



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Parking Operations – FY 2020-21

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

AIRPORT COMMISSION
 [PS DIVISION CODE + TITLE]
 PARKING OPERATIONS
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2020-21

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 5,508	\$ 6,612	\$ 143,753	\$ 172,573
Manager II	0923	2.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 248,416	\$ 298,219
Manager I	0922	1.0	\$ 4,432	\$ 5,321	\$ 115,685	\$ 138,878
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,254	\$ 5,107	\$ 111,033	\$ 133,293
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,457	\$ 4,150	\$ 90,226	\$ 108,315
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 2,844	\$ 3,414	\$ 74,225	\$ 89,105
Clerk	1404	1.0	\$ 2,026	\$ 2,432	\$ 52,875	\$ 63,475
Sr. Clerk	1406	5.0	\$ 2,103	\$ 2,525	\$ 274,484	\$ 329,513
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,775	\$ 3,331	\$ 72,420	\$ 86,939
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	\$ 3,016	\$ 3,621	\$ 78,725	\$ 94,508
Accountant II	1652	1.0	\$ 3,037	\$ 3,646	\$ 79,269	\$ 95,161
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	\$ 3,025	\$ 3,631	\$ 78,943	\$ 94,769
Investigator	4334	2.0	\$ 6,744	\$ 8,096	\$ 352,035	\$ 422,611
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	18.0	\$ 3,128	\$ 3,755	\$ 1,469,494	\$ 1,764,099
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	\$ 2,763	\$ 3,317	\$ 180,290	\$ 216,434
Cashier III	4322	40.0	\$ 2,531	\$ 3,038	\$ 2,642,003	\$ 3,171,672
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	\$ 4,043	\$ 4,853	\$ 105,511	\$ 126,663
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	\$ 3,263	\$ 3,917	\$ 170,337	\$ 204,486
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	\$ 4,140	\$ 4,970	\$ 108,062	\$ 129,726
S Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	\$ 5,335	\$ 6,404	\$ 139,238	\$ 167,153
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	\$ 4,461	\$ 5,355	\$ 349,274	\$ 419,297
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	\$ 2,363	\$ 2,837	\$ 3,330,724	\$ 3,998,468
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,568	\$ 3,083	\$ 67,028	\$ 80,466
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	\$ 2,329	\$ 2,796	\$ 182,366	\$ 218,927
Custodian	2708	34.0	\$ 2,117	\$ 2,541	\$ 1,878,318	\$ 2,254,883
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			393,294	472,142
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			350,833	421,168
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
	Total FTE	179.5				
			Total Salary Costs-->		\$ 12,394,735	\$ 14,879,634
			Total of Other Compensation-->		\$ 744,127	\$ 893,310

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932 71,073		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 65,485		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922 62,967		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657 56,162		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844 48,430		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222 42,496		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404 34,579		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406 35,329		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408 41,827		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842 44,165		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652 45,040		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4366 44,246		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4334 63,277		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1326 45,245		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1324 41,714		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322 39,465		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7318 56,865		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334 48,419		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205 56,283		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8209 107,118		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205 59,216		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207 37,844		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718 39,827		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2716 37,514		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708 35,458		
	0 0		
		Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 6,546,125	\$ 7,318,701

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Operating Expenses	\$ 1,224,091	\$ 1,224,091
Credit Card Processing Fees	\$ 1,005,067	\$ 1,005,067
Training	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,829,158	\$ 2,829,158

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 22,514,146	\$ 25,920,803
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 22,817,792	\$ 22,877,383
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ (303,646)	\$ 3,043,420
% of Savings to City Cost	-1%	12%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. 1971 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Operating costs include operating expenses & credit card fees. FTEs are based on Contractor FTEs.
6. In addition to the costs outlined above, the City would have to incur additional expenses to provide the following no cost value added services that are offered by the contractor:
 - Management of parking specific marketing campaigns
 - Legal services for subcontracted contracts
 - Parking data analyses
 - Increased parking facility insurance premiums and increased claim settlement costs to the City due to the loss of contractor's liability insurance coverage
 - An automated and proprietary software that reconciles general ledger revenue entries against location-specific bank deposits to identify anomalies, including: missing deposits, out-of-balance entries, deposits to wrong location, etc.