oversee the Department of Public Works; and to require an annual performance audit and cost and waste analysis for both departments; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; at an election to be held on November 3, 2020.**

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Victor Young".

By: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk  
Rules Committee

Attachment

c: Devyani Jain, Deputy Environmental Review Officer  
Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planning  
Don Lewis, Environmental Planning  
Laura Lynch, Environmental Planning

1 [Charter Amendment - Department of Sanitation and Streets, Sanitation and Streets Commission,  
2 and Public Works Commission]

3 **Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters at an election to be held on November**  
4 **3, 2020, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to create the**  
5 **Department of Sanitation and Streets to succeed to specific duties currently performed by**  
6 **the Department of Public Works; to create a Sanitation and Streets Commission to oversee**  
7 **the Department of Sanitation and Streets; to create a Public Works Commission to oversee**  
8 **the Department of Public Works; and to require an annual performance audit and cost**  
9 **and waste analysis for both departments; and affirming the Planning Department’s**  
10 **determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.**

11  
12 Section 1. The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this  
13 proposed Charter Amendment comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (California  
14 Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq.). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of  
15 the Board of Supervisors in File No. 200510 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board  
16 affirms this determination.

17  
18 Section 2. The Board of Supervisors hereby submits to the qualified voters of the City  
19 and County, at an election to be held on November 3, 2020, a proposal to amend the Charter of  
20 the City and County by revising Sections 3.104, 16.129, and F1.102, adding Sections 4.138,  
21 4.139, and 4.141, and revising and renumbering Section 4.130 as Section 4.140, to read as  
22 follows:

23 NOTE: **Unchanged Charter text and uncodified text** are in plain font.  
24 **Additions** are *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.  
25 **Deletions** are ~~*strike-through italics Times New Roman font*~~.  
**Asterisks** (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Charter subsections.

1  
2           **SEC. 3.104. CITY ADMINISTRATOR.**

3           \* \* \* \*

4           The City Administrator shall have power to:

5                 6. With the concurrence of the Mayor, appoint and remove the directors of the  
6 Departments of Administrative Services, Solid Waste, and Public Guardian/Administrator, ~~and~~  
7 ~~Public Works~~, and such other department heads which are placed under ~~his or her~~ the City  
8 Administrator's direction;

9           \* \* \* \*

10  
11           **SEC. 4.138. DEPARTMENT OF SANITATION AND STREETS.**

12           (a) **Establishment.** There shall be a Department of Sanitation and Streets, which  
13 shall come into existence three months after the Transition Date for the Sanitation and Streets  
14 Commission in Section 4.139(d). The Department shall be headed by the Director of Sanitation  
15 and Streets, who shall be qualified by either technical training or management experience in  
16 environmental services or the maintenance, sanitation, or cleaning of public spaces; and shall  
17 have a demonstrated knowledge of best practices regarding cleaning and maintenance of high-  
18 traffic or publicly accessible areas. The Department shall assume all responsibilities previously  
19 under the jurisdiction of the Department of Public Works that pertain to the duties specified in  
20 subsection (b).

21           (b) **Duties.** Except as otherwise provided in the Charter or pursuant to Section  
22 4.132, in addition to any other duties assigned by ordinance, the Department shall have the  
23 following duties:

24                 (1) efficient and systematic street sweeping, sidewalk cleaning, and litter  
25 abatement;

- 1                   (2) maintenance and cleaning of public restrooms in the public right of way;  
2                   (3) provision and maintenance of city trash receptacles;  
3                   (4) removal of illegal dumping and graffiti in the public right of way;  
4                   (5) maintenance of public medians, and of street trees in the public right of  
5 way pursuant to section 16.129;  
6                   (6) maintenance of City streets and sidewalks;  
7                   (7) construction, repair, remodeling, and management services for City-  
8 owned buildings and facilities; and  
9                   (8) control of pests on City streets and sidewalks.

10                   The Board of Supervisors may limit, modify, or eliminate the duties set forth in  
11 subsections (1) through (8), and may transfer any of those duties to the Department of Public  
12 Works or other City departments, by ordinance approved by two-thirds of the Board. Nothing in  
13 this Section 4.138 shall relieve property owners of the legal responsibilities set by local or State  
14 law, including as those laws may be amended in the future.

15                   (c) **Refuse Collection and Disposal Ordinance.** The Director of Sanitation and Streets  
16 shall perform the responsibilities assigned to the Director of Public Works by the Refuse  
17 Collection and Disposal Ordinance of November 8, 1932, as it may be amended from time to  
18 time.

19                   (d) **Administrative Support.** By no later than the Transition Date in Section 4.139(d),  
20 the Board of Supervisors shall by ordinance require the City Administrator, the Department of  
21 Public Works, and/or any other City department to provide administrative support for the  
22 Department, which shall include but need not be limited to human resources, performance  
23 management, finance, budgeting, technology, emergency planning, training, and employee safety  
24 services. At any time more than two years and three months after the Transition Date, the Board  
25

1 of Supervisors may adopt ordinances requiring the Department of Sanitation and Streets to  
2 assume responsibility for some or all of that administrative support.

3 (e) **Transition.**

4 No later than the Transition Date in Section 4.139(d), the City Administrator shall submit  
5 to the Board of Supervisors a proposed ordinance amending the Municipal Code, including but  
6 not limited to the Public Works Code, to conform to Sections 3.104, 4.139, 4.140, 4.141, 16.129,  
7 F1.102, and this Section 4.138, as adopted or amended by the voters at the November 3, 2020  
8 election.

9  
10 **SEC. 4.139. SANITATION AND STREETS COMMISSION.**

11 (a) **Purpose.** There is hereby established a Sanitation and Streets Commission. The  
12 Commission shall set policy directives and provide oversight for the Department of Sanitation  
13 and Streets.

14 (b) **Membership and Terms of Office.**

15 (1) The Commission shall consist of five members, appointed as follows:  
16 Seats 1 and 2 shall be appointed by the Mayor subject to confirmation by the  
17 Board of Supervisors. Each nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within  
18 60 days. If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the  
19 nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed  
20 confirmed. Seat 1 shall be held by a person who is a small business owner. Seat 2 shall be held  
21 by a person with experience in project management.

22 Seat 3 shall be appointed by the Controller subject to confirmation by the Board  
23 of Supervisors. The nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days.  
24 If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination  
25

1 is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed confirmed.

2 Seat 3 shall be held by a person who has a background in finance and audits.

3 Seats 4 and 5 shall be appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Seat 4 shall be held  
4 by a person who has a background in either urban forestry, urban design, or environmental  
5 services. Seat 5 shall be held by a person with significant experience in cleaning and  
6 maintaining public spaces.

7 (2) Members of the Commission shall serve four-year terms; provided,  
8 however, the term of the initial appointees in Seats 1 and 4 shall be two years.

9 (3) Members may be removed at will by their respective appointing officer.

10 (c) **Duties.** With regard to the Department of Sanitation and Streets, beginning three  
11 months after the Transition Date in subsection (d), the Commission shall exercise all the powers  
12 and duties of boards and commissions set forth in Sections 4.102, 4.103, and 4.104, and may  
13 take other actions as prescribed by ordinance. In addition, the Commission shall:

14 (1) review and evaluate data regarding street and sidewalk conditions,  
15 including but not limited to data collected by the Department, and annual reports generated by  
16 the Controller;

17 (2) establish minimum standards of cleanliness for the public right of way,  
18 and set baselines for services to be administered by the Department;

19 (3) approve all contracts proposed to be entered into by the Department,  
20 provided that the Commission may delegate this responsibility to the Director of the Department,  
21 or the Director's designee;

22 (4) perform an annual cost analysis evaluating whether there are  
23 inefficiencies or waste in the Department's administration and operations; and

24 (5) perform an annual review on the designation and filling of Department  
25 positions, as exempt, temporary, provisional, part-time, seasonal or permanent status, the

1 number of positions that are vacant, and at the Commission's discretion, other data regarding  
2 the Department's workforce. This function shall not in any way limit the roles of the Civil  
3 Service Commission or the Department of Human Resources under the Charter.

4 (d) **Transition provisions.**

5 (1) The Commission shall come into existence on the Transition Date, which  
6 shall be established by the Board of Supervisors by written motion adopted by a majority vote of  
7 its members, provided that the Transition Date shall be no earlier than July 1, 2022. The Board  
8 of Supervisors shall vote on a written motion to establish the Transition Date no later than  
9 January 1, 2022. If the Board of Supervisors fails to adopt such a motion by January 1, 2022,  
10 the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors shall place such a motion on the agenda of a Board of  
11 Supervisors meeting at least once every three months thereafter until such time as the Board of  
12 Supervisors adopts a motion establishing the Transition Date. The Mayor, Board of  
13 Supervisors, and Controller shall make initial appointments to the Commission by no later than  
14 three months before the Transition Date. The terms of all five members shall commence at noon  
15 on the Transition Date.

16 (2) The Commission shall have its inaugural meeting by no later than 30 days  
17 after three members of the Commission have assumed office.

18 (3) The Director of Public Works or person serving in an acting capacity as  
19 Director of Public Works, at the time the Commission comes into existence, shall perform the  
20 duties of the Director of the Department of Sanitation and Streets in an acting capacity until the  
21 Commission appoints a new Director in accordance with the Charter provisions governing  
22 appointment of a department head serving under a commission.

1           **SEC. ~~4.1404.130~~. DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS.**

2           Except as otherwise specified in the Charter, including in Section 4.138(b)(7), ~~The duties~~  
3 ~~and functions~~ of the Department of Public Works shall *design, build, and improve the City's*  
4 *infrastructure and public right of way, and assume any other duties* ~~be assigned by the City~~  
5 ~~Administrator~~, by ordinance or pursuant to Section 4.132. *The Department shall be headed by*  
6 *the Director of Public Works, who shall be qualified by either technical training or management*  
7 *experience in engineering or architecture.*

8  
9           **SEC. 4.141. PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION.**

10          (a) **Purpose.** *There is hereby established a Public Works Commission. The*  
11 *Commission shall set policy directives and provide oversight for the Department of Public*  
12 *Works.*

13          (b) **Membership and Terms of Office.**

14                 (1) *The Commission shall consist of five members, appointed as follows:*

15                 *Seats 1 and 5 shall be appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Seat 1 shall be held*  
16 *by a registered professional engineer licensed in the State of California, with a background in*  
17 *civil, mechanical, or environmental engineering, and Seat 5 shall be an at-large position.*

18                 *Seats 2 and 4 shall be appointed by the Mayor subject to confirmation by the*  
19 *Board of Supervisors. Each nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within*  
20 *60 days. If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the*  
21 *nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed*  
22 *confirmed. Seat 2 shall be held by a registered architect licensed in the State of California, and*  
23 *Seat 4 shall be an at-large position.*

24                 *Seat 3 shall be held by a person with a background in finance with at least 5*  
25 *years in auditing experience, appointed by the Controller subject to confirmation by the Board of*



1 Supervisors. The nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days. If  
2 the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is  
3 transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed confirmed.

4 (2) Members of the Commission shall serve four-year terms; provided,  
5 however, the term of the initial appointees in Seats 1, 3, and 5 shall be two years.

6 (3) Commissioners may be removed from office at will by their respective  
7 appointing authority.

8 **(c) Powers and Duties.**

9 (1) With regard to the Department of Public Works, beginning on September  
10 1, 2022, the Commission shall exercise all the powers and duties of boards and commissions set  
11 forth in Sections 4.102, 4.103, and 4.104, and may take other actions as prescribed by  
12 ordinance.

13 (2) The Commission shall oversee the Department's performance, including  
14 evaluation of data collected by the Department, the Controller, and other City agencies.

15 (3) The Commission shall approve all contracts proposed to be entered into  
16 by the Department, provided that the Commission may delegate this responsibility to the  
17 Director of Public Works, or the Director's designee.

18 (4) The Commission shall require the Director of Public Works, or the  
19 Director's designee, to provide the Commission with proof of adequate performance of any  
20 contract entered into by the Department for public works involving the City's infrastructure or  
21 public right of way, based on written documentation including documentation that the building  
22 official has issued a building or site permit and a final certificate of occupancy.

23 (5) The Commission shall perform an annual review on the designation and  
24 filling of Department positions, as exempt, temporary, provisional, part-time, seasonal or  
25 permanent status, the number of positions that are vacant, and at the Commission's discretion,

1 other data regarding the Department's workforce. This function shall not in any way limit the  
2 roles of the Civil Service Commission or the Department of Human Resources under the  
3 Charter.

4 (d) **Transition provisions.**

5 (1) The Mayor, Board of Supervisors, and Controller shall make initial  
6 appointments to the Commission by no later than the Appointment Deadline, which shall be  
7 either noon on June 1, 2022, or an earlier date established by the Board of Supervisors by  
8 written motion adopted no later than January 1, 2022 by a majority vote of its members. The  
9 Commission shall come into existence either at noon on the 31st day after the Appointment  
10 Deadline, or at noon on the date that three members of the Commission have assumed office,  
11 whichever is later. The terms of all five members shall commence at noon on the 31st day after  
12 the Appointment Deadline, regardless of when the Commission comes into existence.

13 (2) The Commission shall have its inaugural meeting by no later than three  
14 months after the terms of the initial members begin.

15 (3) The Director of Public Works at the time the Commission comes into  
16 existence shall remain in that position unless removed from it in accordance with the Charter  
17 provisions governing removal of a department head serving under a commission. If a person is  
18 serving in an acting capacity as Director at the time the Commission comes into existence, the  
19 preceding sentence applies, except that the position shall also be considered vacant for purposes  
20 of the next sentence. If the position of Director is vacant for any reason, including removal of  
21 the incumbent Director, the position shall be filled in accordance with the Charter provisions  
22 governing appointment of a department head serving under a commission. In that event, a  
23 person removed from the position under the first sentence of this subsection may be considered  
24 for appointment to the position.

1           **SEC. 16.129. STREET TREE MAINTENANCE.**

2           (a) Definitions. For purposes of this Section 16.129:

3           \* \* \* \*

4           “Maintenance” (and its root “Maintain”) shall mean those actions necessary to  
5 promote the life, growth, health, or beauty of a Tree. Maintenance includes both routine  
6 maintenance and major maintenance. Routine maintenance includes adequate watering to ensure  
7 the Tree’s growth and sustainability; weed control; removal of Tree-well trash; staking;  
8 fertilizing; routine adjustment and timely removal of stakes, ties, Tree guards, and Tree grates;  
9 bracing; and Sidewalk repairs related to the Tree’s growth or root system. Major maintenance  
10 includes structural pruning as necessary to maintain public safety and to sustain the health,  
11 safety, and natural growth habit of the Tree; pest and disease-management procedures as needed  
12 and in a manner consistent with public health and ecological diversity; and replacement of dead  
13 or damaged Trees. Pruning practices shall be in compliance with International Society of  
14 Arboriculture Best Management Practices and ANSI Pruning Standards, whichever is more  
15 protective of Tree preservation, or any equivalent standard or standards selected by the Director  
16 of the Department of Sanitation and Streets~~Public Works~~.

17           \* \* \* \*

18           “Street Tree” shall mean any Tree growing within the public right-of-way, including  
19 unimproved public streets and Sidewalks, and any Tree growing on land under the jurisdiction of  
20 the Department of Public Works or the Department of Sanitation and Streets. “Street Tree” does  
21 not include any other forms of landscaping.

22           \* \* \* \*

23           (g) Beginning in fiscal year 2018-2019, the City may suspend growth in the City’s \$19  
24 million contribution to the Fund under subsection (f) of this Section 16.129 if the City’s  
25 projected budget deficit for the upcoming fiscal year at the time of the Joint Report or Update to

1 the five-year financial plan as prepared jointly by the Controller, the Mayor’s Budget Director,  
2 and the Board of Supervisors’ Budget Analyst exceeds \$200 million adjusted annually by  
3 changes in aggregate discretionary revenues as defined in subsection (f) of this Section 16.129.

4 (h) Administration and Use of the Fund. The Department of Sanitation and  
5 StreetsPublic Works shall administer the Fund. Monies in the Fund shall only be used for the  
6 following purposes:

- 7 (1) Maintenance and Removal of Street Trees;
- 8 (2) Necessary costs of administering the Fund; and
- 9 (3) Making grants totaling up to \$500,000 annually to the San Francisco Unified  
10 School District exclusively to fund Maintenance and Removal of Trees on School District  
11 property.

12 \* \* \* \*

13 (i) Annual Reports. Commencing with a report filed no later than January 1, 2019,  
14 covering the fiscal year ending June 30, 2018, the Department of Sanitation and StreetsPublic  
15 Works shall file annually with the Board of Supervisors, by January 1 of each year, a report  
16 containing the amount of monies collected in and expended from the Fund during the prior fiscal  
17 year, and such other information as the Director of the Department of Sanitation and  
18 StreetsPublic Works, in the Director’s sole discretion, shall deem relevant to the operation of this  
19 Section 16.129.

20 \* \* \* \*

21  
22 **F1.102. STREET, SIDEWALK, AND PARK CLEANING AND MAINTENANCE.**

23 (a) The Services Audit Unit shall conduct annually a performance audit of the City's  
24 street, sidewalk, and public park maintenance and cleaning operations. The annual audit shall:  
25

1 (1) Include quantifiable, measurable, objective standards for street, sidewalk,  
2 and park maintenance, to be developed in cooperation and consultation with the Department of  
3 Sanitation and Streets, the Department of Public Works, and the Recreation and Park  
4 Department;

5 \* \* \* \*

6 (b) The Services Audit Unit shall conduct annually a cost and waste analysis evaluating  
7 whether there are inefficiencies or waste in the administration and operations of the Department  
8 of Sanitation and Streets, and the Department of Public Works or inefficiencies or waste in the  
9 division of labor between the two departments. The annual audit shall make quantifiable,  
10 measurable recommendations for the elimination of inefficient operations and functions, and  
11 shall include:

12 (1) Consolidation of duplicative and overlapping activities and functions;

13 (2) Integration and standardization of information maintenance systems that  
14 promote interdepartmental sharing of information and resources;

15 (3) Departmental accounting for expenditure of resources in terms of effectiveness  
16 of the service or product delivered;

17 (4) Departmental deployment and utilization of personnel, the City's personnel  
18 procurement system, and reforms to enhance the quality of work performance of public  
19 employees; and

20 (5) Methods of operation to reduce consumption and waste of resources.

21 (b~~c~~) In addition, all City agencies engaged in street, sidewalk, or park maintenance  
22 shall establish regular maintenance schedules for streets, sidewalks, parks and park facilities,  
23 which shall be available to the public and on the department's website. Each such department  
24 shall monitor compliance with these schedules, and shall publish regularly data showing the  
25 extent to which the department has met its published schedules. The City Services Audit Unit

1 shall audit each department's compliance with these requirements annually, and shall furnish  
2 recommendations for meaningful ways in which information regarding the timing, amount and  
3 kind of services provided may be gathered and furnished to the public.

4

5 APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
6 DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

7 By: \_\_\_\_\_/s/  
8 JON GIVNER  
9 Deputy City Attorney

10 n:\legana\as2020\2000309\01461711.docx

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25