1 110 110. 2 100 10	File	No.	210513
---------------------	------	-----	--------

Committee Item	ı No.	
Board Item No.	22	

COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Date:					
Board of Supervisors Meeting Date: May 11, 2021					
Cmte Board					
Res Core Core Core Core Core Core Core Core	tion Solution Jinance Jislative Digest Jislative Digest Jislative Digest Jislative Analyst Jislative A		Report		
OTHER					
	nate Bill No. 693 - 4/5/21				
	AC / LCC Position				
H H —					
H H —					
H H —					
H H $-$					
Prepared by: Lisa Lew Date: May 7, 2021					
Prepared by: Date:					

1	[Supporting California State Senate Bill No. 693 (Stern) - The Never Again Education Act]
2	
3	Resolution supporting California State Senate Bill No. 693, The Never Again Education
4	Act, authored by Senator Henry Stern, that would establish the Governor's Council on
5	Genocide and Holocaust Education to establish best practices for, and promote
6	implementation of, education on genocide, including the Holocaust, and submit an
7	annual report to the Legislature.
8	
9	WHEREAS, The Anti-Defamation League's most recent Audit of Antisemitic Incidents
10	in the United States counted a total of 2,107 antisemitic incidents across the nation, the
11	highest level since tracking began in 1979; and
12	WHEREAS, According to the U.S. Millennial Holocaust Awareness Survey, the first 50-
13	state survey of Holocaust knowledge among Millennials and members of Generation Z, adults
14	aged between 18 and 39, nearly half (48 percent) could not name a single concentration
15	camp or ghetto established during World War II; almost a quarter (23 percent) said they
16	believed the Holocaust was a myth or had been exaggerated, or that they weren't sure; and
17	63 percent did not know that six million Jews were murdered during the Holocaust; and
18	WHEREAS, The Federal Bureau of Investigations reported that in 2019, anti-Jewish
19	incidents led among religiously-motivated hate crimes in California; and
20	WHEREAS, Existing law requires the California Department of Education to
21	incorporate age-appropriate materials related to genocide and the Holocaust into publications
22	that provide examples of curriculum resources for teacher use, consistent with the subject
23	frameworks on history and social science; and
24	WHEREAS, California State Senate Bill No. 693 would establish the Governor's
25	Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education to establish best practices for, and promote

1	implementation of, education on genocide, including the Holocaust, and submit an annual
2	report to the Legislature; and
3	WHEREAS, The Bill would strongly encourage school districts and charter schools with
4	students in grades four through 12 to integrate the best practices that meet existing academic
5	content standards and the history-social science curriculum framework for these students into
6	instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, in addition to requiring that the California
7	Department of Education conduct a study on the manner in which the instruction is offered to
8	assess its impact; and
9	WHEREAS, The Bill also recommends instruction on the Armenian genocide, the
10	Rwandan genocide, and other genocides committed across the world, and recommends the
11	study of other crimes against humanity, such as the internment of Japanese Americans and
12	Japanese immigrants during World War II; now, therefore, be it
13	RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Board of Supervisors supports Senate Bill No.
14	693, The Never Again Education Act, which would establish the Governor's Council on
15	Genocide and Holocaust Education to establish best practices for, and promote
16	implementation of, education on genocide, including the Holocaust, and submit an annual
17	report to the Legislature; and, be it
18	FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors shall transmit a
19	copy of this Resolution to the Governor, the author of the Bill, and all members of the
20	Legislature representing the City and County of San Francisco.
21	
22	
23	
24	

25

Introduced by Senator Stern

(Principal coauthor: Assembly Member Gabriel)

February 19, 2021

An act to add Section 51221.1 to the Education Code, relating to pupil instruction.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 693, as amended, Stern. Pupil instruction: genocide and Holocaust education: genocide education: the Holocaust.

Existing law requires the adopted course of study in the area of social sciences for grades 7 to 12, inclusive, to include human rights issues, with particular attention to the study of the inhumanity of genocide, slavery, and the Holocaust. Existing law requires the State Department of Education to incorporate age-appropriate materials relating to, among other things, genocide and the Holocaust into publications that provide examples of curriculum resources for teacher use, consistent with the subject frameworks on history and social science. Under existing law, the Legislature encourages the incorporation of survivor, rescuer, liberator, and witness oral testimony into the teaching of genocide and the Holocaust. Existing law establishes the Instructional Quality Commission and requires the commission to, among other things, recommend curriculum frameworks to the State Board of Education. Existing law authorizes the state board to consider the adoption of a revised curriculum framework and evaluation criteria for instructional materials in history-social science.

This bill would require, during the next revision of the history-social science curriculum framework on or after January 1, 2022, the

 $SB 693 \qquad \qquad -2-$

Instructional Quality Commission to develop, and the state board to adopt, modify, or revise, detailed and age-appropriate academic content standards on genocide and the Holocaust for pupils enrolled in grades 7 to 12, inclusive. The bill would require, beginning in the 2025–26 school year, a school district or charter school maintaining any of grades 7 to 12, inclusive, to require instruction on genocide and the Holocaust based on the academic content standards for pupils enrolled in grades 7 to 12, inclusive, as provided. The bill would require, beginning with the 2026–27 school year, these school districts and charter schools to provide training on genocide and the Holocaust to teachers whose teaching responsibilities include courses of study in which instruction concerning genocide and the Holocaust is integrated. The bill would establish the Governor's Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education to, among other things, establish best practices for, and promote implementation of genocide and Holocaust education of, education on genocide, including the Holocaust, and submit an annual report to the Legislature, as specified. By imposing new duties on school districts and charter schools, the bill would impose a state-mandated local program. The bill would strongly encourage school districts and charter schools with pupils in grades 4 to 12, inclusive, to integrate the best practices into instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, that meets existing academic content standards and the history-social science curriculum framework for these pupils. The bill would require the department to conduct a study on the manner in which the instruction is offered to assess the impact of the instruction.

The California Constitution requires the state to reimburse local agencies and school districts for certain costs mandated by the state. Statutory provisions establish procedures for making that reimbursement.

This bill would provide that, if the Commission on State Mandates determines that the bill contains costs mandated by the state, reimbursement for those costs shall be made pursuant to the statutory provisions noted above.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: yes. State-mandated local program: yes-no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 51221.1 is added to the Education Code, to read:

-3- SB 693

51221.1. (a) As used in this section, the following definitions apply:

- (1) "Council" means the Governor's Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education.
- (2) "Genocide" means any of the following acts committed with the intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial, or religious group:
 - (A) Killing members of the group.

- (B) Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group.
- (C) Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about, in whole or in part, its physical destruction
- (D) Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group.
 - (E) Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group.
- (3) "Holocaust" means the systematic, bureaucratic, state-sponsored persecution and murder of approximately 6,000,000 Jews and 5,000,000 other individuals by the Nazi regime and its collaborators.
- (b) During the next revision of the history-social science eurriculum framework on or after January 1, 2022, the Instructional Quality Commission shall develop, and the state board shall adopt, modify, or revise, detailed and age-appropriate academic content standards on genocide and the Holocaust for pupils enrolled in grades 7 to 12, inclusive.
- (c) Beginning in the 2025–26 school year, a school district or charter school maintaining any of grades 7 to 12, inclusive, shall require instruction on genocide and the Holocaust based on the academic content standards for pupils enrolled in grades 7 to 12, inclusive, adopted pursuant to subdivision (b). The instruction shall be designed to do all of the following:
- (b) The Governor's Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education is hereby established. The council shall be responsible for coordinating efforts between the department and individuals and organizations that are experts in the field of education on genocide, including the Holocaust.
- (c) The council shall consist of 17 members appointed by the Governor. Members of the council shall be individuals who have particular interest or expertise on genocide, including the

SB 693 —4—

Holocaust. Members of the council shall serve without compensation. However, if funding is available for this purpose from private sources, members of the council may be reimbursed for their actual and necessary expenses incurred in the performance of their official duties as members of the council.

- (d) (1) The council shall develop best practices to facilitate the instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, that aligns with academic content standards for pupils who are enrolled in grades 4 to 12, inclusive. The best practices shall also facilitate the offering of instruction that is appropriate for pupils who are enrolled in kindergarten and grades 1 to 3, inclusive.
- (2) The council shall develop a process to identify available resources, and work with the department to establish new resources, that align with the best practices developed by the council, academic content standards, and the history-social science curriculum framework.
- (e) The Legislature strongly encourages school districts and charter schools with pupils in grades 4 to 12, inclusive, to integrate the best practices into instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, that meets existing academic content standards and the history-social science curriculum framework for these pupils. The best practices shall encourage innovation, equity, accessibility, and flexibility, and respect diversity, leading to instruction for pupils that complies with all of the following:
 - (1) Is age appropriate.
 - (2) Is sequential or thematic in its method of study.
- (3) Communicates the connection between national, ethnic, racial, or religious intolerance and the subjects described in paragraph (2) of subdivision (a).
- (4) Communicates the impact of personal responsibility, civic engagement, and societal response in the context of the subjects described in paragraph (2) of subdivision (a).
- (5) Includes the use of personal narratives and multimedia primary source materials, including video testimony, photographs, artwork, diary entries, letters, government documents, maps, and poems as sources of knowledge and inquiry.
- (6) Uses appropriate tools and innovative learning modes to encourage inquiry, social emotional development, respect for others, critical thinking, and empathy.

5 SB 693

(7) Provides opportunities and skills to consider the relationships between historical and contemporary experiences, including opportunities to contextualize and analyze patterns of human behavior by individuals and groups, at the local, state, national, and international level.

- (8) Stimulates pupils' reflection on the roles and responsibilities of citizens in democratic societies to combat misinformation, indifference, and discrimination by developing critical thinking skills and using tools of resistance, including protest, reform, and celebration.
- (9) Provides opportunities to reflect on the importance of remembrance, including opportunities to honor the memories of genocide survivors and their cultural legacies.
 - (10) Is designed to do all of the following, where appropriate:
- (A) Prepare pupils to confront the immorality of genocide, the Holocaust, and other acts of mass violence, crimes against humanity, such as events in Nanjing, China, and Japanese internment camps during World War II, and to reflect on the causes of related historical events.

 $\frac{(2)}{(2)}$

(B) Address the breadth of the history of the Holocaust, including the Third Reich dictatorship, concentration camp system, persecution of Jews and non-Jews, Jewish and non-Jewish resistance, and post-World War II-trials. trials, and other genocides perpetrated against humanity, including, but not limited to, the Armenian Genocide, the Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda, and other genocides committed in Africa, Asia, Latin America, South America, and Europe.

30 (3)

(C) Develop pupils' respect for cultural diversity and help pupils gain insight into the importance of the protection of international human rights for all people.

34 (4

- (D) Promote pupils' understanding of how the Holocaust contributed to the need for the term "genocide" and led to international legislation that recognized genocide as a crime.
- (5) Communicate the impact of personal responsibility, civic engagement, and societal responses.

 $SB 693 \qquad \qquad -6-$

(6) Stimulate pupils' reflection on the roles and responsibilities of citizens in democratic societies to combat misinformation, indifference, and discrimination by developing critical thinking skills and using tools of resistance, including protest, reform, and celebration.

- (7) Provide pupils with opportunities to contextualize and analyze patterns of human behavior by individuals and groups who belong in one or more categories, including perpetrator, collaborator, bystander, victim, and rescuer.
- (8) Enable pupils to understand the ramifications of prejudice, racism, and stereotyping.
- (9) Preserve the memories of genocide survivors and provide opportunities for pupils to discuss and honor genocide survivors' cultural legacies.
- (10) Provide pupils with a foundation for examining the history of discrimination in the state.
- (11) Include the use of personal narratives and multimedia primary source materials, including video testimony, photographs, artwork, diary entries, letters, government documents, maps, and poems as sources of knowledge and inquiry.
- (12) Explore the various mechanisms of transitional and restorative justice that help humanity move forward in the aftermath of genocide.
- (d) (1) The department shall provide technical assistance to school districts and charter schools for the purpose of providing the instruction described in subdivision (e). A school district and charter school may use any appropriate public or private materials, personnel, and other resources to develop and provide the instruction. A school district and charter school shall provide authentic genocide and Holocaust education training to teachers pursuant to subdivision (g), with an emphasis on easily accessible ongoing professional development focusing on primary sources to contextualize the history of genocide and the Holocaust.
- (f) (1) The council shall work in consultation with the department and organizations and individuals that provide educational expertise and resources related to education on genocide, including the Holocaust, to align the best practices with academic content standards and frameworks. The best practices shall, among other things, suggest the minimum amount of

7 SB 693

instruction necessary to adequately educate pupils on genocide, including the Holocaust.

- (2) The department shall distribute information on appropriate curriculum materials and guidelines to school districts and charter schools. A school district and charter school may use any curriculum that complies with the requirements of this section.
- (e) A school district and charter school may accept gifts, grants, and donations, including in-kind donations, designated for the development and provision of the instruction required by this section.
- (f) The Governor's Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education is hereby established. The council shall consist of _____ members appointed by the Governor. Members of the council shall be individuals who have particular interest or expertise on genocide and the Holocaust. Members of the council shall serve without compensation. However, if funding is available for this purpose from private sources, members of the council may be reimbursed for their actual and necessary expenses incurred in the performance of their official duties as members of the council. The
- (g) (1) The council shall work with the department to provide resources to school districts and charter schools so they may incorporate the best practices on teaching genocide, including the Holocaust, into their accredited in-service training programs.
- (2) The department shall make available the best practices and approved lessons, resources, and materials to support the integration of instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust.
 - (h) The council shall do all of the following:
- (1) Identify, to the extent possible, all sources of strategies and content for providing and enhancing—genocide and Holocaust education on genocide, including the Holocaust, to pupils.
- (2) Convene working groups comprised of individuals and organizations with significant expertise in the field of education on genocide, including the Holocaust, to advise the council. The working groups shall include certificated public school teachers.

 (2)
- (3) Advise the Superintendent and each school district and charter school required to provide instruction pursuant to this section school districts and charter schools on strategies and

SB 693 -8-

1 content for providing and enhancing genocide and Holocaust 2 education for teacher training and to pupils.

(3)

- (4) Identify, to the extent possible, all programs and resources to train teachers to provide genocide and Holocaust education *on genocide, including the Holocaust,* to pupils and share these programs and resources with the Superintendent, school districts, and charter schools.
- (5) Coordinate with the department on the identification of resources for purposes of this section.
- (6) Explore the opportunity to develop best practices for instruction of pupils in kindergarten and grades 1 to 3, inclusive.
- (7) Promote, within school districts, charter schools, and the general population of the state, implementation of genocide and Holocaust education. education on genocide, including the Holocaust.
- (8) Work with the department to establish a small grants program to foster cooperation and innovation among teachers and schools to develop strategies to apply the best practices effectively. Individuals or schools receiving a grant shall be required to participate in an impact evaluation study, developed by the department, to assess best practices and implementation of the grant.

(5)

- (9) On or before January 1, 2028, and each January 1 thereafter, submit an annual report to the Legislature on the status of genocide and Holocaust education on genocide, including the Holocaust, in the state. A report to be submitted pursuant to this paragraph shall be submitted in compliance with Section 9795 of the Government Code.
- (g) (1) The department shall make available to school districts and charter schools required to provide instruction pursuant to this section in-service teacher training programs tailored to provide the instruction.
- (2) Beginning with the 2026–27 school year, a school district and charter school shall provide training on genocide and the Holocaust to teachers whose teaching responsibilities include courses of study in which instruction concerning genocide and the Holocaust is integrated. School districts and charter schools may

-9- SB 693

use programs made available by the department or use other alternative programs that are consistent with this subdivision.

(i) The council shall develop professional development recommendations for teaching the topic of genocide, including the Holocaust. The department shall provide a professional development program for teaching the topic of genocide, including the Holocaust, to school districts and charter schools. The Legislature strongly encourages school districts and charter schools to provide genocide professional development programs to teachers pursuant to this section.

(h)

(j) To the extent permitted by the California Constitution, the department may provide guidelines, in-service training, and any other materials developed in accordance with this section to a private school maintaining any of grades—7 4 to 12, inclusive, in the state, upon receiving a request from the private school.

(i)

- (k) The department shall conduct a study on the manner in which genocide and Holocaust instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, is offered pursuant to this section. section to assess the impact of the instruction. Participation of a school district or charter school in the study shall be voluntary. In conducting the study, a school district and charter school—required to provide participating in the study that is providing instruction pursuant to this section shall provide the department with information on whether the school district and charter school offers the instruction and the manner in which the instruction is offered. On or before January 1, 2027, and each January 1 thereafter, the department shall submit a report to the Governor and appropriate policy and fiscal committees of the Legislature that includes all of the following information for the previous school year:
- (1) The number of school districts and charter schools that offered genocide and Holocaust instruction. instruction on genocide, including, the Holocaust.
- (2) The number of school districts and charter schools that used the curriculum materials and guidelines distributed by the department pursuant to paragraph (2) of subdivision-(d). (f).
- (3) The number of school districts and charter schools that provided—in-service professional development teacher training programs pursuant to subdivision—(g). (i).

SB 693 — 10 —

(4) A description of the manner in which school districts and charter schools provided genocide and Holocaust instruction, instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, including the number of hours of instruction offered, the grade levels in which the instruction was provided, and the courses in which the instruction was provided.

- (5) Recommendations for improvements to the offering of genocide and Holocaust instruction, instruction on genocide, including the Holocaust, including recommendations for legislation.
- SEC. 2. If the Commission on State Mandates determines that this act contains costs mandated by the state, reimbursement to local agencies and school districts for those costs shall be made pursuant to Part 7 (commencing with Section 17500) of Division 4 of Title 2 of the Government Code.

Lew, Lisa (BOS)

From: BOS Legislation, (BOS)

To: Donovan, Dominica (BOS); BOS Legislation, (BOS)

Cc: Mullan, Andrew (BOS); Bennett, Samuel (BOS); Falzon, Frankie (BOS); Stefani, Catherine (BOS); KAPLA,

ROBB (CAT)

Subject: RE: D2 Introductions - May 4 - SB 693

From: Donovan, Dominica (BOS) <dominica.donovan@sfgov.org>

Sent: Tuesday, May 4, 2021 2:19 PM

To: BOS Legislation, (BOS)

 dos.legislation@sfgov.org>

Cc: Mullan, Andrew (BOS) <andrew.mullan@sfgov.org>; Bennett, Samuel (BOS) <samuel.bennett@sfgov.org>; Falzon, Frankie (BOS) <frankie.falzon@sfgov.org>; Stefani, Catherine (BOS) <catherine.stefani@sfgov.org>; KAPLA, ROBB (CAT)

<Robb.Kapla@sfcityatty.org>

Subject: RE: D2 Introductions - May 4 - SB 693

It does not appear as if the League of Cities California has taken a position on this matter, nor has the Cal State Assn. of Counties. Attached is the copy of the bill.

-Dominica

Introduction Form

By a Member of the Board of Supervisors or Mayor

Time stamp or meeting date I hereby submit the following item for introduction (select only one): 1. For reference to Committee. (An Ordinance, Resolution, Motion or Charter Amendment). ✓ 2. Request for next printed agenda Without Reference to Committee. 3. Request for hearing on a subject matter at Committee. 4. Request for letter beginning: "Supervisor inquiries" 5. City Attorney Request. 6. Call File No. from Committee. 7. Budget Analyst request (attached written motion). 8. Substitute Legislation File No. 9. Reactivate File No. 10. Topic submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the BOS on Please check the appropriate boxes. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following: Small Business Commission ☐ Youth Commission Ethics Commission **Building Inspection Commission** Planning Commission Note: For the Imperative Agenda (a resolution not on the printed agenda), use the Imperative Form. Sponsor(s): Stefani Subject: Supporting California State Senate Bill No. 693 (Stern) – The Never Again Education Act The text is listed: Resolution supporting California State Senate Bill No. 693, authored by State Senator Henry Stern, The Never Again Education Act, which would establish the Governor's Council on Genocide and Holocaust Education to, among other things, establish best practices for, and promote implementation of, education on genocide, including the Holocaust, and submit an annual report to the Legislature Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor: |/s/ Catherine Stefani

For Clerk's Use Only