



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

027 AIRPORT COMMISSION
109699 AIR Operations & Security

Airport Shuttle Bus Service

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Transit Operators	9163	56.0	\$ 2,671	\$ 3,207	\$ 3,904,301	\$ 4,687,036	
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,649	4,380	\$ 476,150.81	\$ 571,609.61	
Transit Manager II	9141	1.0	4,865	5,841	\$ 126,988.59	\$ 152,447.28	
Transit Manager I	9140	2.0	4,309	5,173	\$ 224,925.43	\$ 270,018.53	
Automotive Mechanic	7381	4.1	3,267	3,922	\$ 349,568.22	\$ 419,649.73	
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,512	3,016	\$ 131,138.83	\$ 157,429.57	
Transit Spotters	7454	4.0	1,875	2,251	\$ 195,783.47	\$ 235,034.18	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			171,627	206,035	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			153,098	183,791	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE			74.1				
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 5,408,857	\$ 6,493,225
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 324,725	\$ 389,826

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	40,786	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	49,993	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	59,616	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	55,198	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	46,954	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	38,229	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	34,564	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 2,777,258	\$ 3,111,209

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities	\$ 430,680	\$ 430,680
Bus Maintenance (same as contractor)	1,065,009	1,065,009
Liability Insurance (same as contractor)	414,821	414,821
Worker's Compensation (same as contractor)	205,533	205,533
Property Insurance (same as contractor)	7,002	7,002
Unanticipated Operational Expenses (same as contractor)	168,882	168,882
Emergency Contingency	322,038	644,076
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,613,965	\$ 2,936,003

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 11,124,804	\$ 12,930,263
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,579,128	\$ 9,582,506
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,545,676	\$ 3,347,757
% of Savings to City Cost	14%	26%