From: Somera, Alisa (BOS)
To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: FW: What to do about the CART program?

Date: Wednesday, June 23, 2021 10:40:05 AM

210459

Alisa Somera

Legislative Deputy Director
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
415.554.7711 direct | 415.554.5163 fax
alisa.somera@sfgov.org

(VIRTUAL APPOINTMENTS) To schedule a "virtual" meeting with me (on Microsoft Teams), please ask and I can answer your questions in real time.

Due to the current COVID-19 health emergency and the Shelter in Place Order, the Office of the Clerk of the Board is working remotely while providing complete access to the legislative process and our services.

Click **HERE** to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The <u>Legislative Research Center</u> provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

 $\sim \sim \sim \sim \sim \sim$

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

From: Board of Supervisors, (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>

Sent: Tuesday, June 22, 2021 11:35 AM

To: BOS-Supervisors

 dos-supervisors@sfgov.org>

Cc: Calvillo, Angela (BOS) <angela.calvillo@sfgov.org>; Somera, Alisa (BOS)

<alisa.somera@sfgov.org>; Ng, Wilson (BOS) <wilson.l.ng@sfgov.org>; Laxamana, Junko (BOS)

<junko.laxamana@sfgov.org>; Mchugh, Eileen (BOS) <eileen.e.mchugh@sfgov.org>

Subject: FW: What to do about the CART program?

From: Fred Winograd < fwinograd@yahoo.com >

Sent: Tuesday, June 22, 2021 10:54 AM

To: Board of Supervisors, (BOS) < board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org >

Subject: What to do about the CART program?

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I live in District 8 but please forward this to all of the members of the BOS.

I have read the CART program document and have the following comments.

- 1. This proposal neglects the fact that camping on our streets or violations of the Sit/Lie are illegal activities.
- 2. It ignores the rights of the housed people or businesses to have safe and clean public areas around their homes or businesses.
- 3. It is in opposition to the SFPD performing any services involving homelessness people regardless of the details of any particular event.
- 4. It is hard to be compassionate with those who consistently refuse services and continue to use drugs and pollute our sidewalks.

I do support moving certain call types of calls from police to more reasonable service providers, but CART does not fit that description.

Let's not fall into the trap that is promoted by the Homeless Coalition that police are bad and dedicated homeless people who refuse help are all saints and can do no wrong.

Please do not approve CART as it presently stands.

From: <u>Stella K</u>

To: <u>Carroll, John (BOS)</u>

Subject: Public Comment Re: CART Resolution at Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee, June 10th

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 12:43:54 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Hello to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee!

My name is Stella Kunkat and I live in SoMA and work with Home Rise in the Tenderloin.

I am writing to provide public comment re: item #1 [Supporting the Establishment of a Compassionate Alternative Response Team].

I urge the Committee today to support CART now, in order for CART to get funding and to get implemented as soon as possible!

I have myself conducted many of the interviews with unhoused folks which informed the CART proposal. So many of these people shared their traumatic experiences with police and also expressed the need for feeling safe and how a non-police, community-based response program would finally be a program that they could turn to in situations of crisis - one that would make them feel safe and dignified.

With CART there would finally be a response team out there that meets unhoused people with care and support instead of criminalization.

CART would work very well in collaboration and combination with the current SCRT as CART would take on overflow calls. SCRT in and off it self is very necessary and is doing important work, but it is not enough to meet the needs of unhoused folks on the street - as not all of the situations of crisis involve an unhoused

CART can be funded by reworking the proposed funding for the newly proposed Street Wellness Response Team or by reducing police and sheriff funding. While

Since the proposed Street Wellness Team is not community-based but an institutional response and since it will not be run by peers with lived experience the risk of criminalization, harassment and abuse remains.

With this I urge the Board to fund and implement CART. We cannot continue like this. We cannot disregard the lives and wellbeing of our unhoused neighbors on our streets any longer.

Thank you for your time!

Sincerely, Stella Kunkat Stella Kunkat PP&CO at Home Rise she/her/hers stellak@cohsf.org 718-964-3839 From: Shiba Bandeeba
To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: IN FULL SUPPORT OF CART RESOLUTION Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 12:11:17 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello,

My name is Shiba Bandeeba. I'm a San Francisco resident in District 11, a Public Policy Manager at HomeRise (formerly Community Housing Partnership). and a coalition member of CART.

I want to speak from the perspective of a Black woman, an immigrant and long-term local San Franciscan, who has had family and friends of color, who have been directly and disproportionately impacted by Police/ Sheriff officers in response to non-criminal activity within our neighborhoods.

We (Black and Brown) community members advocate for the full funding, support, and resolution passage of the CART. CART is a compassionate alternative response team to homelessness (predominately and historically Black and Brown members). We understand the that the reallocation of the SFPD budget is very much needed to support and supplementary funding for CART.

In January 2020, the SFPD unanimously passed a resolution to move away from a police response to homelessness with support from Chief Scott and asked for a stakeholder's group to design that alternative. One year later, that alternative has been developed and it is called CART.

The following points give a bold, broad, and more detailed understanding for why CART should be supported by local legislatures such as the Board of Supervisors and Mayor's office:

- 1. CART would allow the city to reduce the carceral footprint by redirecting police resources away from homelessness and decreasing the practice of criminalizing homelessness. This item can be funded by reworking proposed funding for the proposed new Street Wellness Team or by reducing police and sheriff funding.
- 2. CART is a **practical realistic solution** to moving away from police response. This would center unhoused community members by connecting them to needed resources while providing a direct line for housed and unhoused San Franciscans to call for help.
- 3. CART would provide a future of care not criminalization for unhoused residents of San Francisco.

- **4.** Funding CART is in alignment with the Mayor's effort to move away from a police response to social concerns and non criminal activity.
- **5.** We should halt the practice of relying on police to respond to things that they should not respond to and are not trained to respond to. Currently SFPD responds to over 65,000 calls directly related to housing status and homelessness each year. The result is usually that the person has already moved on, or after police are there, move less than a block away.
- **6.** A police response exacerbates homelessness by wasting resources, displacing unhoused community members away from their support system and issuing citations which destroy individuals' credit when those tickets go unpaid.
- 7. This would create well paid jobs and extensive training for black and brown community members, the result of whose work would be efficient, effective, and humane.
- **8.** This proposal reduces the risk of tragic and violent outcomes for both unhoused community members and police officers.
- **9.** This proposal will improve outcomes for folks on the streets because a CART response would focus on moving people off the streets permanently and addressing the immediate needs of all those involved.

**If you would like more information, feel free to reach out and set up a meeting with me or our coalition.

In solidarity, we have power!

Shiba Bandeeba, M.A, M.Ed (she/her) | Public Policy Manager

HomeRise (Formerly Community Housing Partnership)

P: 818.987.9121

E: sbandeeba@chp-sf.org www.HomeRise.org

20 Jones Street, Suite 200 San Francisco, CA 94102 From: Pamela Tau

To: Carroll, John (BOS); GordonMar@sfgov.org; ChanStaff (BOS); Haney, Matt (BOS); Stefani, Catherine (BOS)

Subject: CART

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 11:29:53 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

My name is Pamela Tau Lee, I live in District 1 and I am a retired 73 year old Asian senior with a 20 year career in public health. I am reaching out to ask for your support and fully fund CART, (Compassionate Alternative Response Team).

Last May I was assaulted in our local coffee shop. It was an anti-Asian hate incident and was written up in our local Richmond District newspaper. I felt something needed to be done to hold him accountable for his actions, but I was not going to call the police.

For close to a year I rarely ventured out, relying on friends and neighbors to buy groceries. Finally, I reached out to my local neighborhood group, Richmond District Rising, and shared my story; by the end of the day, I received back 21 replies from neighbors offering to be a walking buddy! I am now able to walk, feel safe. I am now working with the Richmond Senior Center, as these volunteers also wish to avail themselves to other seniors in the district. What does this have to do with CART?

I see CART as a venue that meets a basic human need; being treated with compassion and being viewed as a full human being. This trumps knee-jerk judgmental reactions that come from a place of suspicion, disdain and fear of others and can complement the work of City staff. This is not an either/or but for me a "both," details can be worked out.

As a retired public health person, I know that it is hard to wrap one's health around the savings from "prevention" and a "precautionary" approach to issues such as violence prevention, but I urge you to fully fund this program as the \$6.83 million allocated to this can "pay for itself." I believe, when there is the political will, there can be a way.

Please fully fund CART. Yours truly, Pamela Tau Lee 16th Ave <ptlee14@gmail.com> From: Rafi Bortnick

To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: Public Comment - Public Safety & Neighborhood Services Item 2: Support CART

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 11:28:29 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hi John,

I wanted to share my public comment supporting CART:

Good Afternoon. My name is Rafi. I live in Lower Haight.

I wanted to speak in support of CART and specifically reallocating 4.8 million dollars in the SFPD budget to fund the program. I believe there are a lot of good reasons to support CART but I want to focus my comments on resource management.

In this discussion, I heard concern about government efficieny so I wanted to speak about the status quo. Yesterday outside my apartment 5 police cars and 2 fire trucks showed up to respond to 1 person who was quietly sitting on the sidewalk. I don't know all the details of the situation, but I can't imagine this response was a good use of public resources, nor was it the best way to help this individual. This type of response seems to be a regular occurrence in our city.

CART is a practical solution to moving away from police responses, centering care on unhoused community members. A police response exacerbates homelessness by wasting resources, displacing unhoused community members away from their support system and issuing citations which destroy individuals' credit when those tickets go unpaid.

I believe this proposal will improve outcomes for folks on the streets and hope you all will support it.

Thank you for your time.

Thanks!

- Rafi

From: Anna Andresian
To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: Public Comment re: Compassionate Alternative Response Team

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 11:18:18 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

My name is Anna, and I'm a resident of Hayes Valley. San Francisco in a state of emergency, and the emergency is that homelessness exist in the first place; that there are such disparities in people's access to resources, care, and safety. One aspect of this emergency is that unhoused people are regarded as the dangerous "other," and armed police responses are part of that dynamic. CART would be an important step toward shaping a new dynamic. It would be a step that focuses on prioritizing the humanity and the safety and the needs of people caught up in the crises of this emergency ... this emergency of wealth inequality, care inequality, safety inequality, homelessness. Please fund the CART program. Please invest in new tools for responding to the emergency of homelessness. As with pretty much every endeavor, there will be a lot to figure out along the way, but we have to get this thing started.

From: John Stiefel

To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: Public Comment to support CART & 24-Hour Public Bathroom Access

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 11:13:45 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Dear John Carroll and San Francisco's Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee,

Good morning! My name is John Stiefel. I am a SF resident in the Mission District, as well as a Water, Sanitation, & Hygiene (WASH) Consultant, a member of the San Francisco Outer Circle (a community-based response to our unhoused neighbors), and a member of the Human Rights Work Group at the Coalition on Homelessness.

I am writing today to ask San Francisco's Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee to SUPPORT funding of the Compassionate Alternative Response Team (CART) and 24-hr Public Bathroom Access.

Compassionate Alternative Response Team (CART)

I am asking for you to support prioritizing the funding of the Compassionate Alternative Response Team. There needs to be a reallocation in the SFPD budget, and 4.8 million dollars of the reduction should go to funding CART - in addition to the 2 million dollars that are already on reserve for an alternative response to policing.

In January, 2020, the SFPD unanimously passed a resolution to move away from a police response to homelessness with support from Chief Scott and asked for a stakeholders group to design that alternative. One year later, that alternative has been developed and it is called CART. We should halt the practice of relying on police to respond to things that they should not respond to, and are not trained to respond to. Currently SFPD responds to over 65,000 calls directly related to housing status and homelessness each year. The result is usually that the person has already moved on, or after police are there, move less than a block away.

I have spoken with a number of police officers as they have responded to my unhoused neighbors. They have told me that this shouldn't be their job. They have told me that they are on the scene because a housed neighbor wouldn't directly speak to their unhoused neighbor, so they outsource it to the city, which can't do anything effective about the situation. The CART program is specifically designed to address this. CART will mediate conversations and conflict between housed and unhoused neighbors. CART will build Community Resilience to mitigate these conflicts, so that eventually many of the current calls will not have to be sent to the city in the first place.

24-hr Public Bathroom Access

The thousands of San Franciscans who are forced to sleep on the streets every day are subject to many human rights abuses, which include a severe lack of access to water, sanitation, and hygiene facilities. Specifically, this city has an extreme deficit in accessible bathrooms, an internationally-recognized human right that allows people the ability to maintain personal

hygiene and dignity. Both the United Nations Human Rights Council and California State law acknowledge that access to safe drinking water and sanitation are a human right. This includes adequate access to bathrooms.

A community free of "open defecation" is one of the lowest-level indicators used by the international community to measure its progress toward the goal of universal access to sanitation facilities. The city of San Francisco has not only failed to invest in it's sanitation system sufficiently to hit this basic target, it has repeatedly blamed unhoused people for its own failure to provide access to sanitation facilities. The city's failure to provide adequate sanitation has put unhoused community members at greater risk of many health hazards. Failure to apply the International Minimum Standards within the US has led to the further marginalization of historically marginalized communities.

I'm asking for this committee to approve the extension and expansion of the 24-hour Pit Stop Program. This is a basic human right that cannot continue to be neglected. This program is just a start, and we need to push for even bigger changes until all San Franciscans have adequate access to Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene facilities.

Thank you!

Warm regards,

John

John Stiefel

Email: stiefel.john@gmail.com
Mobile: +1-206-550-9495

San Francisco Outer Circle Web: www.sfoutercircle.org

Water, Sanitation, & Hygiene (WASH) Consultant

LinkedIn: John M. Stiefel

From: <u>Eric Rodenbeck</u>
To: <u>Carroll, John (BOS)</u>

Subject: Comment on 24-Hour Public Bathroom Access

Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 10:12:14 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I'm writing to support the expansion of San Francisco's Pit Stop Program in the strongest possible way. They are the best thing that San Francisco has done in the public realm in years. 24 hour stewards of our public realm are the answer to so many of our overlapping crises. They are a net saver of money in the City, not an expense. The Tenderloin (where I live with my family) wants more of them!

__

Eric Rodenbeck
CEO & Creative Director, Stamen Design
415.558.1610
http://stamen.com/
http://hi.stamen.com/

We won the National Design Award!

"One can easily imagine Sisyphus happy" - Kim Stanley Robinson

From: Christine Wei

To: Mar, Gordon (BOS); Stefani, Catherine (BOS); Haney, Matt (BOS)

Cc: <u>Carroll, John (BOS)</u>

Subject: Public comment on items #1, #2, and #4 for 6/10 Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee meeting

Date: Wednesday, June 9, 2021 10:14:57 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Dear Supervisors Mar, Stefani, and Haney,

I'm a resident of District 3 and a member of the No New SF Jail Coalition as well as Showing Up for Racial Justice SF (SURJ SF). I'm writing to express my support for the Compassionate Alternative Response Team and the expansion of 24-hour public bathroom access; and to urge an investment in long-term, community-centered solutions to fight violence targeting Asian Americans.

Support for Item #1 -- re: Compassionate Alternative Response Team

Removing police response from addressing homelessness is a matter of public safety and racial justice that everyone supports, from the community to the mayor to SFPD itself. CART is a practical and effective program that would connect people to services, focus on moving them off the streets permanently, and create infrastructure for addressing calls from both housed and unhoused San Franciscans in order to meet everyone's needs -- not just shuffle people around or exacerbate problems by criminalizing poverty.

It's important that we fully fund the program and set it up for success, and I support the community's ask to reallocate \$4.8 million from the SFPD budget for CART (in addition to giving it the \$2 million that are already on reserve for an alternative response to policing).

Priorities for item #2 -- re: 24-Hour Public Bathroom Access

I was glad to see the addition of extra Pit Stop facilities last year in response to COVID, and I support the expansion of permanent 24-hour public bathroom access throughout the city. The past year has shown us how important resources for good hygiene are to public health, and bathroom access helps keep city streets cleaner too. Rather than pour tons of money into sanitation, why not provide facilities that prevent the need for clean-up in the first place?

While 24-hour bathroom access will clearly improve the health and safety of unhoused San Franciscans, it also has a big impact on housed San Franciscans -- whether gig workers making deliveries all day or families enjoying a weekend out and about. As the city continues to open up, these facilities will make this place more accessible to visitors and tourists, too.

Priorities for item #4 -- Re: Violence Targeting Asian American Seniors

As an Asian American who lives right next to Chinatown, I share the concerns and fears of my API brothers, sisters, and elders. Like others, I want all of us to be able to live our lives, go to work and school, run errands, and enjoy being in the city free from racism. In addressing the increasing attacks on Asian Americans, particularly Asian American seniors, I strongly support the city providing financial assistance and mental health services for survivors and families.

Just as importantly, we must prioritize long-term and community-centered solutions that address inequities and prevention, because policing does not prevent violence and incarceration is not an effective tool for change -- both often exacerbate tensions and disparities. What we need instead are resources for anti-racism education and other efforts that fight stereotypes, scapegoating, and othering *before* things escalate to physical violence. This and transformative justice models are what will actually change perspectives and actions for a truly safe community.

Thank you, Christine Wei

--

Christine Wei

Pronouns: she/her (*Why this matters*)

From: <u>Jennifer Waggoner</u>
To: <u>Carroll, John (BOS)</u>

Subject: Public Comment: June 10 Public Safety & Neighborhood Svc Committee

Date: Wednesday, June 9, 2021 4:10:44 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Dear Mr. Carroll,

I'd like to submit public comment for tomorrow's meeting.

I live and work in San Francisco, based in the D8 Castro Neighborhood. My comment is in support of Agenda Item 1 (210459) Supporting the Establishment of a Compassionate Alternative Response Team (CART).

By 2016, the San Francisco Police Department faced significant criticism over a series of high-profile deaths and injuries caused by police, misconduct scandals, & negative assessments by a Civil Grand Jury investigation and a Blue Ribbon Panel (among others). Then-Supervisors London Breed and Malia Cohen, with Mayor Ed Lee, and SFPD asked the U.S. Department of Justice for a voluntary, top-to-bottom review of the San Francisco Police Department's practices.

In October 2016, the U.S. DOJ's COPS office (for "Community Oriented Policing Services") released the most comprehensive independent assessment of the San Francisco Police Department in city history. The <u>432-page report</u> identified five areas of improvement in line with the principles of President Obama's Task Force on 21st Century policing. In total, the U.S. DOJ made 94 findings and 272 recommendations for improvement.

In 2017 then-U.S. Attorney General Jeff Sessions ended the U.S. DOJ's participation in collaborative reform partnerships nation wide. The San Francisco Police Department was the only major city police department to continue reforms as a voluntary state-level collaboration. **Since 2018**, SFPD has worked in partnership with the California Department of Justice and consultant Hillard Heintze, to implement the 272 recommendations.

An essential piece of the CRIs was to establish **Working Groups** with a wide range of stakeholders in the 5 areas of reform. The League of Women Voters participated in several of these working groups. Early on, the fundamental idea of CART was raised in those Working Groups. We need the community, not police alone, defining what safety is. Government works for us. For all of us. The police need to be transparent & accountable. Public Safety needs to be a collaborative effort. This is the most basic idea behind reform.

In January 2019, the San Francisco Police Commission passed a **resolution that** called for an end to police response to homelessness. It called for the Board of

Supervisors to create a stakeholders' group to develop an alternative. Because 37% of San Francisco's homeless population are black (compared to just 5% of the city's total population), removing police from the city's response to homelessness is also a **racial justice issue.**

CART was born from the city's community policing commitment.

Meetings started Feb 2020 under the leadership of Police Commissioner John Hamasaki to design an inclusive community process. Delayed for a few months when the pandemic hit, the formal process started in July 2020. A detailed plan was generated (which of course is open to negotiation as part of the implementation process): https://www.cartsf.org/our-plan#h.dlldrrta9glp

YES! There are other slowly growing pilot programs run by government for a non-police (but still government) response to non-criminal calls for service. CART is the only one which is by and for the community. **We need *more* responders & we need this *very different* design.**

Given all the work that has gone into this, shouldn't CART be a shining example of San Francisco's community policing approach? Why would you refuse to fund the program you asked San Franciscans to create? And you'd be completely missing the point if you instead made this a government program, when a grassroots community program was how it was designed.

-JDub

Jennifer "JDub" Waggoner (<u>she/her or they/them</u>) <u>jdublwv@gmail.com</u>

From: Joshua Redel

To: Carroll, John (BOS)

Subject: PSNSCM Meeting Comment in Advance
Date: Wednesday, June 9, 2021 2:32:45 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources

Hello Mr. Carroll,

My name is Joshua Redel, I am a San Francisco Resident in Bernal Heights, and I would like to provide written comment in advance of the June 10 <u>Public Safety and Neighborhood</u> <u>Services Committee Meeting</u> starting at 10am. Here is what I'd like to say:

- I've called 311 many times in the hopes of getting help for unhoused people from the Homeless Outreach Team. Usually, the team's guidelines around not approaching people using drugs prevented them from taking action. Further, it was extremely time consuming to get a hold of the HOT in the first place, requiring multiple transfers and arcane knowledge of the government phone systems. Often I would just give up and call 911.
- <u>CART</u> is the clear, logical, community-endorsed alternative to street policing. This item can be funded by reworking proposed funding for the proposed new Street Wellness Team or by reducing police and sheriff funding. CART would give unhoused people needed resources while providing a direct line for housed and unhoused San Franciscans to call for help.
- There needs to be a reallocation in the SFPD budget, and 4.8 million dollars of the reduction should go to funding CART in addition to the 2 million dollars that are already on reserve for an alternative response to policing.

Thanks, Joshua Redel