File No.	210288	Committee Item No	5
		Board Item No. 8	

# **COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

	AGENDAT AGNET GOTTENTO E			
Committee:	Land Use and Transportation Committee Date	April 5, 2021		
Board of Su	pervisors Meeting Date	May 4, 2021		
<b>Cmte Board</b>				
	Motion Resolution Ordinance Legislative Digest Budget and Legislative Analyst Report Youth Commission Report Introduction Form Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Re MOU Grant Information Form Grant Budget Subcontract Budget Contract/Agreement Form 126 – Ethics Commission Award Letter Application Public Correspondence	port		
OTHER	OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)			
$\boxtimes$ $X$	Presidential Action Memo 031821			
	Referral FYI 032421			
HH				
H				
H				
HH				
	oy: <u>Erica Major</u> <b>Date</b> April	1, 2021 9, 2021		

1	[Emergency Ordinance - Enforcement of Workplace Ventilation Standards - COVID-19]				
2					
3	Emergency ordinance to require property owners of high-rise buildings with 50,000				
4	square feet or more of nonresidential floor area that use mechanical ventilation				
5	systems, to certify that such systems are operating in compliance with applicable laws;				
6	to require businesses operating within those buildings to post certification within their				
7	work spaces; and to require the Department of Public Health and the Department of				
8	Building Inspection to post information on their websites about how to file complaints				
9	about noncompliance with workplace ventilation standards, and to coordinate to				
10	ensure that all such complaints are inspected within three five business days.				
11	NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.  Additions to Codes are in single-underline italics Times New Roman font.				
12	Deletions to Codes are in <u>strikethrough italics Times New Roman font</u> .  Board amendment additions are in <u>double-underlined Arial font</u> .				
13	Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.  Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code				
14	subsections or parts of tables.				
15					
16	Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:				
17					
18	Section 1. Declaration of Emergency Pursuant to Charter Section 2.107.				
19	(a) Section 2.107 of the Charter authorizes passage of an emergency ordinance in				
20	cases of public emergency affecting life, health, or property, or for the uninterrupted operation				
21	of any City or County department or office required to comply with time limitations established				
22	by law.				
23	(b) On February 25, 2020, Mayor London Breed proclaimed a state of emergency in				
24	response to the spread of the novel coronavirus COVID-19. On March 3, 2020, the Board of				
25					

- Supervisors concurred in the February 25 Proclamation and in the actions taken by the Mayor to meet the public health emergency related to COVID-19.
  - (c) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds and declares that an actual emergency exists that requires the passage of this emergency ordinance to address the COVID-19 pandemic by reducing the likelihood of COVID-19 infection among people who return to work indoors, including workers who provide janitorial services at hours outside of traditional work hours.

Section 2. Findings and Purpose.

- (a) Since March 16, 2020, when the City and County of San Francisco implemented its first shelter-in-place order to reduce the impact of the virus that causes COVID-19, most indoor businesses have remained closed. Except for a brief period between October 27 and November 16, 2020, all non-essential offices have been required to remain closed under Health Officer Order No. C19-07 (the "Stay-Safer-at-Home Order") and its subsequent iterations. The California Department of Public Health along with the San Francisco Health Officer have also strongly encouraged telework whenever possible, even for essential business operations.
- (b) On August 28, 2020, the State of California adopted a four-tiered, color-coded framework for reopening statewide based on the prevalence of virus transmission in each county the Blueprint for a Safer Economy. Except for a brief period in September and October 2020, San Francisco has remained in either the most restrictive (purple) or the second-most restrictive (red) tiers. As vaccines for COVID-19 have arrived and become more available, community transmission of COVID-19 has decreased. As of March 16, 2021, San Francisco's current case rates indicate that the City will likely move from the substantial risk (red) tier into the moderate risk (orange) tier by March 24, 2021, and potentially to the minimal

risk (yellow) tier by mid-April 2021. As a result, the San Francisco Health Officer is expected to soon allow the reopening of non-essential offices in the City.

- (c) Section 4(i) of the Stay-Safer-at-Home Order requires that all businesses that are allowed to be open indoors comply with certain ventilation requirements, including that they: (1) implement as many of the San Francisco Department of Public Health's recommended ventilation improvements as feasible and (2) keep hand-annotated documents showing which ventilation improvements were considered and implemented. The Stay-Safer-at-Home Order also requires all businesses operating indoors that are open to members of the public to conspicuously post signage, including at all primary public entrances, indicating which ventilation strategies are used at the facility.
- (d) The Department of Building Inspection implements and enforces the ventilation standards for occupiable space in office buildings pursuant to Chapter 4 of the San Francisco Mechanical Code, Chapter 12 of the San Francisco Building Code, and Section 120.1 of the California Energy Code. The ventilation standards include: minimum ventilation rates based on the volume of different interior zones within a building; filter, intake, and exhaust requirements; a mandate that mechanical ventilation systems in office buildings operate in compliance with all standards at all times that the building is occupied, and that systems begin operation and achieve three complete air changes one hour prior to occupation.
- (e) The virus that causes COVID-19 can be transmitted in the air through aerosols and the risk of airborne transmission is generally higher indoors. The risk of transmission is likely to increase as more people return to offices. Therefore, it is essential that indoor businesses comply with existing ventilation standards and that those standards be enforced in order to best protect people working or visiting indoor offices. Also, while treatments for COVID-19 are improving and vaccines have been approved for use, treatments remain limited and COVID-19 vaccines will not likely be generally available to the majority of the public until

mid-2021. The majority of the population remains susceptible to infection. This is especially true for those workers who spend significant time indoors in enclosed spaces, who often do not fit into priority categories for vaccination. This emergency ordinance will reduce the risk of COVID-19 transmission by ensuring compliance with existing ventilation standards applicable to indoor workplaces.

## Section 3. Enforcement of Workplace Ventilation Standards.

- (a) Within five businesses days of the effective date of this emergency ordinance, the owner and/or operator of each high-rise building, as defined in Section 202 of the San Francisco Building Code, with 50,000 square feet or more of non-residential floor area that uses a mechanical ventilation system shall certify that its mechanical ventilation system complies with applicable requirements and minimum operation time windows—including pre-occupancy air exchange requirements.
- (b) Each business operating in those buildings refrenced in subsection (a) shall post information at the entry to the building space in which it operates confirming that that such certification is complete, and advising occupants of the hours that the ventilation system is set to operate.
- (c) The Department of Building Inspection ("DBI") may issue rules or provide guidance regarding certification and posting requirements.
- (d) Within five business days of the effective date of this emergency ordinance, both the Department of Public Health ("DPH") and DBI shall post information on their websites advising the public about this emergency ordinance and how to file complaints relating to workplace ventilation standards that are within each departments' jurisdiction DPH's jurisdiction under Section 4(i) of the Stay-Safer-at-Home Order, as referenced in Section 2(c) of this emergency ordinance, and DBI's jurisdiction under Chapter 4 of the San Francisco

1	Mechanical Code, Chapter 12 of the San Francisco Building Code, and Section 120.1	of the
2	California Energy Code, as referenced in Section 2(d) of this emergency ordinance.	Jpon

receipt of such a complaint, DBI and DPH shall coordinate to ensure that the complaint is

investigated within not more than threefive business days of receipt.

Section 4. Preemption.

Nothing in this emergency ordinance shall be interpreted or applied so as to create any right, power, or duty in conflict with federal or state law. The term "conflict," as used in this Section 4 means a conflict that is preemptive under federal or state law.

Section 5. City Undertaking Limited to Promotion of the General Welfare.

In undertaking the adoption and enforcement of this emergency ordinance, the City is undertaking only to promote the general welfare. The City is not assuming, nor is it imposing on its officers and employees, an obligation for breach of which it is liable in money damages to any person who claims that such breach proximately caused injury. This emergency ordinance does not create a legally enforceable right by any member of the public against the City.

Section 6. Severability.

If any section, subsection, sentence, clause, phrase, or word of this emergency ordinance, or any application thereof to any person or circumstance, is held to be invalid or unconstitutional by a decision of a court of competent jurisdiction, such decision shall not affect the validity of the remaining portions or applications of this emergency ordinance. The Board of Supervisors hereby declares that it would have passed this ordinance and every section, subsection, sentence, clause, phrase, and word not declared invalid and

1	unconstitutional without regard to whether any other portion of this emergency ordinance or				
2	application thereof would be subsequently declared invalid or unconstitutional.				
3					
4	Section 7. Effective Date; Expiration.				
5	Consistent with Charter Section 2.107, this emergency ordinance shall become				
6	effective immediately upon enactment, and shall expire on the 61st day following enactment				
7	unless reenacted as provided by Section 2.107. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the				
8	ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within				
9	ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the				
10	ordinance.				
11					
12	Section 8. Supermajority Vote Required.				
13	In accordance with Charter Section 2.107, passage of this emergency ordinance by the				
14	Board of Supervisors requires an affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Board of Supervisors.				
15					
16	APPROVED AS TO FORM:				
17	DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney				
18	By: <u>/s/ Anne Pearson</u> ANNE PEARSON				
19	Deputy City Attorney				
20	n:\legana\as2021\2100356\01523963.docx				
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					

## **REVISED LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**

(Amended in Committee, 4/5/2021)

[Emergency Ordinance - Enforcement of Workplace Ventilation Standards - COVID-19]

Emergency ordinance to require property owners of high-rise buildings with 50,000 square feet or more of nonresidential floor area that use mechanical ventilation systems, to certify that such systems are operating in compliance with applicable laws; to require businesses operating within those buildings to post certification within their work spaces; and to require the Department of Public Health and the Department of Building Inspection to post information on their websites about how to file complaints about noncompliance with workplace ventilation standards, and to coordinate to ensure that all such complaints are inspected within five business days.

## **Existing Law**

The Department of Building Inspection ("DBI") implements and enforces the ventilation standards for occupiable space in office buildings pursuant to Chapter 4 of the San Francisco Mechanical Code, Chapter 12 of the San Francisco Building Code, and Section 120.1 of the California Energy Code. The ventilation standards include: minimum ventilation rates based on the volume of different interior zones within a building; filter, intake, and exhaust requirements; a mandate that mechanical ventilation systems in office buildings operate in compliance with all standards at all times that the building is occupied, and that systems begin operation and achieve three complete air changes one hour prior to occupation.

Section 4(i) of the Stay-Safer-at-Home Order requires that all businesses that are allowed to be open indoors comply with certain ventilation requirements, including that they: (1) implement as many of the San Francisco Department of Public Health's ("DPH") recommended ventilation improvements as feasible and (2) keep hand-annotated documents showing which ventilation improvements were considered and implemented. The Stay-Safer-at-Home Order also requires all businesses operating indoors that are open to members of the public to conspicuously post signage, including at all primary public entrances, indicating which ventilation strategies are used at the facility.

## Amendments to Current Law

The proposed emergency ordinance would require:

The owner and/or operator of each high-rise building with 50,000 square feet or more
of non-residential floor area that uses a mechanical ventilation system to certify that its
mechanical ventilation system complies with applicable requirements and minimum
operation time windows—including pre-occupancy air exchange requirements;

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 1

- Each business operating in those buildings to post information at the entry to the building space in which it operates confirming that that such certification is complete, and advising occupants of the hours that the ventilation system is set to operate; and
- DPH and DBI to post information on their websites advising the public about this
  emergency ordinance and how to file complaints relating to workplace ventilation
  standards that are within each departments' jurisdiction (DPH under Section 4(i) of the
  Stay-Safer-at-Home Order, and DBI under Chapter 4 of the Mechanical Code, Chapter
  12 of the Building Code, and Section 120.1 of the California Energy Code). Upon
  receipt of such a complaint, DBI and DPH shall coordinate to ensure that the complaint
  is investigated within not more than five business days of receipt.

## **Background**

Since March 16, 2020, when the City and County of San Francisco implemented its first shelter-in-place order to reduce the impact of the virus that causes COVID-19, most indoor businesses have remained closed. Except for a brief period between October 27 and November 16, 2020, all non-essential offices have been required to remain closed under Health Officer Order No. C19-07 (the "Stay-Safer-at-Home Order") and its subsequent iterations.

On August 28, 2020, the State of California adopted a four-tiered, color-coded framework for reopening statewide based on the prevalence of virus transmission in each county – the Blueprint for a Safer Economy. Except for a brief period in September and October 2020, San Francisco has remained in either the most restrictive (purple) or the second-most restrictive (red) tiers. As vaccines for COVID-19 have arrived and become more available, community transmission of COVID-19 has decreased. As of March 16, 2021, San Francisco's current case rates indicate that the City will likely move from the substantial risk (red) tier into the moderate risk (orange) tier by March 24, 2021, and potentially to the minimal risk (yellow) tier by mid-April 2021. As a result, the San Francisco Health Officer is expected to soon allow the reopening of non-essential offices in the City.

The virus that causes COVID-19 can be transmitted in the air through aerosols and the risk of airborne transmission is generally higher indoors. The risk of transmission is likely to increase as more people return to offices. Therefore, it is essential that indoor businesses comply with existing ventilation standards and that those standards be enforced in order to best protect people working or visiting indoor offices. Also, while treatments for COVID-19 are improving and vaccines have been approved for use, treatments remain limited and COVID-19 vaccines will not likely be generally available to the majority of the public until mid-2021. The majority of the population remains susceptible to infection. This is especially true for those workers who spend significant time indoors in enclosed spaces, who often do not fit into priority categories for vaccination. This emergency ordinance will reduce the risk of COVID-19 transmission by ensuring compliance with existing ventilation standards applicable to indoor workplaces.

 $n: \legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ as 2021 \ 2100356 \ 01524062. docxn: \ legana \ legana$ 

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 2

### **BOARD of SUPERVISORS**



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Patrick O'Riordan, Director, Department of Building Inspection

FROM: Erica Major, Assistant Clerk, Land Use and Transportation Committee

DATE: March 24, 2021

SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED

The Board of Supervisors' Land Use and Transportation Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Safai on March 16, 2021:

#### File No. 210288

Emergency ordinance to require property owners of high-rise buildings with 50,000 square feet or more of nonresidential floor area that use mechanical ventilation systems, to certify that such systems are operating in compliance with applicable laws; to require businesses operating within those buildings to post certification within their work spaces; and to require the Department of Public Health and Department of Building Inspection to post information on their websites about how to file complaints about noncompliance with workplace ventilation standards, and to coordinate to ensure that all such complaints are inspected within three business days.

If you have comments or reports to be included with the file, please forward them to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102 or by email at: <a href="mailto:erica.major@sfgov.org">erica.major@sfgov.org</a>.

cc: Greg Wagner, Department of Public Health
Dr. Naveena Bobba, Department of Public Health
Sneha Patil, Department of Public Health
Arielle Fleisher, Department of Public Health

From: <u>David Harrison</u>
To: <u>David Harrison</u>
Cc: <u>John Bryant</u>

Subject: BOMA San Francisco Comments on Proposed Emergency Ordinance for Enforcement of Workplace Ventilation

Standards During COVID-19 Pandemic

**Date:** Friday, April 2, 2021 2:09:00 PM

Attachments: 04-02-2021 BOMA SF Letter on Proposed Ventilation Emergency Ordinance.pdf

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Dear Supervisors and Staff,

Please find the attached letter with BOMA San Francisco's comments on the proposed emergency ordinance for enforcement of workforce ventilation standards during the COVID-19 pandemic. Thank you for your consideration, and I hope you have a wonderful weekend.

Sincerely,

### **David Harrison**

Manager of Government and Public Affairs BOMA San Francisco (202) 262-5860 (Mobile) davidh@boma.com



April 2, 2021

The Honorable Ahsha Safai Supervisor, District 11 San Francisco Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102 The Honorable Shamann Walton President San Francisco Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Emergency Ordinance - Enforcement of Workplace Ventilation Standards During COVID-19 Pandemic

Dear Supervisor Safai and President Walton,

On behalf of BOMA (Building Owners and Managers Association) San Francisco, I would like to thank you for the opportunity to comment on your proposed emergency ordinance pertaining to the enforcement of workplace ventilation standards during the COVID-19 pandemic. BOMA commends your efforts to reassure all San Franciscans that safety requirements are being met throughout this public health emergency. We look forward to continuing our partnership with the City to craft workable policies that meet this critical public health goal.

Ensuring the safety of our buildings throughout this pandemic is of the utmost priority to our members. Since the release of BOMA International's first COVID-19 guidance document back in January 2020, BOMA San Francisco and our members have acted decisively to take the necessary measures in preventing the spread of COVID-19 within the built environment. These actions include ensuring compliance with state and local public health guidance, promoting enhanced cleaning procedures within our buildings, advising members on PPE usage and COVID-19 prevention plans, and sharing insightful best practices and comprehensive research.

As our City moves towards recovery, we will continue to work with our partners in government and the commercial real estate industry to ensure the continued safety of our buildings. We stand ready to assist in providing industry-specific expertise that addresses health concerns while mitigating unintended environmental or economic consequences that may stem from these policies. With these goals in mind, we offer the following comments and questions for consideration:

- We respectfully request further guidance from DBI and DPH on how building operators can meet the hand-annotated notes requirement currently stipulated by the City's Stay-Safer-at-Home Order.
  - a. Is this requirement met by completing the "Draft Ventilation Annotation Form" provided by DPH?
  - b. How should buildings who elect to follow allowable alternative ventilation guidance meet this requirement?
- 2. What do DBI and DPH anticipate the self-certification process to be?
  - a. Will the City provide a certification posting template through its "COVID-19 Outreach Toolkit?"

- 3. BOMA is ready to provide our industry expertise to help ensure the efficiency of the certification process.
  - a. Will there be an opportunity for property managers and building engineers to assist the City by providing feedback to DPH and DBI on the certification process?
- 4. To ensure compliance, we respectfully request a defined grace period between the release of this guidance and the start of enforcement. This will allow building operations staff to ensure that all logistical and posting requirement are met before enforcement begins.

BOMA recognizes the unique public health challenges posed by COVID-19. As long as this challenge remains, we acknowledge the need to take additional measures to ensure the safety of our buildings. However, these additional measures are accompanied by environmental burdens. Beyond the existence of a public health emergency, we caution that any new ventilation requirements pose significant challenges to San Francisco's environmental goals as well as building operations. An extension of these requirements beyond the current health emergency would pose serious barriers for buildings to meet their robust climate change and energy efficiency goals, including ENERGY STAR certifications, Global Real Estate Sustainability Benchmarks (GRESB) obligations, Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) certifications, Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Methodology (BREEAM) accreditations, and BOMA's 360 Performance Program requirements. Furthermore, an inability to meet these targets would put our buildings in direct conflict with the City's stated and forthcoming environmental goals.

We hope these questions and comments are useful as you continue to review this emergency ordinance. Thank you for your consideration, and we welcome further discussion with our members to address these concerns.

Sincerely,

John R. Bryant Chief Executive Officer BOMA San Francisco

**Cc:** The Honorable Connie Chan, District 1 Supervisor

The Honorable Catherine Stefani, District 2 Supervisor

The Honorable Aaron Peskin, District 3 Supervisor

The Honorable Gordon Mar, District 4 Supervisor

The Honorable Dean Preston, District 5 Supervisor

The Honorable Matt Haney, District 6 Supervisor

The Honorable Myrna Melgar, District 7 Supervisor

The Honorable Rafael Mandelman, District 8 Supervisor

The Honorable Hillary Ronen, District 9 Supervisor

Honorable Members and Staff, Land Use and Transportation Committee

### President, District 10 BOARD of SUPERVISORS



## City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Tel. No. 554-6516 Fax No. 554-7674 TDD/TTY No. 544-6546

## **Shamann Walton**

PRESIDENTIAL ACTION						
Date:	3/18/2021					
To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervis			d of Supervisors			
Madam Cler Pursuant to	MAN STATE OF THE S	s, I am hereby:				
X Waiving	g 30-Day Ru	ile (Board Rule No.	3.23)			
File 1	No.	210288		Safai		
Title.	Emergeno	cy Ordinance - s - COVID-19	Enforce	(Primary Sponsor) ment of Workplace	Ventilatio	on
☐ Transfer	rring (Board Ru	ıle No 3.3)				- 5
File 1	No.			Diameter Comment		
Title.				(Primary Sponsor	)·	
Fron	n:				Comr	nittoo
То:	Y <del>-</del>					nittee
☐ Assignii	ng Temporas	ry Committee	Appoin	tment (Board Rule No. 3	- ANNADAL SANDAR	incloc
Supervi	sor:		Repla	acing Supervisor:		
I	For:					Meeting
		Date)	1	(Committee)		_
Start Time: End Time:						
Ten	porary Assig	gnment: O Pa	rtial (	Full Meeting		•

Shamann Walton, President

Board of Supervisors

Print Form

# **Introduction Form**

By a Member of the Board of Supervisors or Mayor

Time stamp or meeting date I hereby submit the following item for introduction (select only one): 1. For reference to Committee. (An Ordinance, Resolution, Motion or Charter Amendment). 2. Request for next printed agenda Without Reference to Committee. 3. Request for hearing on a subject matter at Committee. 4. Request for letter beginning: "Supervisor inquiries" 5. City Attorney Request. 6. Call File No. from Committee. 7. Budget Analyst request (attached written motion). 8. Substitute Legislation File No. 9. Reactivate File No. 10. Topic submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the BOS on Please check the appropriate boxes. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following: Small Business Commission ☐ Youth Commission Ethics Commission Planning Commission Building Inspection Commission Note: For the Imperative Agenda (a resolution not on the printed agenda), use the Imperative Form. Sponsor(s): Supervisor Ahsha Safai Subject: Emergency Ordinance - Enforcement of Workplace Standards The text is listed: Emergency ordinance to require property owners of high-rise buildings with 50,000 square feet or more of nonresidential floor area that use mechanical ventilation systems, to certify that such systems are operating in compliance with applicable laws; to require businesses operating within those buildings to post certification within their work spaces; and to require the Department of Public Health and the Department of Building Inspection to post information on their websites about how to file complaints about noncompliance with workplace ventilation

standards, and to coordinate to ensure that all such complaints are inspected within five business days.

Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor:

For Clerk's Use Only