



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Carmen Chu, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management– FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director

ADM - General Services Agency – City Administrator

278641 ADM Convention Facilities Mgmt

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING

VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL Year 22-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager I	0922	10.0	\$4,719	\$5,665	\$1,236,278	\$1,484,127
Manager II	0923	3.0	\$5,066	\$6,081	\$398,153	\$477,975
Manager III	0931	1.0	\$5,462	\$6,557	\$143,093	\$171,781
Manager IV	0932	8.0	\$5,863	\$7,038	\$1,228,834	\$1,475,191
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$6,324	\$7,592	\$165,694	\$198,913
Deputy Director III	0953	2.0	\$6,788	\$8,149	\$355,703	\$427,015
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$8,227	\$9,876	\$215,542	\$258,754
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	\$3,337	\$4,006	\$48,084	\$57,724
IS Manager	1071	0.6	\$6,788	\$8,149	\$97,818	\$117,429
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	\$3,881	\$4,659	\$101,681	\$122,066
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	\$3,027	\$3,634	\$79,306	\$95,205
Personnel Analyst	1241	0.0	\$3,425	\$4,112	\$ -	\$ -
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	\$4,291	\$5,151	\$112,417	\$134,954
Senior Clerk	1406	1.0	\$2,713	\$3,257	\$71,073	\$85,322
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$2,954	\$3,546	\$77,389	\$92,903
Secretary I	1444	0.0	\$2,193	\$2,633	\$ -	\$ -
Secretary II	1446	1.0	\$2,713	\$3,257	\$71,073	\$85,322
Executive Secretary 3	1454	0.0	\$3,304	\$3,966	\$ -	\$ -
Accountant III	1654	2.0	\$3,913	\$4,697	\$205,031	\$246,136
Storekeeper	1934	0.0	\$2,209	\$2,652	\$ -	\$ -
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	\$2,516	\$3,020	\$65,908	\$79,121
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	\$4,168	\$5,004	\$218,429	\$262,220
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$5,450	\$6,542	\$142,778	\$171,402
Custodian	2708	109.0	\$2,253	\$2,705	\$6,434,081	\$7,723,987
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$2,733	\$3,281	\$71,614	\$85,972
Fire Safety Inspector 2	6281	0.5	\$5,215	\$6,260	\$68,313	\$82,008
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	\$4,374	\$5,251	\$687,583	\$825,429
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$4,460	\$5,354	\$116,857	\$140,285
Painting Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$3,805	\$4,568	\$99,696	\$119,683
Apprentice Sationary Engineer	7333	2.0	\$3,341	\$4,010	\$175,046	\$210,139
Stationary Engineer	7334	10.5	\$3,516	\$4,221	\$967,170	\$1,161,068
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	\$3,984	\$4,783	\$313,179	\$375,965
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$3,452	\$4,144	\$90,448	\$108,581

Plumber	7345	1.0	\$3,881	\$4,659	\$101,681	\$122,066
Painter	7346	1.5	\$3,177	\$3,814	\$124,846	\$149,875
Electrician	7347	1.0	\$4,019	\$4,824	\$105,290	\$126,399
Security Guard	8202	23.0	\$2,516	\$3,020	\$1,515,878	\$1,819,782
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	\$3,275	\$3,931	\$514,811	\$618,021
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	\$2,783	\$3,341	\$218,768	\$262,626
Parking Control Officer	8214	15.1	\$2,510	\$3,013	\$990,193	\$1,188,707
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	\$2,999	\$3,600	\$157,123	\$188,623
Public SafetyComm Supv	8239	1.0	\$4,194	\$5,035	\$109,891	\$131,922
Pub Safety Communication Coord	8240	0.0	\$4,122	\$4,948	\$ -	\$ -
Public Relations Mgr	9251	0.0	\$4,763	\$5,718	\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			259,224	311,193
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			213,978	256,876
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			267,472	321,095
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			282,790	339,484
Total FTE		227.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					17,896,754	21,484,699
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$1,023,464	\$1,228,648

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922 63,123
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 65,440
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 68,085
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932 70,764
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0933 73,846
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953 76,945
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0955 86,553
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062 46,114
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1071 76,945
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1218 50,501
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222 42,897
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1241 47,959
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244 53,140
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406 40,099
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408 42,245
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1444 36,280
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1446 40,099
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1454 46,777
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1654 51,235
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1934 36,433
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936 38,344
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1956 52,876
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1958 62,462
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708 36,006
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718 40,283

Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	6281	60,868		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7203	56,425		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205	57,180		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7242	51,386		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7333	47,888		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334	49,448		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7335	53,621		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7344	48,819		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7345	53,955		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7346	45,790		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7347	56,042		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8210	45,104		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	40,728		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8214	38,290		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8216	42,644		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8239	52,654		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8240	55,052		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9251	65,653		
Total Fringe Benefits			Low	High
			\$8,781,026	\$9,856,828

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Contractual Services	\$4,232,046	\$4,232,046
Workers' Compensation	\$1,299,680	\$1,299,680
Total Capital & Operating	\$5,531,726	\$5,531,726

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$33,232,970.03	\$38,101,900.95
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$30,328,564.67	\$30,376,910.86
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$2,904,405	\$7,724,990
% of Savings to City Cost	9%	20%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>