

From: [Angulo, Sunny \(BOS\)](#)
To: [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Fwd: HRCSF opposing Jane Natoli appointment to SFMTA Board
Date: Monday, August 17, 2020 4:50:42 PM

Our offices are in receipt of the below correspondence regarding Item 21 on tomorrow's agenda, fyi

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

From: Cynthia Fong <cynthia@hrssf.org>
Sent: Monday, August 17, 2020 4:48 PM
To: BOS-Supervisors; BOS-Legislative Aides
Cc: Fred Sherburn Zimmer
Subject: HRCSF opposing Jane Natoli appointment to SFMTA Board

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors,

I write on behalf of the Housing Rights Committee of SF (HRCSF) in opposition to the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

Unfortunately, her record shows that she will not represent the interests of the most marginalized members of San Francisco or our community - particularly communities of color, tenants, seniors and people with disabilities who depend on safe pedestrian access and public transportation on a daily basis.

Respectfully,
Cynthia Fong
Lead Organizer

--

Cynthia Fong
Housing Rights Committee of San Francisco
Richmond District Community Organizer
(pronouns: *they/she*)

www.hrssf.org | <https://www.facebook.com/housingrightsSF/>

Our offices are currently closed to the public in response to public health recommendations regarding COVID-19. If you are contacting us regarding Counseling: please email or call (415-947-9085) and provide your name, phone number, and we will have a counselor return your call as soon as possible. We will not be meeting tenants in person for the time

being. We will announce any changes to our programming via our newsletter and [facebook](#) if you want to follow along.

From: [Latino Democratic Club](#)
To: [Board of Supervisors, \(BOS\)](#); [BOS-Legislative Aides](#); [Somera, Alisa \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Gabriel Medina](#); [San Francisco Latino Democratic Club Executive Board](#); [LDC President](#)
Subject: SF Latino Democratic Club Opposition to Jane Natoli SFMTA Appointment Nomination
Date: Monday, August 17, 2020 3:11:17 PM
Attachments: [SFLDC Opposition Letter- SFMTA Appointment Nomination of Jane Natoli.pdf](#)

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Good Afternoon,

We are writing to express our strong opposition to the appointment nomination of Jane Natoli. Attached you will find SFLDC's opposition letter.

Respectfully,

SF Latino Democratic Club Eboard



Re: San Francisco Latino Democratic Club Opposes the Appointment of Jane Natoli to SFMTA Board

Dear Board of Supervisors:

We write in opposition to the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors. While it is true that Ms. Natoli's nomination was sitting in the Rules Committee waiting to be scheduled for a public hearing, that was presumably to give the nominee time for due diligence and community outreach. We were never notified that the nominee was going to be scheduled at the Rules Committee finally, and were taken by surprise too late when we found out that the item had been heard and forwarded out with recommendation. Our membership surely would have called in or notified the Rules Committee members about our concerns about Ms. Natoli's on-the-record positions about many issues that have long impacted the Latinx community. This is a classic example of the struggles and barriers to political power that Latinx and immigrant communities have historically faced when attempting to gain equitable representation at City Hall. Indeed, we continue to lack Latinx representation on the Board of Supervisors and now, with the departure of SFMTA Board Member Art Torres, we lack any representation on one of the most powerful legislative bodies outside of the Board of Supervisors.

The Latino Democratic Club has long advocated for transit justice and for equitable representation of our most vulnerable and transit-dependent communities on the SFMTA Board, regardless of their zip code. However, we cannot accomplish our vision to have more equitable transit policies if the Board of Supervisors are not willing to stand with the community. We are deeply concerned with the governance of the SFMTA and historic lack of accountability on issues that impact our immigrant and low-income communities the most. Particularly now, when our Latinx/Latino community is facing record vulnerabilities due to COVID-19, it is unacceptable to not not engage our community in the decision making process on the issues that impact us

the most, whether its safe travel to and from our essential jobs, strong leadership on towing fees, regressive funding measures and fare increases (something that Ms. Natoli has stated publicly she supports) or the disproportionate impacts of police enforcement on Black and Brown bodies using our public streets. We have also advocated for stronger regulations on the tech industry's privatization of the public realm and the furtherance of the digital divide that has excluded so many Latinos from accessing everything from Commuter Shuttles and their red bus lanes to e-scooters and e-bikes. Ms. Natoli is a longtime advocate of these industries and has done nothing to understand the incredible suffering that these industries have brought to communities experiencing widespread displacement and gentrification, like the Mission District. Our merchants and immigrant-owned small businesses are suffering and struggling to access the same recovery resources enjoyed by many white-owned businesses that have been bolstered by an infusion of investment capital.

The Mission, Tenderloin and Excelsior neighborhoods have some of the highest Latino demographics in the City, and we expect these Districts to have a voice in this process. By appointing Ms. Natoli, the members of the Board of Supervisors would be excluding the Latino participation amid Covid-19. We understand that Ms. Natoli as a former Board member of the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition was helpful in fundraising and development of this city grantee. With all due respect, the SF Bicycle Coalition's predominantly white membership has also struggled to stand in alliance with Black and Brown and low-income API communities - yet they have been ably represented on the SFMTA Board.

We understand that the Mayor has hired a new Appointments Director. We are hopeful for the opportunity to build a relationship where all Mayoral nominees understand that communities of color must have truly equitable representation on Boards and Commissions, regardless if they have the time, resources and access to sit call in to remote meetings. We look forward to working with the Mayor's Office on vetting candidates that come from our community, and have a history of working on the issues that impact us the most. Until then, the Board of Supervisors is tasked with vetting the candidates put forward by the Mayor with the highest standards of community input in mind.

We respect that the Chinese community has long sought representation on the SFMTA Board, as well, and respect the community process that our API brothers and sisters have undertaken with respect to identifying and vetting a candidate for the SFMTA Board. We support further diversifying the SFMTA Board, particularly with voices that are willing to address the systemic barriers in our transportation system. Unfortunately, Ms. Natoli's record shows that she will not represent the interests of our struggling Latino community, low-income people, immigrants or

people of color in San Francisco. This is an opportunity for San Francisco transportation justice advocates to stand in unity by opposing her appointment and demand better of our elected leadership. We need representatives that fight for the interests of the community, not market rate developers who are invested to further displace marginalized communities across San Francisco. By opposing this appointment, we are sending a strong message to San Franciscans that we are truly committed to repairing years of redlining and transit injustice.

Transportation is a key driver of inequities and redlining in communities of color, particularly at a time when normal SFMTA service has been severely disrupted and indefinitely eliminated. Economic disparities beset Latinos across the city, and the specter of displacement continued to bedevil those living in the Mission. Latinos and people of color are the most impacted by gentrification and the absence of transit justice. In 2019, it was evident when the SFMTA refused to listen to the community input on red lanes which has had a detrimental impact on the Latino community.

We ask that you stand with people of color and the working class by voting in opposition of Jane Natoli's appointment. We urge you to exercise your discretion under Section 3.100 of the San Francisco Charter to reject the appointment of Ms. Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and to wait for Mayoral appointees who will elevate the voices of the Latino community and people of color who have experienced the real challenges of public transportation.

Sincerely,

San Francisco Latino Democratic Club E-board

From: [Angulo, Sunny \(BOS\)](#)
To: [Curtis Bradford](#)
Cc: [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Somera, Alisa \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: RE: TPC Opposition to Jane Natoli appointment
Date: Monday, August 17, 2020 12:24:17 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)

Thank you for your correspondence, Mr. Bradford.

Supervisor Peskin is in receipt of your email with respect to Item 21 on tomorrow's calendar and will take it into consideration. By copy of this email, I am asking the Clerk's office to include the Tenderloin People's Congress position letter in the file for the record.

Best,
Sunny

From: Curtis Bradford <CBradford@tndc.org>
Sent: Monday, August 17, 2020 10:12 AM
To: BOS-Supervisors <bos-supervisors@sfgov.org>; BOS-Legislative Aides <bos-legislative_aides@sfgov.org>
Subject: TPC Opposition to Jane Natoli appointment

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors,

I am writing to express Tenderloin People's Congress opposition to the appointment of Jane Natoli to the SFMTA Board. Our reasons are in alignment with those expressed by the Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club in its recent letter (copied below). While we at the TPC also recognize the historic nature of her appointment, we also believe that her record does not support those most marginalized in the Tenderloin Community as is detailed in the letter from the Harvey Milk Club. We urge you to reject the appointment of Jane Natoli.

Respectfully,
Curtis Bradford, co=Chair Tenderloin People's Congress
www.tlpeoplesplan.com

(Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club Letter)

Dear Chair Ronen, Members of the Rules Committee, and Supervisors:

We write in opposition to the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

As an organization that has long advocated for LGBTQIA+ representation at all levels of

government, we appreciate the fact that Ms. Natoli would be the first transgender person appointed to serve on the MTA Board. Unfortunately, her record shows that she will not represent the interests of the most marginalized members of San Francisco or our community - particularly communities of color, queer people of color, seniors and people with disabilities who depend on safe pedestrian access and public transportation on a daily basis.

Transportation is a key driver of equities and inequities, particularly at a time when normal MTA service has been severely disrupted and indefinitely eliminated for many communities. Ms. Natoli has a robust online presence that raises multiple concerns about her ability to respond effectively to marginalized voices, including:

- Unqualified support for project proposals and for-profit mobility devices over the objections of sensitive communities who see them as instruments of gentrification;
- Calling out public officials who have wrestled with the implications of for-profit mobility devices on senior and disability advocates and other communities of concern;
- Signaling support for a Muni fare increase that was opposed by ten out of eleven members of the Board of Supervisors; and
- Accepting a contribution during her campaign for DCCC from Josephine Zhao, who has referred to a Chinese member of the Board of Supervisors as a “race-traitor” and described California’s gender neutral bathroom bill as “evil legislation.”

As the conversation around transit increasingly includes discussion of “transit-oriented” housing development, we have serious concerns about appointing a Board member of YIMBY Action, an organization whose policy positions have been repeatedly rejected by San Francisco voters. Those positions include advocating against higher percentages of inclusionary housing in new development (in favor of a trickle-down market rate housing approach that lacks nuance or consideration for impacts to marginalized communities) and hedging on support of 2018’s Prop 10, which would have repealed the Costa Hawkins Act and allowed for local expansion of rent control. Costa Hawkins repeal remains a bellwether issue for tenant and affordable housing advocates.

Ultimately, Natoli’s appointment reeks of political quid-pro-quo for supporting the Mayor, and is not supported by substantive expertise or merit on the issues that matter. We urge you to exercise your discretion under Section 3.100 of the San Francisco Charter to reject the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and to wait for Mayoral appointees who will elevate the voices of our most marginalized, public transit-reliant residents.

Curtis Bradford, Community Organizer

Tenderloin Neighborhood Development Corporation (TNDC)

210 Golden Gate Ave. San Francisco, CA 94102

☎ 415-426-8982 (Cel)

☎415-358-3962 (Office, currently not in use)

✉cbradford@tndc.org

Pronouns: he/him

“The opposite of poverty is not wealth. The opposite of poverty is Justice!”-Bryan Stevenson, EJI

www.tndc.org

At TNDC, we believe that when people have homes, communities thrive. We envision a San Francisco where low-income people can afford housing that meets their basic needs, is close to the amenities and services that enhance their quality of life, and provides them with the safety and stability they need to fulfill their potential. [Will you help us?](#)



From: [Angulo, Sunny \(BOS\)](#)
To: [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Somera, Alisa \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: FW: Harvey Milk Club Response & Opposition to Appointment of Jane Natoli
Date: Monday, August 17, 2020 12:12:05 PM
Attachments: [Jane Natoli Milk Letter.pdf](#)

Good afternoon –

Our office is in receipt of the attached letter regarding Item 21 on tomorrow's calendar. Please add to the file.

Best,
Sunny

From: Harvey Milk Club Correspondent <correspondent@milkclub.org>
Sent: Monday, August 17, 2020 12:03 PM
To: BOS-Supervisors <bos-supervisors@sfgov.org>; BOS-Legislative Aides <bos-legislative_aides@sfgov.org>
Subject: Harvey Milk Club Response & Opposition to Appointment of Jane Natoli

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors:

The Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club hereby re-submits our letter opposing the nomination of Jane Natoli to the MTA Board of Directors. We understand that Ms. Natoli has attempted to undermine our advocacy by emailing the entire Board of Supervisors to say that we have not met with her. She does not, however, respond to the substance of our letter which outlines a problematic record undermining her candidacy for one of the City's most powerful legislative bodies.

It is not the job of community organizations to invite nominees to explain or equivocate their problematic records before us. If Ms. Natoli wanted the support of the Milk Club in spite of the record set forth in the attached letter, it is her obligation to earn that support. She has failed to do so. Ms. Natoli's record speaks for itself, and our opposition remains unequivocal.

Signed,

The Executive Board of the Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club
www.milkclub.org



Re: Rules Committee Agenda Item 6 - The Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club Opposes the Appointment of Jane Natoli to SFMTA Board

Dear Chair Ronen, Members of the Rules Committee, and Supervisors:

We write in opposition to the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

As an organization that has long advocated for LGBTQIA+ representation at all levels of government, we appreciate the fact that Ms. Natoli would be the first transgender person appointed to serve on the MTA Board. Unfortunately, her record shows that she will not represent the interests of the most marginalized members of San Francisco or our community - particularly communities of color, queer people of color, seniors and people with disabilities who depend on safe pedestrian access and public transportation on a daily basis.

Transportation is a key driver of equities and inequities, particularly at a time when normal MTA service has been severely disrupted and indefinitely eliminated for many communities. Ms. Natoli has a robust online presence that raises multiple concerns about her ability to respond effectively to marginalized voices, including:

- Unqualified support for project proposals and for-profit mobility devices over the objections of sensitive communities who see them as instruments of gentrification;
- Calling out public officials who have wrestled with the implications of for-profit mobility devices on senior and disability advocates and other communities of concern;
- Signaling support for a Muni fare increase that was opposed by ten out of eleven members of the Board of Supervisors¹; and

¹https://www.ebar.com/news/latest_news//292225/online_extra:supervisors_committee_hearing_delayed_for_trans_sfmta_board_nominee?fbclid=IwAR0VF_ap0HZjcg9CPdAak-Mb7kc9oNMwnQFWxRy6HeuC_Sov4wAYMqA0IDy4

- Accepting a contribution² during her campaign for DCCC from Josephine Zhao, who has referred to a Chinese member of the Board of Supervisors as a “race-traitor” and described California’s gender neutral bathroom bill as “evil legislation.”³

As the conversation around transit increasingly includes discussion of “transit-oriented” housing development, we have serious concerns about appointing a Board member of YIMBY Action, an organization whose policy positions have been repeatedly rejected by San Francisco voters. Those positions include advocating against higher percentages of inclusionary housing in new development (in favor of a trickle-down market rate housing approach that lacks nuance or consideration for impacts to marginalized communities) and hedging on support of 2018’s Prop 10, which would have repealed the Costa Hawkins Act and allowed for local expansion of rent control. Costa Hawkins repeal remains a bellwether issue for tenant and affordable housing advocates.

Ultimately, Natoli’s appointment reeks of political quid-pro-quo for supporting the Mayor, and is not supported by substantive expertise or merit on the issues that matter. We urge you to exercise your discretion under Section 3.100 of the San Francisco Charter to reject the appointment of Jane Natoli to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and to wait for Mayoral appointees who will elevate the voices of our most marginalized, public transit-reliant residents.

Sincerely,

The Executive Board of the Harvey Milk LGBTQ Democratic Club

² <https://sfethics.org/ethics/2019/12/campaign-finance-dashboards-march-3-2020-election.html>

³ <https://missionlocal.org/2018/09/josephine-zhao-mayor-breed-scott-wiener-circle-the-wagons-for-embattled-candidate-but-for-how-long/>