From:	Alexis Pelosi
To:	BOS Legislation, (BOS)
Cc:	Li, Michael (CPC); Navarrete, Joy (CPC); Asbagh, Claudine (CPC); "Nick Pigott"; Jimmy Consos
Subject:	1525 Pine Street (File No. 210901) - Project Sponsor Response to Supplemental Appeal Response by Appellants
Date:	Monday, October 18, 2021 12:34:24 PM
Attachments:	image001.png
	1525 Pine Street - Supplemental Project Sponsor Response to Appeal (BOS File no. 210910).pdf

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

On behalf of the Project Sponsors, attached please find a response to the Supplemental Appeal Response filed by the Appellants on 1525 Pine Street/File No. 210901. If you have any issues accessing the letter please let me know.

Alexis

Alexis M. Pelosi

Principal Attorney (415) 273-9670 ext. 1 (o) (415) 290-4774 (c) <u>alexis@pzlandlaw.com</u> <u>https://avanan.url-protection.com/v1/url?</u> <u>o=www.pzlandlaw.com&g=MjImOWVIYjdIM2Q5OTY5OQ==&h=ZGM0YTdhYzZiNTM2NWY1YzU0NDYzZTQxYWZjN2Y3</u> <u>ODAxNWRmNTJkMDNIZmU0Y2FiYTk1ODUwNTEzMGYyOWMxMw==&p=YXAzOnNmZHQyOmF2YW5hbjpvOjI0NWU3Z</u> DhhMmQ1ZDA1ZjNmODM3YTBhNDIxMiJhNWQ0OnYxOnQ=



CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This electronic mail transmission may contain privileged and/or confidential information only for use by the intended recipients. Unless you are the addressee (or authorized to receive messages for the addressee), you may not use, copy, disclose, or distribute this message (or any information contained in or attached to it) to anyone. You may be subject to civil action and/or criminal penalties for violation of this restriction. If you received this transmission in error, please notify the sender by reply e-mail and delete the transmission. Thank you.



<u>Sent via Electronic Mail</u>

October 18, 2021

Hon. Shamann Walton San Francisco Board of Supervisors City Hall Room 244 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Supplemental Response to Appeal of Mitigated Negative Declaration 1525 Pine Street (Case No. 2015-009955ENV)

Dear President Walton and Supervisors:

On behalf of my clients, Nick Pigott, Jimmy Consos and 1525 Pine Street Dev, LLC, the following responds to supplemental claims raised by Mr. David Cincotta on behalf of Ms. Patricia Rose and Claire Rose and other residents of 1545 Pine Street ("Appellants") in support of their challenge to the preparation of a Mitigated Negative Declaration ("MND") under the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") for a 79-foot, 21-unit residential development with approximately 2,473 square feet of commercial space to accommodate the Grubstake restaurant (the "Project"). As discussed below, these claims are without merit and the appeal should be denied.

Light and Shadow

The Appellant's first claim, reiterates and restates the position that the light and shadow analysis prepared qualifies as substantial evidence, establishes a substantial adverse effect on human beings and that further environmental review and analysis is needed to "save the lives of the residents of 1545 Pine Street." All these claims have previously been raised by the Appellant and the restating of them, with minor additional details and dramatic flair does not make them legally stronger. Instead, it shows that the Appellant does not understand the applicable legal standard under CEQA.

In our September 24, 2021 letter, we set forth the key standard that applies when assessing the sufficiency of an MND and that standard is whether it can be fairly argued with **substantial evidence** that the Project may have a significant impact on the environment. For purposes of supporting a "fair argument" triggering the need for an EIR, CEQA defines substantial evidence as:

"facts, reasonable assumptions predicated upon facts, and expert opinion supported by facts [not] [a]rgument, speculation, unsubstantiated opinion or narrative, evidence which is clearly inaccurate or erroneous..."¹

¹ Public Resources Code Section 21082.2(c); CEQA Guidelines Sections 15384(a) & (b). 244 Kearny Street, 9th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94108 415-273-9670 www.pzlandlaw.com



The Appellant's citation to CEQA Guidelines section 15384 concerns when enough **substantial** evidence is presented but fails to acknowledge or understand that <u>not all information is substantial</u> evidence. In our September 24, 2021 letter we clearly established that the light and shadow analysis submitted by owners at The Austin was not substantial evidence. PreVision Design, an expert in light and shadow analysis, reviewed the information submitted and found the approach used to be unreliable, inaccurate, and not based in fact. PreVision Design found that it misrepresents the reduction in light and is based on a misunderstanding of light perception or measurement and presents **misleading and inaccurate or erroneous information**.

For example, the Appellant's analysis fails to acknowledge that the interior courtyard is over 25 x 25 feet, and that given the location of the sun, not only will there be light directly into the interior courtyard and units but increased light reflecting off the new structure into those units. In its most recent claims, the Appellant's misleadingly present interior LUX reference standards, failing to understand that these standards are used to <u>aid</u> interior lighting design and not to establish minimum interior daylighting levels. They also fail to understand that these suggested light levels do not presume no additional interior lighting will be used. Handheld LUX readings taken after pulling down the shades and turning off all lights does not yield accurate nor representative daylighting conditions with the Project as it fails to account for any courtyard light. Also, the suggestion that without specific Lux levels of sunlight, resident's spaces are somehow unfit for use is absurd, as people routinely use areas in their homes (i.e., kitchens, home offices, workspaces, etc.) at times of naturally occurring lower natural light levels throughout the portions of the day and use their homes at night. The information presented by the Appellant is not only misleading and inaccurate, but is erroneous, and not substantial evidence.

Claims by the Appellant about when and how the information was submitted is simply not relevant to the determination of whether it is or is not substantial evidence. The peer review of the analysis by a technical expert (PreVision Designs) establishes for the record that it is not substantial evidence.

Regardless, the issue of shadow and light on the interior courtyard is not a CEQA issue. There is no "mandatory finding of significance" as case law clearly holds an adverse change to the environment on "human beings" occurs when there is an impact on human beings in general, not an impact to particular individuals and Planning Code requirements related to exposure are policy considerations, not health and safety requirements, and are often, as was the case for The Austin, granted variances or exceptions based on project circumstances.

Historic Resource and Landmark

The Appellant's second claim, that the Grubstake is a significant historic resource and should be designated as a Landmark and preserved, is also without merit. No new evidence, let alone substantial evidence, has been submitted to support its claims.

The Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE) prepared was detailed and thorough. It did not focus primarily on the physical characteristics of the diner and of the 56 pages that comprise the HRE Part 1², only six (6) are dedicated to a discussion of its physical characteristics whereas over 30 pages are

² The entire HRE Part 1 is 378 pages including the appendix.



dedicated to the historic context of the site, project site history, ownership and occupancy, and LGBTQ+ history. The HRE correctly classified the Grubstake as a contributor to the Polk Gulch LGBTQ+ Historic District and found demolition of the structure does not create a significant impact. This is because not only do other contributors remain but many of the character-defining features of the structure, which are not its four walls, are incorporated into the Project itself either through salvage and restoration, or replication. The demolition of the existing structure does not eliminate the ability to convey the Grubstake's significance as a contributor to the Polk Gulch LGBTQ+ Historic District because its character-defining features are incorporated into the rebuilt Grubstake restaurant. The Appellant misunderstands the Grubstake's historic context and attempts to assign significance without any evidence to support its assertion.

The Appellant also attempts to compare the Eagle Bar to the Grubstake restaurant. They are not the same. The Eagle Bar as noted in the Article 10 Landmark Designation Fact Sheet has a long and singularly focused history in the LGBTQ+ community whereas the Grubstake was a popular neighborhood restaurant beyond the LGBTQ+ community. Below is the significance statement in the Fact Sheet for the Eagle Bar. The complete Fact Sheet is included as <u>Attachment A</u>.

"The San Francisco Eagle Bar is significant for its association with San Francisco's South of Market (SoMa) Leather and LGBTQ communities. The Eagle has associations with four of the subthemes outlined in the Citywide Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco, as follows: Evolution of LGBTQ Enclaves and Development of New Neighborhoods (1960s to 1980s), Gav Liberation, Pride, and Politics (1960s to 1990s), Building LGBTQ Communities (1960s to 1990s), and San Francisco and the AIDS Epidemic (1981 to 1990s). Further significance also lies in the Eagle's association with the following four people: Marcus Hernandez, Alan Selby, Terry Thompson, and Robert Uyvari. The Eagle has served as a long-term SoMa Leather and LGBTQ social space, functioning as a defacto community center. In addition to its use as a bar, the venue has been used for a wide array of activities including fundraisers, leather contests, live music and comedy performances, art exhibits, political organizing and activism, and a meeting space for a huge array of community groups. Its significance is further underscored by its fortyyear tenure, making it the longest running SoMa Leather/LGBTQ bar. Opening just before the onset of the AIDS epidemic, the venue's extensive AIDS fundraising efforts have collectively raised millions of dollars through signature events including the annual Bare Chest Calendar and Sunday Beer Busts."

As the HRE indicates, the Grubstake was found to be a popular restaurant within the LGBTQ+ community in the Polk Gulch area during the 1960s, 1970s, and 1980s catering to the afterhours crowd frequenting nearby bars along Polk Street. It did not find that the Grubstaket was associated with the development of LGBTQ+ business and commerce, did not find direct evidence that it was significant as it relates to political and civic progress and did not find that it was associated with any people of significance. While it was a late-night restaurant and bar that was frequented by and



important to the LGBTQ+ community that alone does not instill historic significance absent other historic evidence, as is the case for The Eagle. The HRE did an exhaustive search of historical evidence even conducting oral histories. It found that "[a]lthough it was a popular restaurant in Polk Gulch and has been a long-operating business, [the Grubstake] does not appear to rise to a level of individual significance within the contextual themes associated with the development and increased visibility of LGBTQ communities in San Francisco." HRE, pg. 37-38.

Regarding the Hoffman Grill, the Appellant is incorrect that the building itself was preserved. As shown in <u>Attachment B</u>, it was demolished and only the façade remains. This is yet another example of the misleading and incorrect statements made by the Appellants.

Grubstake Characteristics and Operations

Finally, as noted in the letter to you from the Project Sponsor, included as <u>Attachment C</u>, Nick and Jimmy are committed to operating the Grubstake. The Project includes rebuilding and renovating the Grubstake with key cultural features identified not only in the Project itself but to be confirmed and overseen in a required salvage plan and as part of an agreement with the LGBTQ+ community. Nick and Jimmy are working with Architectural Resources Group ("ARG") on the scope of the salvage plan to be prepared and Dr. Bill Lipsky, or another qualified individual as identified by the Use the News Foundation, will be conducting an annual review of compliance.

The Appellant may assert that they want to save the Grubstake, but their actions speak much louder than their words. They are not engaging with or listening to or representing the LGBTQ+ community. The Grubstake is more than its four walls and the Appellant's appeal in fact ultimately threatens the future of the Grubstake.

* * * * * * *

In sum, nothing has changed from the time the Planning Commission rendered its clear decision on May 6, 2021. The Appellant still has not met the applicable legal standard to effectuate a challenge to the sufficiency of the environmental review. The information provided by the Appellants continues to be argument, speculation, unsubstantiated opinion or narrative, and many statements made in the appeal and information included in support of the appeal are misleading and inaccurate or erroneous. The MND sufficiently analyzed the environmental impacts under CEQA and determined that the Project is not required to prepare an additional environmental document, including an EIR. As such, we respectfully request that the Board of Supervisors deny the appeal for the PMND and find that the claims in the appeals are without merit.

Very truly yours,

M. Pelo6

Alexis M. Pelosi

Attachments





49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 San Francisco, CA 94103 628.652.7600 www.sfplanning.org

ARTICLE 10 LANDMARK DESIGNATION FACT SHEET



Historic Name:	San Francisco Eagle Bar (San Francisco Eagle, Eagle Tavern)
Address:	396-398 12 th Street
Block/ Lot(s):	3522/014
Parcel Area:	5,153 sq ft
Zoning:	WMUG (WSOMA Mixed Use-General) / 55-X Height and Bulk District
Year Built:	1906
Architect:	Unknown

Prior Historic Studies/Other Designations:	 Small Business Commission San Francisco Eagle Bar, Legacy Business Registration (April 24, 2017) San Francisco Board of Supervisors - Establishment of the LGBTQ and Leather Cultural District (2018) Note: This resolution established the LEATHER & LGBTQ Cultural District, mentioning the Eagle as an asset within the District. The District's boundaries were identified as: south side of Howard Street between 7th Street and Highway 101, to the west side of 7th Street between Howard Street and Harrison Street to Interstate 80 between 7th Street and Division Street, to Highway 101 between Interstate 80 and Howard Street; as well as the south side of Harrison Street to Bryant Street to 5th Street, the west side of 5th Street from Harrison Street to Bryant Street and the north side of Bryant Street from 5th Street and the west side of 6th Street to 6th Street to 6th Street and the west side of 6th Street to 1000 Street. Page and Turnbull – Western SOMA Light Industrial & Residential Historic District (2009) Note: This survey identified the Eagle as a contributor to a National Register Eligible District. Watson Heritage Consulting - Historic Resources Evaluation, 280-282 7th Street, San Francisco (July 20, 2017) Note: This Historic Resources Evaluation included the identification of the Eagle as a contributor to a CEQA eligible LGBTQ Historic District. This discontiguous district includes contributing properties primarily bounded by: 4th Street to the east, 12th Street to the west, Bryant Street to the south, and Mission Street to the north. The Department concurred with the determination of the District. The foundation of this HRE is the Citywide Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco (2016), Donna J. Graves & Shayne E. Watson.
Prior HPC Actions:	Legacy Business Registry Recommendation to Small Business Commission (April 5, 2017)
Significance Criteria:	<i>Events:</i> Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history. <i>Persons:</i> Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
Period of Significance:	1981-2020

Statement of Significance:	The San Francisco Eagle Bar is significant for its association with San
	Francisco's South of Market (SoMa) Leather and LGBTQ communities. The Eagle has associations with four of the subthemes outlined in the <i>Citywide</i> <i>Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco</i> , as follows: Evolution of LGBTQ Enclaves and Development of New Neighborhoods (1960s to 1980s), Gay Liberation, Pride, and Politics (1960s to 1990s), Building LGBTQ Communities (1960s to 1990s), and San Francisco and the AIDS Epidemic (1981 to 1990s). Further significance also lies in the Eagle's association with the following four people: Marcus Hernandez, Alan Selby, Terry Thompson, and Robert Uyvari. The Eagle has served as a long-term SoMa Leather and LGBTQ social space, functioning as a de-facto community center. In addition to its use as a bar, the venue has been used for a wide array of activities including fundraisers, leather contests, live music and comedy performances, art exhibits, political organizing and activism, and a meeting space for a huge array of community groups. Its significance is further underscored by its forty-year tenure, making it the longest running SoMa Leather/LGBTQ bar. Opening just before the onset of the AIDS epidemic, the venue's extensive AIDS fundraising efforts have collectively raised millions of dollars through signature events including the annual Bare Chest Calendar and Sunday Beer Busts.
Assessment of Integrity:	The seven aspects of integrity as defined by the National Park Service (NPS) and the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) are location, design, materials, workmanship, setting, feeling, and association. ¹ The Eagle has occupied the subject property from 1981-present and retains a high degree of integrity to convey its cultural significance. The property retains a high degree of integrity of location, association, setting, materials, and feeling. The property also retains integrity of design and workmanship,
	however, these physical aspects of integrity are less important to conveying cultural significance. Overall, the Department has determined that the Eagle retains integrity to convey historical and cultural significance, as the venue has served as the location of countless SoMa Leather and LGBTQ community events including charitable fundraisers, leather contests, live music and comedy, art exhibits, and much more. Few exterior changes have been made to the building over the course of its use as the Eagle. It has remained in the same SoMa location on the corner of 12 th and Harrison Streets since its establishment. While
	there have been some interior expansions, they are not street visible, and the building's general form, massing, and height have remained unchanged. Exterior features including wood framing, front façade stucco, gabled roof, and false front parapet appear to match historic 1980's photographs of the venue. Furthermore, doors and windows along the minimally fenestrated façade appear to be in the same locations as they historically were based upon this photographic documentation. The outdoor patio, which the venue expanded to include just a few years after it began operating, retains its open-air feeling. Dimension and materials of the solid front property line fence which encloses the patio also match 1980's photographic documentation.

Character-Defining Features:	 Exterior: Site comprised of building (consisting of the primary bar space within the gable-roofed portion, indoor stage within the rear flat-roofed portion, and the side bar within the side flat-roofed portion) with primary elevation at 12th Street and secondary elevation at Harrison Street, and open side yard allowing for outdoor patio Single-story massing of building Secondary elevation (on Harrison Street) clad in channel drop wood siding Primary elevation (on 12th Street) clad in stucco Minimal fenestration at visible façades on Harrison Street and 12th Street Roof-form on primary bar space of building, defined by front-facing gable roof terminating in false front parapet with cartouche detailing Recessed entryway at 12th Street elevation with segmented arched opening, solid double doors and glazed transom Two segmented arched window openings with glazed infill at 12th Street elevation Solid front property-line fence extending from the building (fronting the indoor/outdoor bar area) to enclose the patio (12th Street elevation) Large outdoor patio, located at side yard, with enclosed rear bar (3-4 serving stations) and outdoor stage, and tall metal flagpole with Leather flag Indoor/outdoor restroom, defined by an original porcelain trough (shared urinal) attached to exterior wall of main building and opening onto outdoor patio Interior: Indoor performance stage with adjacent DJ booth located to the rear of the primary bar space Indoor/outdoor bar, with two serving stations, located within the side flat-roofed portion of the building which opens onto the patio, with unique fold-up panels above bar, which form an awning when open to the patio
------------------------------	---

¹ "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation," *National Register Bulletin*, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 1995, p. 44.

Statement of Significance Summary

For forty years, the San Francisco Eagle Bar (Eagle), located at 396-398 12th Street, has served as a cornerstone for San Francisco's South of Market (SoMa) Leather and LGBTQ communities. According to Bay Area Reporter archival research, the news first broke in 1980 that San Francisco would have its own Eagle Bar, joining other U.S. cities of New York, Boston, L.A., and Washington D.C. The venue opened in its current location on April 8th, 1981, with a May 12-14 grand opening celebration. As one of the few SoMa Leather bars with an outdoor patio, the venue has been a prominent SoMa Leather and LGBTQ gathering space, serving as a home to a wide array of parties, fundraisers, contests, live shows, art exhibits, political organizing, and more. A variety of well-known non-profit organizations, activists, political leaders, artists, DJs, musicians and more have utilized the space, collectively contributing to the Eagle's identity as an unparalleled cultural hub of SoMa's internationally known Leather/LGBTQ scene.²

Sociologist and Leather historian Gayle Rubin defines "Leather" as a "distinctive subgroup of male homosexuals... organized around sexual activities and erotic semiotics that distinguish it from the larger gay male population." ³ Masculine men, especially motorcyclists who wore leather "began to carve out alternative gay social spaces." Gay motorcycle clubs, including the Warlocks and California Motor Club were formed in San Francisco in the 1960s, along with some of SoMa's early Leather bars opening around this time period.⁴

Throughout its 40-year history, the Eagle has been under three different ownerships⁵:

- 1981 1998 Bob Damron, author of the Damron Gay Guide, and Jay Levine were business partners and the first owners. The venue's original name was the San Francisco Eagle. The original space did not include the outdoor patio, and the interior included a main room with a horseshoe shaped bar. The bar opened before the onset of AIDS and was generally packed every night. While Damron passed away in 1989, Levine continued to run the bar until 1998
- 1998 2011 John Gardiner and Joe Banks were partners who purchased the bar from Levine. Upon acquisition, a stipulation was that "Eagle" must remain in the name, and hence the bar became the Eagle Tavern. Along with new ownership, came some changes to long-running events, though new events were introduced, and signature Beer Busts continued. The couple now owns the Hole in the Wall Saloon on Folsom Street between 9th and 10th Streets, a location to where they transferred a great deal of the Eagle's interior décor, including light fixtures and artwork. The Eagle Tavern officially closed on May 31, 2011.⁶
- 2013 present Alex (Lex) Montiel and Mike Leon reopened the bar as the SF Eagle after having purchased the bar the year prior. Prior to reopening, the couple brought the structure up to building code with changes including structural and electrical upgrades, the removal of the horseshoe bar, an

² Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

³ Gayle Rubin, "The Miracle Mile," in James Brook, Chris Carlsson and Nancy J Peters, eds., *Reclaiming San Francisco* (San Francisco California: City Lights Books), 1998, 253.

⁴ Donna J. Graves and Shayne E. Watson, *Citywide Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco*, March 2016, page 248.

⁵ Gary Kenyon, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 22, 2021.

⁶ Gary Kenyon, *SF Eagle History*, 2014, page 14.

ADA-accessible bathroom, an ADA-accessible entrance, and roof replacement. The new owners committed to continuing many of the venue's long-running fundraisers, while also introducing new events.⁷

The period of significance (POS) is 1981 to 2020. The start of this period, 1981, is the year the Eagle opened. The Eagle's long-term tenure is cited as a contributing factor to its cultural significance, and thus a contemporary year (2020) was identified as the POS end date. Many other SoMa Leather/LGBTQ bars existed for much shorter periods, with few even reaching 10-12 years, compared to the Eagle's 40-year tenure.⁸ The Eagle has demonstrated enormous resiliency as the venue has persevered through the AIDS epidemic, changes in ownership, and continued community displacement resulting from rapid development throughout the SoMa neighborhood. Many of the Eagle's recurring events which began in the 1980s and contribute to its significance have continued through contemporary times.

The year 2020 was identified as the POS end date as it represents a break, albeit anticipated to be temporary, in the Eagle's operations due to the beginning of the global Covid-19 pandemic. On March 15, 2020, California Governor Gavin Newsom ordered bars and nightclubs statewide to close their doors as a precautionary means to reduce spread of the coronavirus. This had devastating economic and cultural impacts, leading many long-running small businesses throughout San Francisco to close permanently. While the Eagle has remained closed for business, the closure is only temporary. Per conversation with Eagle owner Lex Montiel, the venue does plan to reopen once the Covid-19 pandemic has ended.⁹

Significance Criteria

The Eagle is eligible for designation as a San Francisco Landmark for association with significant historic events (Criterion 1) and people (Criterion 2).

The *Citywide Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco* was adopted by the San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission in 2016. This 400+ page document includes subthemes outlining events and trends associated with the development of San Francisco's LGBTQ communities. The Eagle's historical and cultural significance is strongly related to the following four subthemes:

- Evolution of LGBTQ Enclaves and Development of New Neighborhoods (1960s to 1980s) Social, political, and cultural changes associated with LGBTQ migration, organizing and activism in San Francisco from the 1960s through the 1980s led to the emergence of new queer neighborhoods and changes to existing enclaves.
- Gay Liberation, Pride, and Politics (1960s to 1990s)

Conceptualizing gay rights, and organizing for them, evolved and became more complex in the 1960s to the 1980s. Homophile activists had worked on the premise that rights would be gained by arguing that sexual behavior was a private matter and only one small part of their identity; in all other ways they were the same as straight people—and should therefore be equal to them.

⁷ Lex Montiel, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 10, 2021.

⁸ Bob Goldfarb, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 12, 2021.

⁹ Montiel interview.

• Building LGBTQ Communities (1960s to 1990s)

Advances in gay liberation helped further the growth of LGBTQ communities, including both the associated physical spaces, as well as events and traditions that shaped them. The growing spectrum of activities and institutions, from sports, visual arts, music, film, literature, education, religion, sex-based, and more were reflective of San Francisco's diverse and expanding LGBTQ communities.

• San Francisco and the AIDS Epidemic (1981 to 1990s)

The AIDS epidemic is among the most significant events to shape the LGBTQ history of the 20[®] and 21_{st} centuries. The social, psychological, and financial costs are stunning, and the epidemic has wrought enormous changes in medical research, healthcare delivery, and gay culture. By killing a significant number of gay and bisexual men and transgender women, the disease underscored major issues associated with homophobia and discrimination, medical research, and the provision of healthcare in the U.S. It also brought to the fore the ability of communities to rally in the face of discrimination and death. The San Francisco model of HIV/AIDS care, which utilized medical facilities and community-based organizations to mobilize compassionate and respectful treatment, became a global standard.

The Eagle is also significant under Criterion 2 for its association with the following people:

• Marcus Hernandez

Commonly known as "Mr. Marcus", Hernandez was a well-known Leather personality with a long-running Bay Area Reporter Leather column. He contributed to the success of early recurring fundraising events which the Eagle became known for, including MCing the Bare Chest Calendar contest throughout the entirety of its time at the Eagle, as well as at is subsequent home at the Powerhouse. He was also an avid Leather photographer, and judged Leather contests worldwide.

• Alan Selby

Also known as "Daddy Alan" and "The Mayor of Folsom Street", Selby founded Mr. S Leather, an iconic SoMa leather retailer and manufacturer, which operated a store out of the Eagle for many years. Selby's events at the Eagle included "Leather Daddy" and "Leather Daddy's Boy" contests, which continued well into the late 2000s. Selby was also an incredibly dedicated AIDS activist. In addition to volunteering his time to a variety of AIDS-related organizations, many of his events served as charitable fundraisers.

• Terry Thompson

Manager of the Eagle circa 1984-1994, Thompson is widely credited as the driving force behind many of the venue's long-running fundraising events, which collectively have raised millions of dollars for AIDS-related, and other charities. Thompson established the Bare Chest Calendar as a charitable fundraiser, developed the Sunday Beer Busts, organized a few street fairs, and hosted several other regular events.

• Robert Uyvari

Homoerotic artist of the 1970s-80s, Uyvari split his time between San Francisco and his home state of Wisconsin. His pieces were amongst the first displayed at the Eagle and he designed the early Eagle poster which was distributed internationally. Additionally he did cover art for the Places of Interest Map Guide Book, designed posters from several other venues, and oversaw the design of early gay bars in Milwaukee, Wisconsin.

Article 10 Landmark Designation Fact Sheet San Francisco Eagle 396-398 12th Street

Criterion 1 - Events

More details on the Eagle's significance in relationship to the four identified subthemes is described below:

• Evolution of LGBTQ Enclaves and Development of New Neighborhoods (1960s to 1980s) SoMa's Leather community has been credited with influencing the Leather culture globally, with the Eagle long-serving as an anchor to this scene. The SoMa neighborhood has a robust Leather history which can be traced back to the 1960s. During this time the neighborhood was characterized by a mix of

large industrial sites, junkyards and vacant buildings.¹⁰ The post-World War II SoMa Demographic was largely single male workers of various ethnicities with blue-collar jobs. Based on SoMa's largely low income demographic, the neighborhood was targeted by the City's Redevelopment Agency, whose efforts included eminent domain, demolition of dozens pf residential hotels, and evictions.¹¹ During this transitional period, the burgeoning Leather community took foothold in the neighborhood, taking advantage of the cheap rents and nocturnal privacy which was SoMa offered.¹²

Leather culture began as a statement against effeminate stereotypes often associated with male homosexuals. While its origins can be traced back nationally about two decades prior, there wasn't much of a scene in San Francisco until the 1960s. Though a small handful of bars catering to the leather community, as well as gay motorcycle clubs, existed in the city prior, the Tool Box (non-extant) at 399 Fourth Street at Harrison opened in 1962, and is generally credited as SoMa's first Leather bar.¹³ Other gay bars, concentrated along a three-block strip of Folsom Street including Febe's, the Stud, and the Ramrod (all non-extant) opened during the 1960s thus furthering the neighborhood as a LGBTQ/Leather enclave. The proliferation of leather bars continued through the late 1970s, expanding to surrounding streets, and thus further defining SoMa's robust Leather community.¹⁴ Beyond bars, a variety of other assets catering to the growing SoMa Leather/LGBTQ community including publishing organizations, restaurants, nightlife venues, homophile organizations, bath houses, and more grew and flourished.¹⁵ SoMa expanded quickly as a sexual center for gay men and acquired new nicknames such as The Miracle Mile and Valley of the Kings. In 1970, there were nearly twenty gay bars and bathhouses, Leather and non-Leather, in the neighborhood; by 1980, the introduction of discos and the expansion of gay bars and bathhouses brought the total close to forty.¹⁶

However, a variety of factors led the number of SoMa's LGBTQ associated businesses to significantly plummet. In the 1970's redevelopment and demolition led to many of the neighborhood's bars and sex clubs to relocate.¹⁷ The onset of AIDS in the 1980s led to further closure of bathhouses and sex clubs, as such venues were targeted out of fear and panic surrounding the spreading of AIDS.¹⁸

¹⁰ Graves and Watson, SF LGBTQ context statement, 164.

¹¹ Page and Turnbull, Inc., South of Market Area, Historic Context Statement, June 2009, page 5.

¹² Rubin, "The Miracle Mile," 251.

¹³ Graves and Watson, SF LGBTQ context statement, page 248.

¹⁴ Western SOMA Citizens Planning Taskforce. *Recognizing, Protecting and Memorializing South of Market LGBTQ Social Heritage Neighborhood Resources,* 2011, pages 3-4.

¹⁵ Shayne E. Watson, *Historic Resources Evaluation, 280-282 7th Street*, July 2017, 49.

¹⁶ Graves and Watson, *SF LGBTQ Context Statement*, page 165.

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Ibid.

The Eagle is the longest running extant SoMa Leather/LGBTQ venue. While other Leather bars existed prior, very few lasted more than 11-12 years, only a fraction of the time in comparison to the Eagle's 40 years of existence.¹⁹ Also notable as a long running extant SoMa venue is the Powerhouse (1347 Folsom Street), which opened in 1985, though other LGBTQ/Leather bars existed at its site dating back to 1971.²⁰ Additionally, the Lone Star Saloon (1354 Harrison St.) opened in 1989, seven years after the Eagle, and remains open.²¹ In summary the Eagle is the longest operating extant SoMa Leather/LGBTQ space, even predating most of the Castro's LGBTQ bars.22

The Eagle's rise to prominence can be partially credited to the closings of other SoMa bars which anchored the scene in the 1980s. Particularly notable was Febe's, which closed in 1986. Motorcycle clubs which were strongly associated with gay male Leather culture, frequently utilized Febe's and other contemporary bars such as the Ramrod (which also closed in 1986). The closing of these establishments led to a steady stream of regulars looking to patronize other venues, many of whom migrated to the Eagle.²³ Along with the clubs came their traditions. Motorcycle club members would park their bikes





Above: Venue artwork. Once affixed to the back of the indoor stage, the piece remains at the patio bar. Image Source: Planning Department Staff, 2021 Below: 1988 Bike Blessings on 12th Street in front of the Eagle. Photo Credit: Mr. Marcus.

¹⁹ Goldfarb interview.

²⁰ Watson, *Historic Resources Evaluation, 280-282 7th Street*, page 58.

²¹ Cal Callahan, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 11, 2021.

²² Early extant Castro Bars include The Mint (1968), Twin Peaks Tavern (1973), Moby Dick (1979), The Pilsner Inn (1980),

Midnight Sun (1981). (<u>http://www.sfgayhistory.com/neighborhoods/castro/castro-gay-bars/</u>. Accessed May 9, 2021).

²³ Gayle Rubin, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 26, 2021.

outside on 12th Street for recurring "bike blessings", some of which were undertaken by priests.²⁴ Similarly "bike christenings" included new bikes being named with a bottle of champagne broken over the bike, and in some cases a ride through the patio and main bar.²⁵ The Eagle further branded itself as a Motorcycle Club venue through the collection of Motorcycle Club insignia, badges, pins and patches which were framed and displayed on the wall of the back bar. An additional row of framed patches was also mounted above the passage between the patio and the indoor bar. These collections remained through Gardiner and Bank's ownership of the venue, though have since been removed.²⁶

Pursuant to a building permit history search, expansion to include the patio commenced in 1983, just two years after the Eagle opened. The patio is believed to be one of the largest outdoor patios in San Francisco²⁷, serving as a social space for a countless number of events that have contributed to the Eagle's important role as a de-facto SoMa LGBTQ/Leather community center. The patio is open air, yet

enclosed on all sides, including by a solid wooden fence along the eastern property line. The patio space has offered privacy from the outside world, while helping to create an ambience that has lended to popularity of Eagle, attracting both regular patrons and international tourists. The sheer capacity of the patio has helped support large fundraising events, such as the long-running Sunday Beer Busts, which have raised millions of dollars over the course of decades for charities related to AIDS and other causes. The trough urinal, accessible from the patio was also built around the same time, further contributing to the unique character of the Eagle as a gay venue.²⁸ The patio has also long provided a space for Cigar Clubs to gather, something that few other San Francisco venues offer.²⁹

Since its early days, the Eagle has been known for its leather contests. Daddy Alan Selby, founder of Mr. S Leather, an important manufacturer and retailer of leather products, started the "Leather Daddy" and "Leather Daddy's Boy" contests, which continued well into the late 2000s. In 1982, Chris Winkler was selected as the first Mr. SF Eagle; and became the first International Mr. Leather runner up.³⁰ The Mr. San



1986 Leather Daddy Boy Contestant. Image Source: Bay Area Reporter August 21, 1986.

²⁴ Kenyon Interview.

²⁵ Gary Kenyon, *SF Eagle History*, page 11.

²⁶ Rubin Interview.

²⁷ Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative*. April 5, 2017, page 6.

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Montiel Interview.

³⁰ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

Francisco Leather contest was also held on the bar's patio³¹In 1992, Lenny Broberg, (title holder of both Mr. Eagle Leather and Mr. SF Leather) became the first Mr. Eagle to win the International Mr. Leather title.³² Another long-running charitable event dating back to the Eagle's early days is the *Golden Dildeaux Awards*, a contest consisting of hysterical X-rated comedy.³³ Albeit being digital the last two years, the Golden Dildeaux Awards remain held at the Eagle most years as fundraising endeavors.³⁴

From drawing, paintings, and photography, visual arts have played a critical role in further defining and branding the Leather aesthetic. Since its early days the Eagle has showcased work by prominent artists within the scene. During its opening year, 1981, the venue held its first art exhibit spotlighting the work of internationally recognized gay lifestyle artist Robert Uyvari, In 1982 well known leather-themed photographer Jim Wigler held his first exhibition at the venue and the Eagle continued to showcase his work afterwards.³⁵ Charcoal artist Fred Linde's work was displayed in 1982, homoerotic drawer Clark Kümmel's work in 1983, and Dick Wheeler (oil) and Ed Burns (graphite) in 1984. In 1985 Tom of Finland, arguably the most renowned homoerotic artist of the 1980's attended a SF AIDS fundraiser where his work was displayed, signed and auctioned.³⁶ Tom of Finland also returned in 1988 for a leather auction and Beer Bust benefitting the Tom of Finland Foundation, which included a display of his work and book signing.³⁷ Throughout the remainder of the decade other featured artists included Leather-culture photographer Bill Bowers (1987), Bay Area Reporter cartoonist Fran Frisch (1989) and another exhibit



Clark Kummel was present at the opening of the display of his drawings now at the Eagle but has since returned to Canada. Kummel's steamy work gets attention whether he's here or not, but the exhibit will only be on view until April 10. This display is the first in a series which kicks off the Eagle's Second Anniversary week of celebrations.

Above: 1981 Poster by Robert Uyvari. Image Credit : The Gay Highwaymen. Below: Clark Kümmel's artwork displayed to kick off the Eagle's second Anniversary Week. Image Credit : The Bay Area Reporter, April 7, 1983.

³¹ Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative*, page 3.

³² Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

³³ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, page 9.

³⁴ Callahan Interview.

³⁵ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Ibid.

of Jim Wigler's photography (1989).³⁸ According to Gayle Rubin, other U.S. Cities, including New York, Los Angeles and Chicago, had larger Leather scenes, though generally more dispersed compared to San Francisco's scene. The City's unique concentration of Leather institutions, and highly visible street presence lended to its notoriety. Additionally, the global attention which San Francisco's Leather scene gained can be partially credited to Drummer Magazine, which moved from Los Angeles to San Francisco in 1977. Drummer, with an international readership, featured local people, bars, and dungeons, including the Eagle.



1987 Mr. Northern California Drummer Contest at the Eagle. Image Credit : The Bay Area Reporter, June 11, 1987.

Thus, through being featured in Drummer magazine, the Eagle and the rest of the SoMa Leather scene were put in the international spotlight. In addition to publishing the magazine, Drummer hosted the Mr. Drummer contest. At least two Mr. Northern California Drummer contests were held on 12th Street in front of the bar. ³⁹

Annual street festivals have long celebrated the neighborhood's rich Leather heritage while attracting thousands of visitors. Folsom Street Fair began in 1984 originally as a political statement against redevelopment, providing a collective voice amongst SoMa's diverse residents.⁴⁰ While not originally a Leather event, the neighborhood's robust Leather community had a strong early presence, and subsequently helped grow the Fair into one of the world's best known events celebrating BDSM and Leather Culture. In 1985 Eagle employee and International Mr. Leather 1985 Patrick Toner began the Up Your Alley Fair, sometimes called Dore Alley Fair, specifically as a charity benefitting AIDS organizations.⁴¹ Originally located on Ringold Alley, this fair was moved to Dore Alley between Harrison and Folsom Streets in 1987.⁴² Both festivals are now run by the same non-profit organization, Folsom Street Events.

While not located on Folsom Street, the Eagle has long served as a venue for Folsom Street Fair related events. Kicking off Leather Week, the week preceding the Folsom Street Fair, is the Leather Walk, a charity event. As a fundraiser for the AIDS Emergency Relief Fund (AEF), the Leather Walk was founded in 1992 by Art Tomaszewski, former AEF Board President, Bare Chest Calendar Man and former Mr. Headquarters Leather. The Eagle serves as the terminus for the walk which begins in the Castro and ends at the Eagle for the raising of the Leather flag and Beer Bust. At its peak years, the Leather Walk raised

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, page 9.

⁴⁰ Rubin, "The Miracle Mile," 268.

⁴¹ Peter Fiske, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 30, 2021.

⁴² Rubin, "The Miracle Mile," 268.

around \$20,000 for AEF.43 Throughout the remainder of Leather Week, the Eagle generally hosts evening events not directly associated with the Fair, but taking place because of the Fair. Naturally the Eagle has been a popular venue for Fair participants, generally with a long line outside for those who want to continue the celebration as the fair is ending.⁴⁴ The Eagle also frequently serves as the venue for the Folsom Street Fair check beneficiaries' presentation, a celebratory post-Folsom Street Fair Event taking place on the Eagle's outdoor stage patio, with charity organizations receiving the checks from donations raised by the Fair.45



Leather Walk 2002. Photo Credit: San Francisco History Center, San Francisco Public Library.

• Gay Liberation, Pride, and Politics (1960s to 1990s)

San Francisco, as a LGBT mecca, has long been a hotspot for activism to advance gay liberation, often receiving national and global attention. Bars and nightlife establishments have played important roles not just as social hubs, but as community organizing spaces to build awareness and support for political activities which have advanced LGBTQ equality. The Eagle's prime SoMa location, its gracious indoor and outdoor spaces with stages to support large crowds, and engaged/involved staff have all contributed to its use as a community organizing space. Politicians were known to campaign at the Eagle's popular events, such as Sunday Beer Busts, in order to gain support amongst gay voters.⁴⁶ Notable events with political associations that have occurred at the Eagle have included:

- 1983 Beer Bust to raise funds for the documentary "Out of Order: the Times of Harvey Milk," which later becomes "The Times of Harvey Milk" which won an Academy Award for Best Documentary in 1985.⁴⁷
- 1984 The Eagle's owner signed a joint statement in CA Superior Court in regards to the lawsuit challenging the closure of the bath houses: "The city's action is not only unwarranted, and unlikely to reduce the risk or the spread of AIDS, but will establish a dangerous precedent for government's authority to regulate the constitutionally-protected activities of all citizens."⁴⁸
- o 1986 The Eagle hosts a fundraiser for Pat Norman, the first African-American lesbian to run for San

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴³ GayTravel4U, "San Francisco Leather Walk 2021," Accessed April 8, 2021 via <u>https://www.gaytravel4u.com/event/san-</u><u>francisco-leather-walk/</u>.

⁴⁴ Callahan Interview.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Fiske Interview.

⁴⁷ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

Francisco Board of Supervisors, raising \$1,500.49

- 1987 The Eagle hosted a fundraiser for Harry Britt's congressional campaign. Britt was an openly gay politician, first appointed to the Board of Supervisors in 1979 succeeding Harvey Milk, and continued through much of the 1980s. He initially introduced domestic partnership legislation in 1982 (vetoed by Mayor Feinstein), though similar legislation was passed in 1989 under Britt's leadership which was signed by Mayor Art Agnos.
- 1989 Local S and M group hosts a Flog-a-Thon at the Eagle to support Harvey Gantt's United States Senate Campaign. Gantt was running against anti-gay Senator Jessie Helm.⁵⁰

The Eagle has also had a presence at San Francisco's Gay Pride Parade since the 1980s with manager Terry Thompson's romantic partner Stephen Blair designing the venue's parade floats. Bar employees and patrons, as well as visiting Leather title holders would ride in the floats. ⁵¹ Additionally the San Francisco Leather Pride Contingent, dating to at least 1999, has held organizing meetings at the Eagle since 2010. This contingent has served as the locus of Leather in the Pride Parade, bringing together various Leather groups to march together under a single entity. Included in their Pride Parade planning efforts is the selection of Leather Marshalls, also taking place on the Eagle Patio. Also included in this contingent is the San Francisco Chapter of Breeches and Leather Uniform Fanclub (BLUF), a group of Leathermen who strictly meet in full leather, and also use the Eagle for their meetings.⁵² The SF Pride Committee has also utilized the venue for the meeting space, to discuss how to make the Pride Parade more welcoming to the Leather, kink, sex, and bear communities.⁵³

The Eagle has also provided a venue for "Non-Violence Trainings" which have been required for participants affiliated with the Eagle's presence at public events such as SF Pride, as well as 2009 Proposition 8 protests. These trainings have included 100-150 people.⁵⁴

• Building LGBTQ Communities (1960s to 1990s)

While the Castro is often recognized as San Francisco's most iconic and internationally renowned gay neighborhood, SoMa has attracted and continues to retain an assemblage of gay social spaces often appealing to a slightly different demographic. While there is certainly crossover between the two neighborhoods, SoMa gay bars have often served a slightly older clientele offering more alternative and edgier nightlife options to what the Castro has generally provided.

The Eagle has served as home to a long list of different types of activities including live music, dance parties, comedy performances, fundraisers, political activism, community group meetings, art exhibitions, anniversary parties, weddings (once same-sex marriages were legalized), memorial services, and more. While gentrification has displaced many of SoMa's LGBTQ community who formerly worked and/or resided in the neighborhood, the Eagle continues to serve as a meeting space for the Leather and

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Rubin Interview.

⁵¹ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, page 10.

⁵² Goldfarb Interview.

⁵³ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

⁵⁴ Fiske Interview.

Leather adjacent community. ⁵⁵ Due to the large diversity of activities taking place at the venue, the Eagle has served as a de-facto community center, well beyond the traditional role of a bar as social space simply to serve alcoholic beverages.

Sporting

Throughout its history, the Eagle has sponsored numerous sporting-related events. In 1986, the Eagle's SF Gay Softball League was formed with bartenders, barbacks, and supporters. The next year the Eagle Softball team hosted all of the contestants for the International Ms. Leather competition for a fundraising Beer Bust. In 1986, the venue welcomed all of the athletes from the Gay Games after the closing ceremony. In 1993 a gathering of athletes participating in the 13th Annual Gay Open occurred at the venue, hosted in San Francisco by



Team photo of the Eagle Team in 1988. Photo Credit: San Francisco History Center, San Francisco Public Library.

the Gay Tennis Federation. This is followed the next week by an Athletes Reception for the Second Annual Memorial Day Weekend Sports Festival. In 1994 at the San Francisco Gay Softball League end of year celebration, the Eagle won the True Spirit Awards.⁵⁶

Music

As a cornerstone of SoMa's LGBTQ community, the Eagle has long been a hub of activities which have helped to shape and define San Francisco's diverse queer culture. Many, though not all, of the events have been aligned with the Eagle's tradition of being a fundraising hub for various social causes. However, despite the Eagle's robust Leather and LGBTQ affiliation not all of the Eagle's events have been Leather-associated, nor have all of them been exclusively Queer. In 1999, when John Gardiner and Joe Banks took ownership of the Eagle certain changes were made to some of the long-standing weeknight events. This included beginning Thursday Night Live (TNL), a weekly live music night. TNL took the place of the weekly Bare Chest Calendar events, which then moved to the Powerhouse where it has remained.⁵⁷ The Eagle, relatively small for a music venue, offered an intimate and affordable space for more underground bands to perform. Often classified as "rock and roll", many of the bands who performed were not gay, and were generally outside of disco and electronic dance music genres which were more commonly featured at gay bars. The Eagle's shows were not well advertised, and beyond word-of-mouth, promotion was generally limited to streetlamp fliers around SoMa.⁵⁸ Regular TNL

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Callahan Interview.

⁵⁷ Larry Rich, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 19, 2021.

⁵⁸ John Ginoli, personal interview with Alex Westhoff, March 17, 2021.

clientele was mixed, and included both gays who attended other Eagle events, as well as straight patrons who appreciated the music and didn't mind being in a gay venue.⁵⁹ Notable bands included the San Francisco-based Pansy Division, who rose to prominence within the homocore/queercore genre, and performed at the Eagle at least ten times. While Pansy Division had existed prior, the Eagle was an ideal setting for their performances, given it was a gay venue although with a more alternative brand and clientele.⁶⁰

Other well-known musicians have utilized the space, for live music or DJ gigs, from a variety of genres including rock, punk, industrial, electro and more. This includes Grant Hart (Hüsker Dü), Gary Floyd (the Dicks), Don Baird⁶¹, Book of Love, My Life with the Thrill Kill Kult, Casey Spooner (Fischer Spooner), Jake Shears (Scissor Sisters), Jello Biafra (Dead Kennedys), Douglas McCarthy (Nitzer Ebb), Al Jourgensen (Ministry), and others⁶².

Stage Performances

The Eagle has also served as a stand-up comedy venue with Wednesday nights as stand-up comedy nights for sometime.⁶³ Well known comedians who have performed there include Tom Ammiano (before he was a State



Above: Pansy Division performing at the Eagle, 2002. Jon Ginoli (singer, right), Chris Freeman (bassist, left) Photo Credit: Unknown.

Below: TNL crowd watching Pansy Division, 2006. Upon closing the Eagle in 2011, then owners Gardiner and Banks moved some of the quirky Interior lighting features and artwork to adorn the interior of the Hole in the Wall where they took ownership of. Photo Credit: Unknown.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² SF Eagle Staff, SF Eagle Entertainment Roster, 2021.

⁶³ Montiel Interview.

Senator)⁶⁴, lesbian comedian Karen Ripley for the first time in 1985⁶⁵, and Margaret Cho. In 1989 The Eagle hosted a Connie Francis look alike competition with guest judge Connie Francis. The fundraiser raised \$5,000 for Project Open Hand.⁶⁶ Other performances have included the First Annual San Francisco Drag King Competition in 1994.⁶⁷ Held by Mr. Nancy Kravitz and Katherine Murty, the event was MC'd by Elvis Herselvis with judges including Club Confidential hosts Stafford and Jordy Jones.⁶⁸ The Eagle has also hosted benefits for the SF AIDS Foundation which have included appearances by Comedians Danny Williams and Monica Palacios.

Community Event Space

Countless groups have used the Eagle as a meeting space. The Eagle has helped foster inclusivity within the LGBTQ community, serving as a meeting spot for groups beyond organizations dominated by white gay men. Dykes on Bikes, San Francisco's lesbian motorcycle club has used the space as a meeting venue. More recently, Onyx, a West Coast based BIPOC Leather organization also started meeting at the Eagle. Furthermore, the Young Leatherman's Discussion Group hosts monthly educated workshops and discussions targeting a 40- year-old-and-under demographic, thus serving to help stabilize a younger Leather community contingent, highlighting the importance of educating new generations to continue the cultural traditions.⁶⁹ Additionally, the initial meetings for the recently established SoMa LEATHER and LGBTQ Cultural District were held at the venue.⁷⁰

• San Francisco and the AIDS Epidemic (1981 to 1990s)

The AIDS epidemic represents a watershed period of evolution within San Francisco's LGBTQ community. During the height of the AIDS crisis, between 1981 and 1998, 22 Eagle employees as well as countless family and friends were lost to the disease.⁷¹ The lack of Federal response to AIDS made the importance of grass roots organizing critical, and the Eagle served as an epicenter for AIDS related activism, with ongoing fundraising events continuing until today.⁷² Through its weekly Beer Busts and other fundraising events, the venue's efforts have raised millions of dollars for charities including AIDS Emergency Fund (AEF), Godfather Service Fund, PAWS, Positive Resource Center (PRC), SF Aids Foundation, SF Pride, SF Leather Alliance, and many others.⁷³ Beginning in the 1980s and continuing through today, the venue has hosted over 2,000 Beer Busts and fundraisers.⁷⁴ In addition to fundraising and activism, the Eagle also served as a venue for AIDS victims' memorial services, in some cases including the victims' ashes being scattered onsite.⁷⁵

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Kenyon Interview.

⁶⁵ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁶⁷ Susan Stryker and Jim Van Buskirk, *Gay by the Bay* (San Francisco: Chronicle Books, 1996), 124.

 ⁶⁸ "San Francisco Drag King Contest," Accessed February 12, 2021 via <u>http://www.sfdragkingcontest.com/aboutus.php</u>.
 ⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ Goldfarb Interview.

⁷¹ Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative*, page 2.

⁷² Callahan Interview.

⁷³ Fiske Interview.

⁷⁴ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

Previous bar manager Terry Thompson is credited for spearheading numerous fundraising events to help the rapidly growing number of AIDS patients. Terry created events that became classic fund-raisers in the SoMa bar scene including Halloween's "Leather and Feathers" costume contest the immensely popular Sunday fundraising Beer Busts, and numerous others.⁷⁶ In 1985, Thompson reported "We have raised over \$100,000 at the Eagle for AIDS in the past few years and it has been raised because there has been no federal funding.⁷⁷ During the first 11 years of fundraising, over \$5 million for AIDS charities were raised.⁷⁸ AEF, originally known as the AIDS Fund and S.F. AIDS Fund, founded by Rick Booth and others, was a major beneficiary of many of the Eagle's events.⁷⁹ AEF provided financial assistance to people living with HIV and AIDS. AEF later merged with the PRC, which provided additional services largely for people living with HIV and AIDS. Thompson also did two AIDS fundraising street fairs, one in 1987 and one in 1988, both on 12th Street between Harrison Street and Bernice Alley.⁸⁰

Rita Rockett, a bar patron, was a good friend of staff member Dennis Yount, one of San Francisco's first AIDS victims. Upon visiting Dennis in the hospital Rita had the idea to host brunches at San Francisco General Hospital Ward 5A and 5B, the early 1980s AIDS wards, to boost patient morale.⁸¹ The parties grew into "Rita's Sunday Brunches" and to help support these brunches, Rita would host Beer Bust fundraisers on the Eagle's patio which continued through the early 1990s.⁸² Sunday Beer Busts remain as arguably the Eagle's best known recurring events, often raising thousands of dollars in just a few hours for charitable causes. While causes have largely been HIV/AIDS, other causes have included breast cancer, homelessness, and suicide prevention.⁸³



gagle Patio - Trungen



Above: Renowned homoerotic artist Tom of Finland (left) & co-founder of Tom of Finland Co. Durk Dehner (right) on Eagle Patio at 1985 fundraiser. Photo Credit: Robert Pruzan. Below: 1985 Leather and Feather Contest. Image Source: Bay Area Reporter November 7, 1985.

⁷⁶ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, page 6.

⁷⁷ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

⁷⁸ Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative,* page 18.

⁷⁹ Callahan Interview.

⁸⁰ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, pages 6-7.

⁸¹ Kenyon Interview.

⁸² Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative*, page 3.

⁸³ Callahan Interview.

The Bare Chest Calendar (BCC) is a well-known San Francisco-based annual AIDS charity fundraising effort, and has a strong association with the Eagle. The BCC began at the Arena (399 9th St.) as a promotional effort for one year until the venue closed. Thompson, then an Arena staff member, moved to manage the Eagle in 1985, taking the BCC along with him and developing it into a fundraiser for AEF. Contestants were required to compete in a weekly contest to be featured on the calendar. Contestants also participated in Dinner Date Auctions as an additional fundraiser, taking place at Sunday Beer Busts.⁸⁴ The BCC remained at the Eagle through 1999 until Gardiner and Banks took ownership of the venue, and began TNL in place. The BCC then moved to the Powerhouse, where Mr. Marcus continued to serve as MC until 2000.⁸⁵ However, the Eagle continued to support the BCC in other ways, including Beer Bust fundraisers. Over the BCC's lifetime it has raised approximately \$3 Million for HIV/AIDS charities, with recent years exceeding \$200,000 of fundraising annually.86

In observance of Worlds AIDS Day, on December 1, 2015, the National AIDS Memorial Grove awarded the entire San Francisco Leather community with the Thom Weyand Unsung Hero Award, for their response to HIV and AIDS. This award credited the community with their early and meaningful response to AIDS, establishing charitable organizations to help cover the victims living expenses, provide legal aid, and more.⁸⁷ The Eagle organized busses to take several hundred people to the Grove to celebrate the award. John B. Cunningham, the Executive Director of the Grove is quoted as⁸⁸:





Above: 1985 Godfather's Day Beer Bust and Auction flier. Image Credit: Univ. of Southern California Libraries.

Below: April 1993 Bare Chest Calendar Contestants. Image Source: Bay Area Reporter, February 13, 1992.

⁸⁶ Rich Interview.

⁸⁴ Goldfarb Interview.

⁸⁵ Ibid.

⁸⁷ Cision Distribution, "Surviving Voices: Enduring Stories Of Hope." Accessed April 5, 2021 via

https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/surviving-voices-enduring-stories-of-hope-300186668.html.

⁸⁸ Race Bannon, "Unsung Heroes: Leather Community Acknowledged on World AIDS Day". *Bay Area Reporter*, December 13, 2015.

"We were so honored to recognize the San Francisco leather community with the 2015 Thom Weyand Unsung Hero award. The Grove's mission is to ensure the lives of people who have died from AIDS are not forgotten and the story is known by future generations. The story of the leather community's response from day one in the face of such profound loss has been one of action, compassion and love, and will forever be a lesson for those who follow. The National AIDS Memorial strives to reach all who seek to heal and to be heard, and on World AIDS Day hundreds saw and listened to their story. On behalf of the National AIDS Memorial, congratulations and thank you for being a beacon of hope."

• Recent Events (2000s to present)

More recent events have also been identified as integral to the Eagle's unique cultural legacy. In 2013, after a decision was made to no longer display a Leather flag at the Castro MUNI station, a large metal flag pole with the Leather flag was installed at the patio.⁸⁹ More recently, the development of the world's first Leather-themed outdoor public plaza, the Eagle Plaza began. In conjunction with the construction of the development at 1532 Harrison Street, the city's In-Kind Agreement program was used to fund a plaza on 12th Street between Harrison and Bernice Streets. This includes an 80' flag pole for the Leather Flag and Leather pride-themed crosswalks, installed in 2020 and 2021 respectively. Fundraising events, in many cases hosted by the Eagle, were a source of funds assisting with certain elements of the plaza.⁹⁰

According to SoMA LEATHER & LGBTQ Cultural District Manager Cal Callahan, as of 2020, there were only around 14 SoMa businesses catering to Leather/LGBTQ Communities.⁹¹ The Covid-19 global pandemic led to the loss of a few more, including the Stud, a long-running SoMa dance club. While the Eagle has been temporarily closed through the Covid-19 pandemic, per conversation with business owner Lex Montiel, the venue plans to reopen. However, given the Covid-19 pandemic represents a temporary break in the Eagle's operations, 2020 was identified as the POS end date.

Criterion 2 - People

The Eagle has long served as a social space for a countless number of historically significant individuals, collectively contributing to its unparalleled cultural importance for Leather and/or LGBTQ communities both locally and globally. The following individuals have been identified as significant to the Leather community⁹², and are specifically associated with the Eagle. This list is not intended as an exhaustive list of prominent figures within SoMa's Leather/LGBTQ history, but rather a list of those individuals whose historically significant work is closely tied to the Eagle. Many others have utilized the space in ways which have undoubtably contributed to the Eagle's legacy, though may have stronger ties with other spaces, for which historical significance has or could be evaluated. Being listed below, however, is not to preclude other spaces from being evaluated for historical significance due to their associations with these individuals.

⁸⁹ Fiske Interview.

⁹⁰ Goldfarb Interview.

⁹¹ Callahan Interview.

⁹²Terry Thompson, Alan Selby and Marcus Hernandez are three of the twenty-eight people honored with bootprints along Ringold Alley between 8th and 9th Streets. These bootprints were installed as part of the "Leather Memoir" project, which commemorates the area's history. Ringold Alley served as a late-night gay cruising spot prior to the onset of AIDS, and was the original location of the Up Your Alley Fair, beginning in 1985. <u>https://www.artandarchitecture-sf.com/ringold-alleys-</u> <u>leather-memoir.html</u>. Accessed May 7, 2021.

• Marcus Hernandez (1932-2009)

Marcus Hernandez, commonly known as Mr. Marcus, was a wellknown Leather personality. Born in Los Angeles on March 22, 1932 as Gilbert Hernandez, Hernandez married Marian Givens in 1952, with whom he had four sons.⁹³ Hernandez moved to San Francisco from Los Angeles following his divorce in 1968, the same year he came out as homosexual.⁹⁴ Upon moving, Hernandez managed various San Francisco Leather bars for 12 years, and also served as the Appointment Secretary for then-Mayor Joseph Alioto circa early 1970's.⁹⁵

Along with Terry Thompson, Marcus played a critical role in the success of early events and fundraisers which the Eagle became known for, including MCing all of the BCC contests (both while at the Eagle and later at the Powerhouse).⁹⁶ Also known as "Marcus the Merciless", as he was notorious for posing probing, embarrassing questions to contestants.⁹⁷ Marcus is perhaps best known as Leather Columnist for the Bay Area Reporter, a position which he held for 38 years, starting in 1972. His columns were filled with details on Leather contests, as well as gossip, and he viewed his platform as an opportunity to educate the non-



Thumbnail photo of Mr. Marcus from his Bay Area Reporter Column. Image Source: Bay Area Reporter, September 12, 1985.

Leather LGBTQ community about Leather culture. His column was also used to bolster the visibility of non-profits, including AEF. Additionally a photographer, Marcus photographed Leather contests worldwide, and judged an estimated 250 contests.⁹⁶ Hernandez also contributed articles and photographs to Drummer Magazine, the Leather Journal, and other publications.⁹⁹ He was also involved with the Imperial Court of San Francisco¹⁰⁰, one of the largest and oldest LGBT organizations in the world, and in 1972, while working for Mayor Alioto, he became the first Emperor of the Imperial Court.¹⁰¹ Hernandez passed away on October 8, 2009, due to complications from diabetes and arteriosclerosis.

- ⁹⁶ Goldfarp Interview.
- ⁹⁷ Rich Interview.
- ⁹⁸ Ibid.

⁹⁹ Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Marcus Hernandez (Mister Marcus) collection, 2011-03," collection held by GLBT Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8n01bzg/.</u> ¹⁰⁰ The Imperial Court of San Francisco was established by José Julio Sarria in 1965. Sarria, a proud openly gay Latino and drag queen is an iconic figure in the early years of activism for LGBT civil rights, including being the first openly gay candidate for public office, co-founding the Society for Individual Rights, and co-founding the Tavern Guild. By 1995, there

were 60 Imperial Courts and Empires throughout the U.S., Canada and Mexico. (<u>http://www.imperialcouncilsf.org/founder.html</u>. Accessed May 6, 2021).

 ⁹³ Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Marcus Hernandez (Mister Marcus) collection, 2011-03,"
 collection held by GLBT Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8n01bzg/.
 ⁹⁴ Ibid.

⁹⁵Cynthia Laird, "B.A.R. leather columnist Marcus Hernandez dies". *Bay Area Reporter*, October 9, 2009.

¹⁰¹ Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Marcus Hernandez (Mister Marcus) collection, 2011-03," collection held by GLBT Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8n01bzg/.</u>

Article 10 Landmark Designation Fact Sheet San Francisco Eagle 396-398 12th Street

• Alan Selby (1929 – 2004)

A well-known personality in the SoMa Leather scene, and often called "The Mayor of Folsom Street", as well as "Daddy Alan". Born in London, Selby served as a medic and nurse in World War II. After the War he became a gentleman's clothier, at which point his interest and skills in leatherwork began to develop.¹⁰² Cultural and fashion trends of London's swinging sixties further inspired his professional interest in Leather. During this time period he also familiarized himself with the aesthetic of the homosexual fetish underground.¹⁰³

In 1969 Selby made his first visit to San Francisco, where he had his first S/M experience and toured local Leather shops, piquing his interest in opening his own.¹⁰⁴ Upon returning to London he joined his first Leather club, called the Sixty-Nine Club of the United Kingdom where he met and befriended renowned homoerotic artist Tom of Finland.¹⁰⁵ Around this time he also met his lover Peter Jacklin, who was skilled in leathercraft.¹⁰⁶ While still in London, Selby and Jacklin established Leather Unlimited, a small factory and outlet. ¹⁰⁷ He established connections in major cities like New York, and in 1972 worked with the owners of "Leather-n-Things" in San Francisco's Castro District. For much of the 1970s, Selby traveled regularly between London and San Francisco, as well as numerous other world class cities for business.¹⁰⁸





Above: Alan Selby commemorated on Ringold Alley's Leather Memoir. Photo Credit: Planning Department Staff. Below: Alan Selby at the Mr. S Leather store on 7th Street in San Francisco (circa 1980). Photograph by Alexander V. Areno.

 ¹⁰² Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Alan Selby collection, 1999-63," collection held by GLBT
 Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8q81m0m/?query=alan+selby.
 ¹⁰³ Leatherpedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://www.leatherpedia.org/alan-selby/.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid.

 ¹⁰⁷ Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Alan Selby collection, 1999-63," collection held by GLBT
 Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8q81m0m/?query=alan+selby.
 ¹⁰⁸ Leatherpedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://www.leatherpedia.org/alan-selby/.

In 1979, Selby and Jacklin moved to San Francisco, bringing their business with them. On June 17, 1979, the first Mr. S Leather ("S" for Selby) opened on 7th Street. Mr. S. Leather remains open today as a well-known a retailer and manufacturer of bondage, fetish and sex gear, at 385 8th Street near Harrison Street. Mr. S. Leather also operated a store within the Eagle circa the late 1980's – 1998.¹⁰⁹

Jacklin became sick and died of AIDS in the 1980s. At this time, Selby shifted his focus to fighting AIDS and supporting its victims. Selby sold Mr. S Leather to community member Richard Hunter, and turned to fundraising and volunteer work.¹¹⁰ Amongst Selby's countless events at the Eagle were the "Leather Daddy" and "Leather Daddy's Boy" contests, which continued well into the late 2000s.¹¹¹ Many of his events served as fundraisers for AIDS-related charities and services, including AEF, for which he raised over one million dollars.¹¹² In addition to raising money, his events served to recirculate the local community's "material culture". As people died, their leather estates were often donated to Selby's auctions which both helped to generate funds as well as find new homes. Some of his items were also donated to archival collections, including Gayle Rubin's personal collection, the GLBT Historical Society, and the Leather Archives and Museum in Chicago.¹¹³ Additionally, Selby served as a long-term volunteer at the San Francisco



California Assemblyman Mark Leno, right, presents a proclamation to the late Alan Selby on the occasion of his 75th birthday gala held earlier this year in San Francisco, just one of many accolades Selby received during his lifetime.

Alan Selby, on his 75th birthday, receiving a proclamation from California Assemblyman Mark Leno.

Photo Credit: Bay Area Reporter May 6, 2004.

General Hospital AIDS Ward, including providing patient massages, and also served on numerous boards including the Stop AIDS project.¹¹⁴ At the age of 75, Selby died of complications from emphysema. Upon his 2004 passing, around 400 people gathered at the Eagle to celebrate his life.¹¹⁵ Selby received numerous awards and honors throughout his life and posthumously, including the Steve Maidhof Award for National or International Work by the National Leather Association International in 1988, Man of the Year as part of the Pantheon of Leather Awards in 1989, the Lifetime Achievement Award as part of the Pantheon Leather Awards in 2004, a 2013 Leather Hall of Fame Induction, and a 2019 GLBT Historical Society Museum Exhibition.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁵ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, 1980-2005.

¹⁰⁹ Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

¹¹⁰ Leatherpedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via http://www.leatherpedia.org/alan-selby/.

¹¹¹ Kenyon biography.

¹¹² Leatherpedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>http://www.leatherpedia.org/alan-selby/</u>.

¹¹³ Rubin Interview.

¹¹⁴ Julian Guthrie, "Alan Selby -- Beloved Leader in Leather Community / 'Daddy Alan' is Remembered for Gregarious, Generous Spirit". *San Francisco Gate,* May 11, 2004. Accessed May 8, 2021 via <u>https://www.sfgate.com/bayarea/article/Alan-Selby-beloved-leader-in-leather-community-2780553.php</u>.

¹¹⁶ Wikipedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Alan_Selby</u>.

Article 10 Landmark Designation Fact Sheet San Francisco Eagle 396-398 12th Street

• Terry Thompson (1940-1994)

Terry Thompson managed the Eagle from 1984-1994 and is widely credited as the driving force behind the venue's extensive fundraising efforts. To date these efforts have raised millions of dollars for AIDS-related, and other charities, including over \$5 Million during the 11 years of Thompson's management.¹¹⁷ Prior to residing in San Francisco, Thompson lived in Los Angeles, serving as commander-in-chief of the Academy, an upscale gay restaurant, as well as a member of the Oedipus MC, a gay motorcycle club established in 1958. He moved to San Francisco to first manage bars, including the Arena, the home of the original BCC. While the then owner of the Arena conceived the idea of the BCC, Thompson brought the BCC with him to the Eagle the following year, after the Arena shut down, and transitioned it into the AIDS charity fundraiser which it remains today.¹¹⁸ Other events which grew and flourished under Thompson's leadership included, Leathers and Feathers, Halloween's pumpkin-carving



Above: Terry Thompson commemorated on Ringold Alley's Leather Memoir. Photo Credit: Planning Department Staff. Below: 1990 Terry Thompson Day declaration. Image Source: Bay Area Reporter, October 4, 1990.

contest; the Easter Egg coloring contest; donations for lighting on the bar's Christmas tree; and Sunday Beer Busts.¹¹⁹ Thompson also did two street fairs, in 1987 and 1988, on 12th Street between Harrison Street and Bernice Alley.¹²⁰ His strong public relation skills were credited as having lended to the success of the venue's events during this time period.¹²¹ Thompson was the recipient of several awards and honors including 1985 and 1988 Gay Community Awards (Bar Manager of the Year), 1987 Citation of Community Service (John Molinari and the San Francisco Board of Supervisors), 1990 Declaration of "Terry Thompson Day" (by the Mayor of San Francisco Art Agnos), 1992 honor at Castro Lions Annual Anniversary, 1993 Cable Car Awards (Special Award), and 1994 AEF Awards Dinner (Zachary Long Hall of Fame Award).¹²² Thompson passed away on November 5, 1994.

¹¹⁷ Gary Kenyon, SF Eagle History, page 6.

¹¹⁸ Mr. Marcus, "Ode to a Fallen Brother", *Bay Area Reporter*, November 10, 1994.

¹¹⁹ Kenyon, Eagle Biography.

¹²⁰ Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel, *Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative*, page 5.

¹²¹ Mr. Marcus, "Ode to a Fallen Brother", *Bay Area Reporter*.

¹²² Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives, "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle, "1980-2005.

• Robert Uyvari (1941-1986)

Robert Uyvari, originally from Wisconsin, was a gay artist known for his homoerotic paintings and drawings, and whose work was distributed internationally. Uyvari's work included the cover art displayed in the Places of Interest Map Guide Book for three years, approximately 1980-1984.¹²³ He spent his time between San Francisco and Milwaukee from 1975-1984, and won numerous "Cable Car Awards" for his artwork while in San Francisco. The Eagle's first ever art exhibit, in 1981, spotlighted Uyvari's work. His work was also featured at the Arena, and he designed the Eagle graphic which was used on all T-shirts, as well as the iconic Eagle poster which was displayed in the bar.¹²⁴ The poster was also widely distributed, with thousands of copies mailed out throughout the world, thus helping to foster Leather culture internationally.¹²⁵ He also designed posters for other venues contemporary to this time period. Furthermore his work was featured at a number of Milwaukee gay bars over the years.¹²⁶ Additional work specific to Milwaukee included the design and construction supervision of the city's first large outdoor patio for a gay bar, the M&M club in 1980, and chief designer for Club 219 bar.¹²⁷ Uyvari died of AIDS in 1986, and was survived by his lover Ron, both parents, four brothers, and a sister. His wishes were for his ashes to be scattered over the San Francisco Bay. Years after his death his artwork continued to be auctioned at various AIDS fundraising events. Furthermore, his artwork remains associated with the Eagles's brand identity decades later, including continued occasional use on event promotional fliers.



A second se

Above: Robert Uyvari. Below: Promotional poster for 1993 Mr. S.F. Eagle contest (used after Uyvari's death). Images Source (both): History of Gay and Lesbian Life in Milwaukee, Wisconsin.

¹²³ History of Gay and Lesbian Life in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, "Robert Anthony Uyvari." Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>http://www.mkelgbthist.org/people/peo-u/uyvari_robert.htm.</u>

¹²⁴ Kenyon interview.

¹²⁵ Ibid.

¹²⁶ Ibid.

¹²⁷ History of Gay and Lesbian Life in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, "Robert Anthony Uyvari." Accessed May 7, 2021 via http://www.mkelgbthist.org/people/peo-u/uyvari robert.htm.

Property Description

The subject site lies on an approximately 5,153 square feet, irregularly shaped rectangular lot at the corner of 12th and Harrison Streets with approximately 79.5 feet of street frontage along 12th Street, and 60.5 feet along Harrison Street. The property includes both indoor and outdoor components including the main corner building with indoor bar, stage, DJ booth, and an indoor/outdoor bar; a spacious patio with stage; and a rear building with an enclosed bar, walk-in cooler, and storage.

Exterior

The building is comprised of multiple structures with varying roof forms. The corner one-story building portion with gabled roof, which houses the front indoor bar space, includes a northeast facing primary elevation roughly 22' in length with three structural bays (12th Street elevation). The wood-framed building has no discernable architectural style and includes scored stucco cladding along the front façade. Façade ornamentation is relatively minimal, though a sinuously curved, darkly colored decorative stucco pattern projects along the front of the building from the ground level up to a few feet, wrapping into the recessed entryway. Front façade fenestration includes a segmented arched opening with a recessed primary entryway, solid double entry doors with a glazed transom, and a scored concrete step. Additional building fenestration to the right of the entryway consists of two slightly recessed fixed plate-glass wood-sash windows with arched stucco surrounds. The primary façade terminates in a cornice and a false front parapet that features a cartouche. Three flagholders with Leather flags are attached to the false parapet. Additional features include simple "398" address numbering directly above the front entryway.

The flat roofed portion of the building along 12th Street encloses the indoor/outdoor bar and is roughly 14.5 feet in length. This part of the building is fronted by a solid wooden fence with vertical planks. Fenestration is minimal, with the exception of a recessed egress door which serves to access the indoor/outdoor bar. The fence further extends approximately 43 more feet to enclose the rear patio. A set of recessed double doors lies midway along this portion of the fence, providing access to the patio. The Eagle's logo is painted to span the double doors and an artistic rendering of eagle wings in the Leather flag colors (white, blue, black, and red) is painted along the fence's exterior.

Along the secondary Harrison Street elevation, the main portion of the building extends nearly 47 feet and is clad in channel drop wood siding. The secondary façade is free from fenestration, and largely free from ornamentation with the exception of several metal flagholders, equi-distantly spaced just below the roofline. The asphalt-shingled front-facing gable roof, can be viewed from the side, which extends the depth of this portion of the building. The remainder of the side facade is clad with the same siding material, though flat-roofed and projects slightly south of the rest of the building.

Interior

Once inside the building at the primary bar space, to the left is a bar with three serving stations, extending about nine feet from the south wall. The remainder of this portion of the building is generally left open for socializing and watching performances, as well as space for a pool table which is frequently kept out. A vaulted ceiling defines this portion of the building. To the rear is the indoor stage, elevated a few feet above the ground, and measuring approximately 340 square feet. To the right of the stage is an enclosed wood-framed DJ booth with chain-link metal fencing material beginning midway up the booth's exterior on the south and east sides for viewing the stage and crowd. Additionally, smaller partitioned rooms within the main building include an ADA-accessible restroom, office, and utility room.

The northeastern portion of the main building includes the indoor/outdoor bar. The bar includes two serving stations, one which can be accessed from the inside, and the other from the outside via the patio. Above the outdoor portion are wooden fold-up panels which create an awning when open.

Patio

The outdoor open-air concrete patio is nearly 1,400 square feet, not including the stage, and largely kept open for socializing. A tall wooden gazebo roughly 10 x 25 feet is situated on the southern portion of the patio which provides relief from the sun, and includes wooden panels installed partway up along its four posts for holding drinks. An additional shade structure is draped between the gazebo and the main building. A porcelain trough functions as a shared urinal, and is around 6 feet long, attached to the southern wall and filling much of the small room it is located in which opens onto the patio. At the eastern edge of the patio, just south of the recessed doorway is a tall metal flagpole with the Leather flag. The interior of the fence facing the patio is adorned with painted wooden art pieces characteristically depicting men of the classic Leather aesthetic. The stage, elevated a few feet above grade, is roughly 450 square feet and located in the northeastern corner of the patio. A wooden bench lines the northern portion of the stage, to provide seating when the stage is not being used for an event.

Rear Building

An additional one-story building is sited at the lot's northwest corner. The building includes two rooms, with the northernmost room used for storage. The other room includes the third bar, open to the patio, with 3-4 serving stations, and a walk-in cooler. In front of the bar is an open area which has been used as a meeting space by a variety of community groups which utilize the venue.

Property History

According to the Assessor's Report found in the Planning Department records, the subject property was erected in 1906. However previous Sanborn maps indicate prior development on-site. Specifically both the 1889 and 1899-1900 Sanborn map indicate four parcels roughly aligning with the one parcel that now includes the Eagle (bar and patio). This includes the corner parcel whose primary façade faces 12th Street, two additional 12th Street-oriented parcels to the northwest, and one Harrison Street-oriented parcel to the southwest. The corner parcel facing 12th Street included a two-story saloon with a store/grocery. The nearly square structure was roughly 45' x 50' with a shingle roof, a first story front façade roof overhang and a smaller second story roof overhang at the rear of the building's north façade over what appears to be a setback between the neighboring northwest property. According to the 1899-1900 Sanborn map the subject property's address was 346-350 12th Street. The two adjacent 12th St. facing parcels area also developed with 1-2 story structures, though the maps include no indication of their uses. The Harrison Street-facing parcel includes a one-story dwelling unit, addressed 1602 (1889) and 1608 (1899). A few small rear additions were made to the property between 1889 and 1899. No other details on the original structures' histories were uncovered, and likely they were destroyed in the 1906 Great San Francisco Earthquake and Fires given the devastating effects this disaster had on the SoMa neighborhood as well as other parts of the City.¹²⁸

¹²⁸ Page and Turnbull, Inc., South of Market Area, Historic Context Statement, page 46.

The original 1906 building permit was not discovered after a search through the Department of Building Inspection's files, nor did staff research did not uncover any information about the builder from other sources such as the San Francisco Chronicle archives. The 1913 Sanborn map identifies three separate parcels facing 12th street on what is now one parcel (that includes the original building and the outdoor patio). The corner parcel, roughly 25' x 60 ' consists of a one story 12-foot building, now serving as the primary enclosed portion of the Eagle where the main bar lies, whose use is identified as "Saloon," with the address 350 12th St. The main portion of the building is roughly 25' in length along 12th Street and nearly 50 feet in depth along Harrison Street, matching the current dimensions. The remainder of the parcel, to the rear along Harrison street, is a separate one-story room, though joined with main building, enclosing the area the now includes the indoor stage. The adjacent northern parcel consists of a smaller one story 10' tall structure, used for storage, addressed 348A 12th St., and roughly 15' in length covering the full 12th Street frontage, though only approximately 25' in-depth. This is the area that now houses the indoor/outdoor bar. Its 12th street dimensions roughly align with the current dimensions, indicating this could be original. The third parcel in from the corner of 12th and Harrison Streets, the area now covering the Eagle's patio, is addressed 346-348 12th Street and appears to consist of a 1-story 12-foot building with a hipped roof, though no specific use is indicated.

The 1950 Sanborn map conveys fairly similar information for this property with a few changes. While the corner and northwest adjacent parcel appear to remain separate, the smaller structure on the adjacent parcel appears to now be attached to the main saloon. Furthermore the two structures now share an address of 388 12th Street. The third northwest parcel appears to remain developed, with the same building footprint as before, labeled A. & Stge. (Automobile and Storage per Sanborn Map acronyms), with an address of 386 12th Street.

The 1998 Sanborn maps identifies the site developed more closely to what it is today, including all three parcels now merged into one. The main enclosed bar structure remains, along with the attached rear and side rooms which previously existed, all similarly dimensioned to what was previously there. Three one story additions now appear including a side rectangular addition on twelve street and two non-street visible roughly square additions facing the interior, located in the general areas that are now used for restrooms/office space. The building which previously existed on what was the third northwest parcel form the corner (previously labeled A & Stge) was since demolished. In its place is the unenclosed area making up the Eagle Patio, labeled "parking".

Through City Directory searches of the various addresses amongst the few parcels which now make up the Eagle (bar and outdoor patio), staff research yielded limited information about past occupants. The space that is now the Eagle's patio, originally appears to have been used as the "Denver Horse Market" per a listing in the 1907 City Directory. No other information on specific occupants was yielded about this property. Circa 1910s-1920s, the corner property (now the enclosed portion of the Eagle Bar) was occupied by John Schwormstede. Earlier in his residency Schwormstede appears to have used the site for liquor retail, though liquor is no longer mentioned in the 1920s City Directory, likely due to prohibition. Circa 1930s-1940s the site was occupied by Walter and/or Elisha O'Leary, who also appear to have used it as a retail liquor space post-prohibition. Circa 1950s – mid-1970s the site appears to be the location of the Buzz's Shamrock Inn Tavern. From the late 1970s through 1980, prior to the 1981 establishment of the Eagle, the site appears to have been vacant. No historic photographs, interior or exterior, were uncovered through staff research, of the subject property prior to its use as the Eagle.

Bibliography

Books & Reports

Graves, Donna and Shayne Watson. *Citywide Historic Context Statement for LGBTQ History in San Francisco*. Prepared for the City and County of San Francisco, March 2016.

"How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation," National Register Bulletin, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 1995, 44.

Kenyon, Gary. SF Eagle History. (Unpublished Report, 2014).

Page and Turnbull. *South of Market Area, Historic Context Statement,* Prepared for the City and County of San Francisco, June 2009.

Rubin, Gayle. "The Miracle Mile: South of Market and Gay Male Leather, 1962-1997" in James Brook, Chris Carlsson & Nancy J. Peters, eds., *Reclaiming San Francisco: History, Politics, Culture: A City Lights Anthology* (San Francisco, Calif: City Lights Books, 1998).

Stryker, Susan and Jim Van Buskirk. Gay by the Bay. San Francisco: Chronicle Books, 1996.

Western SOMA Citizens Planning Taskforce. *Recognizing, Protecting and Memorializing South of Market LGBTQ Social Heritage Neighborhood Resources,* 2011.

Interviews

Interviews were conducted by Planning Department Staff Member Alex Westhoff, as follows:

Lex Montiel (current SF Eagle Owner), March 10, 2021 Cal Callahan (SF LEATHER & LGBTQ Cultural District Manager), March 11, 2021 Bob Goldfarb (SF LEATHER & LGBTQ Cultural District President), March 12, 2021 Jon Ginoli (Pansy Division Lead Singer), March 17, 2021 Larry Rich (Bare Chest Calendar Big Daddy/CEO), March 19, 2021 Gary Kenyon (former SF Eagle Bartender), March 22, 2021 Gayle Rubin (Associate Professor of Anthropology, and Women's and Gender Studies University of Michigan/SOMA Historian), March 26, 2021 Peter Fiske (SF Leather Community Leader/Regular Eagle Patron), March 30, 2021

As interview follow-ups, Cal Callahan, Bob Goldfarb and Gayle Rubin reviewed the draft Fact Sheet for accuracy.

Newspapers & Periodicals & Archival Research

Bay Area Reporter Digital Archives (1980-2005) - "A Snapshot Timeline of the San Francisco Eagle" Compiled by Jeffrey Wayne on behalf of the San Francisco LEATHER & LGBTQ Cultural District, 2021.

Bannon, Race. "Unsung Heroes: Leather Community Acknowledged on World AIDS Day". *Bay Area Reporter*, December 13, 2015.

Laird, Cynthia. "B.A.R. leather columnist Marcus Hernandez dies". Bay Area Reporter, October 9, 2009.

Mr. Marcus. "Ode to a Fallen Brother", Bay Area Reporter, November 10, 1994.

SF Eagle Staff. SF Eagle Entertainment Roster, (Unpublished Document, 2021)

Public Records

Leon, Mike and Lex Montiel. Legacy Business Registry (The Eagle) Application – Historical Narrative. April 5, 2017

Watson, Shayne E. Historic Resources Evaluation, 280-282 7th Street, July 2017.

Websites

Cision Distribution, "Surviving Voices: Enduring Stories Of Hope." Accessed April 5, 2021 via <u>https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/surviving-voices-enduring-stories-of-hope-300186668.html</u>

GayTravel4U, "San Francisco Leather Walk 2021," Accessed April 8, 2021 via <u>https://www.gaytravel4u.com/event/san-francisco-leather-walk/</u>

Guthrie, Julian, "Alan Selby -- Beloved Leader in Leather Community / 'Daddy Alan' is Remembered for Gregarious, Generous Spirit". *San Francisco Gate*, May 11, 2004. Accessed May 8, 2021 via <u>https://www.sfgate.com/bayarea/article/Alan-Selby-beloved-leader-in-leather-community-2780553.php</u>

History of Gay and Lesbian Life in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, "Robert Anthony Uyvari." Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>http://www.mkelgbthist.org/people/peo-u/uyvari_robert.htm</u>

The Gay Highwayman. Accessed May 6, 2021 via https://gayhighwaymen.com/

The Imperial Council of San Francisco, "Founder". Accessed May 6, 2021 via <u>http://www.imperialcouncilsf.org/founder.html</u>

Leatherpedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via http://www.leatherpedia.org/alan-selby/

Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Marcus Hernandez (Mister Marcus) collection, 2011-03," collection held by GLBT Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8n01bzg/</u>

Online Archives of California, "Collection overview to the Alan Selby collection, 1999-63," collection held by GLBT Historical Society. Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/c8q81m0m/?query=alan+selby</u>

Public Art and Architecture from Around the World, "Ringold Alley's Leather Memoir." Accessed May 7, 2021 via <u>https://www.artandarchitecture-sf.com/ringold-alleys-leather-memoir.html</u>

SF Gay History, "Castro Gay Bars." Accessed May 9, 2021 via <u>http://www.sfgayhistory.com/neighborhoods/castro-gay-bars/</u>

"San Francisco Drag King Contest." Accessed 2/12/21. http://www.sfdragkingcontest.com/aboutus.php

Wikipedia, "Alan Selby." Accessed May 7, 2021 via https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Alan_Selby
ATTACHMENT B





21 June 2003 (Click Photo to Zoom)

KRON Coverage of the Last Night in 1984

San Francisco Landmark #144 Hoffman Grill Building AKA Hoffman's Grill 619 Market Street Between New Montgomery and 2nd Streets Built 1913

The Hoffman Grill Building was declared a San Francisco landmark in 1981.

Five years later, the old building was gutted and surrounded by a highrise during the period when the San Francisco Planning Department insisted that new highrise buildings wear funny hats.

Only a few old bricks were incorporated into the façade of the new building.



City Planning Commission Resolution 9141 dated 17 September 1981 described the demolished building:

This modest building, designed by Woodworth Wethered in the Edwardian Eclectic style, was clearly designed to complement the hearty, no nonsense attitude of the establishment it houses. Located in the smallest remaining building on lower Market Street (25' by 91.5'), Hoffman's has been at the same address since 1913.

The building is faced with unpainted tan pressed brick laid up in a handsome pattern that features a marble insert at each corner of the enframed window wall. The restraint and economy of the design, typical of a number of post fire buildings, is increasingly admired as its counterparts are being replaced in the downtown district.

Although landmark designation does not extend to the interior of privately owned buildings, it must be noted that within is an original appearing Edwardian space. It is dominated by a great carved mahogany bar, back bar, mirrors, and art glass light fixtures attributed to Louis C. Tiffany. This wonderful interior exhibits a patina of age and use that would be impossible to duplicate either through reassembling original pieces or modern reproductions. The paneling, skylights, and general ambiance of the room can not be replicated.

The 19th Century European oil paintings on the walls grew from a collection started by *M*. J. Sullivan the original owner.



30 June 1984

Historic Hoffman's Grill, last relic of the pre-World War I restaurants on Market Street, closed June 29 with toasts to a vanished era. Hearty German fare, salty waiters, generous drinks and authentic atmosphere of stained glass, murky paintings and slow fans - that was Hoffman's.

"I really love this place," said owner Josef Betz, 44, who came to this country from Bavaria in 1962, was a Hoffman's waiter and ended up owning the joint.

He agreed to a \$3 million settlement last month to vacate so that a 19-story office building can rise. Betz and his wife, Heide, an art gallery owner, get to keep \$4.5 million in furniture and fixtures, leaving only a shell behind. Many customers asked Betz if he would move his restaurant.

"I hope so," Betz said. "We're looking around."

From the San Francisco Chronicle Archives



Façadism

Wikipedia defines Façadism (or Façadomy) as the practice of demolishing a building but leaving its façade intact for the purposes of building new structures in it or around it.

The International Charter for the Conservation and Restoration of Monuments and Sites (<u>The</u> <u>Venice Charter of 1964</u>) provided the doctrinal foundation for the modern preservation movement.

Although the United States did not participate in the preparation of the charter, the charter provided the basis for the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation. <u>US/ICOMOS</u> was founded in the 1960s to foster heritage conservation and historic preservation.

Article 1 of the Venice Charter

The concept of a historic monument embraces not only the single architectural work but also the urban or rural setting in which is found the evidence of a particular civilization, a significant development or a historic event. This applies not only to great works of art but also to more modest works of the past which have acquired cultural significance with the passing of time.

Article 7 of the Venice Charter

A monument is inseparable from the history to which it bears witness and from the setting in which it occurs. The moving of all or part of a monument cannot be allowed except where the safeguarding of that monument demands it or where it is justified by national or international interest of paramount importance.

Article 13 of the Venice Charter

Additions cannot be allowed except in so far as they do not detract from the interesting parts of the building, its traditional setting, the balance of its composition and its relation with its surroundings.

Paul Golderberger, writing in the New York Times on 15 July 1985 (Façadism on the Rise: Preservation or Illusion?), gives an argument against urban façadism.

For façadism holds out a great temptation. It seems, on the surface, to give both sides what they want. The small, older buildings valued by preservationists appear to be saved, while the large new ones developers seek can still be built.

But while façadism pretends to a certain earnestness, it is at bottom rather pernicious. For the compromise it represents is not really preservation at all. To save only the facade of a building is not to save its essence; it is to turn the building into a stage set, into a cute toy intended to make a skyscraper more palatable. And the street becomes a kind of Disneyland of false fronts.

Façadism in San Francisco:

- Belli Building, 722 Montgomery Street
- Borel and Company, 440 Montgomery Street
- Engine Company No. 14, 1047 McAllister Street
- Genella Building, 726-728 Montgomery Street
- Hoffmann Grill Building, 619 Market Street
- Italian American Bank, 460 Montgomery Street
- <u>United States Mint & Subtreasury</u>, 608 Commercial Street

Some examples elsewhere:

• Minden Butter Manufacturing Company, Minden, NV

Prev | Next San Francisco County: List | Map California: List | Map

https://noehill.com/sf/landmarks/sf144.asp





<u>Sent via Electronic Mail</u>

October 17, 2021

Hon. Shamann Walton San Francisco Board of Supervisors City Hall Room 244 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: The Grubstake Restaurant

Dear President Walton and Supervisors:

On Tuesday, October 19th, you will hear an appeal challenging the preparation of a Mitigated Negative Declaration under CEQA for our proposed redevelopment of the Grubstake restaurant with 21 residential units and approximately 2,473 square feet of commercial space for the rebuilt Grubstake. While our attorney submitted a detailed letter on September 24, 2021, outlining all the reasons why this appeal is without merit and should be rejected, we wanted to submit a supplemental letter explaining who we are and further outlining our commitment to rebuild the Grubstake.

In 2015, we purchased the Grubstake restaurant, an iconic neighborhood restaurant with a rich cultural history associated with the LGBTQ+ community. As restaurant operators, we have always planned to operate the Grubstake restaurant as part of any redevelopment plan. From the very beginning, our submittals have always included the Grubstake and working with the community, key stakeholders and interested parties, we identified cultural features to be preserved, restored, or replicated. Retaining those features, reinstalling them and restoring the Grubstake is the fundamentally what this project proposes to do. Because it is the project, there is no question as to whether it will happen. The restoration of these key features is how the project itself is defined, shown as "Exhibit B" to the project approvals. It is also required by the improvement measures. Copies of the project description, "Exhibit B" and improvement measures are all attached. Moreover, they will be included in the notice of special restrictions (NSRs) recorded against title to the 1525 Pine Street property which means if there ever is a different owner in the future, they too will be subject to these requirements. Any changes to the rebuilding and restoration of the Grubstake would be a major project change and would require either a new project application or amended application that would need to be reviewed and approved by the City, including additional CEQA review.

Below is a list of the features of the Grubstake that are part of the project and required by the City's approval.

- Match the original footprint/orientation of the lunch wagon
- Match the existing scale and proportion of the lunch wagon
- Replicate the metal barrel vault ceiling
- Replicate the train car façade
- Reuse/replicate decorative lights and side globe lights
- Reuse existing windows where possible and where not possible, replicate to match existing



- Salvage, restore and reuse murals
- Reuse the existing Grubstake signage, including light box signage and neon lights
- Replicate the wooden bar
- Reuse/replicate the tile floor, chrome accents, linear counter and backless stool
- Retain the menu style and most-liked traditional dishes

While legally the City cannot require a business to operate, the City controls what can be built and the City will only allow the project to be built as proposed and approved which means that the key cultural features that make the Grubstake the Grubstake (i.e., large exterior "GRUBSTAKE" sign, lunch wagon façade, barrel roll vaulted ceiling, murals, lights, menu, etc.) must be reused, restored, replicated, or renovated.

To further ensure that the Grubstake's renovation addresses its importance as a LGBTQ+ community, we have worked with the LGBTQ+ community to provide additional oversight of our compliance with the project requirements. Specifically, we have entered into an agreement with Use the News Foundation, a California nonprofit founded in 1988 that focuses on education projects related to LGBTQ+ communities and their allies affected by discrimination based on sexual orientation and identity, race, age, religion, or national origin, to create the Grubstake Education Project. The Grubstake Education Project will include, among other things, an annual review of the Grubstake by Bill Lipsky, PhD, or any other individual identified by the Use the News Foundation, to confirm compliance with the project conditions of approval and improvement measures. It also requires development of an interpretive program focused on the history of the Grubstake restaurant and collaboration on hosting annual tour and LGBTQ+ history night at the Grubstake. We also have already begun to work with Architectural Resources Group ("ARG") on the terms for the salvage plan to be approved by the Planning Department. The salvage plan must be approved before the architectural addendum to the site permit, before issuance of any demolition or building permit, and proof of compliance with it will be required before issuance of a certificate of occupancy for any residential unit.

Finally, we are whole heartedly committed to continuing to operate the Grubstake. It is our key business and passion, and we thoroughly enjoy operating it day-to-day although in its current condition, it is unlikely to continue. The old lunch wagon and its additions and improvements cobbled together are not in good shape, costly to maintain and operate, and with COVID-19 the business barely pencils. But we love operating it. We love its history and our customers and know how important it is to the neighborhood and community. We are confident that once rebuilt and restored it will not only be less costly to maintain, but it will be a renovated haven for our LGBTQ+ and neighborhood customers to visit more regularly. We have taken every step legally possible to ensure that what makes the Grubstake the Grubstake (i.e., its culturally significant features) remain and ask you to reject the appeal and uphold the MND to ensure that the Grubstake continues its legacy as an LGBTQ+ establishment.

Thank you,

Ning Viget

Nick and Jimmy

Initial Study

1525 Pine Street

Planning Department Case No. 2015-009955ENV

A. Project Description

Project Location

The project site (Assessor's Block 0667, Lot 020) is a 3,000-square-foot rectangular parcel on the south side of Pine Street between Van Ness Avenue and Polk Street in San Francisco's Nob Hill neighborhood (see Figure 1). The project site is a through lot with one frontage on Pine Street and one frontage on Austin Street, and it is occupied by a one-story restaurant called Grubstake. The project site slopes up gradually from east to west (Polk Street to Van Ness Avenue) and from south to north (Austin Street to Pine Street). The project site is in the Polk Street Neighborhood Commercial District (NCD) and a 65-A Height and Bulk District.

Project Characteristics

The proposed project consists of demolishing the existing one-story restaurant and constructing an eight-story, 83-foot-tall building (plus an additional 17-foot-tall elevator penthouse) containing 21 dwelling units and approximately 2,855 square feet of commercial space. The existing restaurant, Grubstake, would vacate the premises during the demolition and construction period but would return to occupy the basement, ground floor, and mezzanine of the new building. The dwelling units would be on the second through eighth floors. The proposed project would not include any automobile parking, and the existing curb cut on Austin Street would be removed. A total of 32 bicycle parking spaces would be provided (28 Class 1 spaces in a storage room in the basement of the proposed building and two Class 2 spaces on both the Pine Street and Austin Street sidewalks adjacent to the project site). Usable open space for the residents of the proposed project would be provided in the form of a common roof deck. See Attachment A for the project plans.

A substantial amount of interior and exterior features of the existing building would be removed and reused and/or replicated in the new commercial space:¹

- Match the original footprint/orientation of the lunch wagon
- Match the existing scale and proportion of the lunch wagon
- Replicate the metal barrel vault ceiling
- Replicate the train car façade
- Reuse/replicate decorative lights and side globe lights
- Reuse existing windows where possible and where not possible, replicate to match existing

Project plans for 1525 Pine Street, Sheets G6.00 and G6.01, July 31, 2020 April 20, 2021. All documents cited in this Initial Study are available for review at the San Francisco Planning Department, 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400, San Francisco, California as part of the project file for Case No. 2015-009955ENV.

- Salvage, restore and reuse murals
- Reuse the existing Grubstake signage, including light box signage and neon lights
- Replicate the wooden bar
- Reuse/replicate the tile floor, chrome accents, linear counter and backless stools
- Retain the menu style and most-liked traditional dishes

In addition, the project sponsor would develop and implement an interpretive program that focuses on the history of the project site.² The primary goal of the interpretive program is to educate visitors and future residents about the property's historical themes, associations, and lost contributing features within broader historical, social, and physical landscape contexts. The interpretive program would include the installation of permanent on-site interpretive displays but may also include development of digital/virtual interpretive products. See Section E.3, Cultural Resources, of this initial study for more information.

Project Construction

Construction of the proposed project is expected to last 18 months. The proposed building would rest on a concrete mat slab foundation supported by drilled piers; pile driving would not be required. Construction of the proposed project would require excavation to a depth of up to 14 feet below ground surface and the removal of about 1,500 cubic yards of soil from the project site.

Project Approvals

The proposed project would require the following approvals:

Planning Commission

- Conditional Use Authorization to develop a lot larger than 2,499 square feet, establish a nonresidential use larger than 1,999 square feet, establish a restaurant on the ground floor, establish a liquor license, operate a business between the hours of 2:00 a.m. and 6:00 a.m., reuse the vintage projecting blade sign, and modify the required dwelling unit mix
- Granting of waivers under the Individually Requested State Density Bonus Program related to building height/bulk, rear yard, usable open space, permitted obstructions, dwelling unit exposure, setbacks on narrow streets, ground-floor ceiling height, and ground-floor transparency and fenestration.

Actions by Other City Departments

- Demolition Permit (*Planning Department and Department of Building Inspection*)
- Site/Building Permit (*Planning Department and Department of Building Inspection*)

Conditional Use Authorization by the Planning Commission constitutes the Approval Action for the proposed project. The Approval Action date establishes the start of the 30-day period for the appeal of the Final Mitigated Negative Declaration to the Board of Supervisors pursuant to Section 31.04(h) of the San Francisco Administrative Code.

² Project plans for 1525 Pine Street, Sheet G6.01, July 31, 2020 April 20, 2021.

1525 PINE

CONSTRUCTION OF MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING OVER RESTAURANT AND BASEMENT IMPLEMENTING THE INDIVIDUALLY REQUESTED STATE DENSITY BONUS

DESCRIPTION OF WORK

THE PROJECT CONSISTS OF THE DEMOLITION OF THE EXISTING SINGLE STORY COMMERCIAL STRUCTURE (CURRENTLY HOUSING THE "GRUBSTAKE DINER") ON THE LOT UNDER SEPARATE PERMIT (BPA #2018-0208-0778) AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW MIXED-USE EIGHT (8) STORY OVER BASEMENT STRUCTURE (BPA #2018-0208-0768) CONSISTING OF: GROUND FLOOR COMMERCIAL (THE "GRUBSTAKE DINER" WILL RE-INHABIT THIS NEW SPACE) AND THE RESIDENTIAL ENTRY; SEVEN (7) STORIES OF RESIDENTIAL OCCUPANCY (21 DWELLING UNITS); ROOF TOP COMMON OPEN SPACE; AND BASEMENT LEVEL SPACES AUXILIARY TO THE COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL USES.

"Exhibit B" to PC

Approval

THE PROJECT EXERCISES THE INDMIDUALLY REQUESTED STATE DENSITY BONUS PROGRAM (S. 206.6) TO ACHIEVE GREATER DENSITY, HEIGHT AND AFFORDABILITY THAN ALLOWED UNDER THE BASE ZONING. CONDITIONAL USE APPROVAL, AND REVIEW/APPROVAL OF FINDINGS REGARDING WAIVERS AND INCENTIVES UNDER THE STATE DENSITY BONUS PROGRAM ARE REQUIRED BY THE SF PLANNING COMMISSION.

ALL WORK TO COMLY WITH CURRENT LOCAL AND STATE CODES INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: THE 2016 EDITION OF THE CALIFORNIA BUILDING CODE, THE CALIFORNIA PLUMBING CODE, THE CALIFORNIA MECHANICAL CODE, THE CALIFORNIA ELECTRICAL CODE AND THE CALIFORNIA FIRE CODE; THE CURRENT EDITION OF THE SAN FRANCISCO BUILDING AND PLANNING CODES; TITLE-24 ENERGY STANDARDS; GYPSUM FIRE RESISTANCE DESIGN MANUAL (20TH EDITION); ETC...

APPROVALS BY SF PLANNING

(2015-009955-SDB):

This Individually Requested State Density Bonus Mixed use Project is proposed in the Polk Street NCD/65-A underlying zoning district.

SDB waivers/concessions requested are to the following:

- Height and Bulk (s. 260)
- Open Space (T. 135A)
- Rear Yard (s. 134)
- Dwelling Unit Exposure (s. 140)
- Street Frontage (s. 145.1)
- Narrow Street Setbacks (s. 261)
- Projections (s. 136)
- Unit Mix (s. 207.6)

FOR 7/22/21 PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING **ISSUED JULY 14, 2021** 1525 PINE STREET BLOCK/LOT: 0667/020 PRJ: 2015-009955 BPA: 2018-02080768

CONDITIONAL USE APPROVAL IS ALSO SOUGHT FOR THE PROJECT

kerman morris architects LLP





CEMENTITIOUS PANEL - COLOR A



CEMENTITIOUS PANEL OR STUCCO WITH REVEALS - EAST AND WEST PROPERTY LINE WALLS



CEMENTITIOUS PANEL - COLOR B



ALUMINUM OR VPI DOORS / WINDOWS





EXISTING GRUBSTAKE BLADE SIGN - TO BE REUSED



GRUBSTAKE YELLOW DOOR - TO BE RECREATED



EXISTING GRUBSTAKE SIGN - TO BE REUSED



EXISTING GRUBSTAKE WINDOWS - TO BE REUSED

FINISH MATERIALS



PERFORATED METAL PANEL / GUARDRAIL

FOR 7/22/21 PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING ISSUED JULY 14, 2021 1525 PINE STREET

kerman morris architects LLP BLOCK/LOT: 0667/020 PRJ: 2015-009955 BPA: 2018-02080768

PRESERVATION MEASURES

(Non-physical)

	Grubstake will continue to serve local Polk Gulch residents and visitors	
	Retain menu items & design, condiments and silverware with	 Use good faith efforts to keep existing staff in new restaurant
•	some enhancements Apply to operate late night hours in conditional use application	 Document photos of the original Grubstake as well as interpretive materials and display them in the new space

VIRTUAL MUSEUM



PRESERVATION SURVEY



PRESERVATION MEASURES	PRESERVATION MEASURES	PRESERVATION MEASURES
Match footprint/orientation of lunch wagon	2 Match existing scale and proportion of lunch wagon	3 Replicate metal barrel vault celling 6 Reuse/replicate tile, counters, and stools
The Junch wagon fiscade floor in the exact footprin wagons were originally structures, locating the v important for interpretati	nceived as movable matches existing and is defined on the in lume at ground level is with changes in finish and ceiling height.	nterior black and white floor tile define the original lunch wagon



11 of 32

Features on Existing Grubstake Restaurant Which Will be Incorporated into the New Grubstake Restaurant Space

To every to provide existing physical features listed below, and to reinstall, will be done by a task of the testing transmitter conservations and at movers. For example, as to the taiget mural to be preserved, historic preservation conservators will manage the att movers and coordinate with the denoilbit constraint prior to the removal. The team will remove, crete, and package the mural. After removal, the mural will be transported to a secure at storage facility where conservation with only the mural will elecure.

Conservation work on the mural will be performed in accordance with the Guidelines for Practice and Code of Ethics of the American Institute for Conservation.

Photo Documentation - Prior to demolition, the subject property, materials, and Photo uccumentation – Prior to demonitori, une subjest property finitettals, and surrounding context will be photographed in accordance with Historic American Building Survey (PHABS³) standards. Photograph views shall include: (a) contextual views, (b) views of each side of the building and interior views, where possible, (c) oblique views of the building, and (d) detail views of character-defining features.

Historic Resource Interpretation – Permanent display of interpretive materials concerning the history and significance of 1555 Prie Street will be provided. The historic interpretation raised be supervised by a preservation architect and a critectural historiar and conducted in consultation with an exhibit designer. The interpretive materials shall be placed in a prominent public setting in the new building or in another appropriate public setting.

Virtual Tour -- The Grubstake owners have used a virtual reality technology wrutal tour - I ne crubscake owners nave used a virtual reality technology implemented by Matterport Technology to create a lasting 3D tour of the space that will be made available on the restaurant's website. <u>https://matterport.com/industries/</u>. The owners have worked directly with Matterport to conduct this state-of-the-art exhibit.

Features on Existing Grubstake Restaurant Which Will be Incorporated into the New Grubstake Restaurant Space

- Salvage, restore and reinstall portions of the mural and wood framing which includes (under the direction of original artist Jason Phillips) the following:
- Cleaning surfaces . Removal of graffiti
- Re-adhering and consolidating paint Filling cracks
- Color integration Applying protective clear coating
- 2. Replicate red vinyl booth seating
- 3. Replicate train car façade
- 4. Replicate vaulted, curved ceiling
- 5. Reuse light box signage and neon lights
- 6 Replicate wooden bar
- 7. Reuse or replicate decorative lights and side globe lights
- 8. Retain or replicate tile floor, chrome accents, linear counter and backless stools
- 9. Attempt to retain "windows" separating original space from newer space
- 10. Retain menu style
- 11. Condiments and silverware will remain the same with some enhancements
- 12. Retain most liked traditional dishes
- 13. Commit to applying for late night hours (potentially up to 4:00 a.m.) in the conditional use application and extended hours with the entertainment commission and will attempt to operate during those hours
- 14. Pop-up dining during construction
- 15. Will use good faith efforts to keep existing staff (who are in good standing with the restaurant ownership) employed in the new restaurant.

2

Nick Pigott Managing Partner Pine Street Developmer Grubstake

Date:	May 24, 2018
Via:	Email
From:	Lisa Yergovich
Re:	1525 Pine Street, Grubstake Diner

Background Background Architectural Resources Group (ARG) was retained by Pine Street Development to provide historic presentation consulting for Grubatake Diner, located at 1525 Pine Street in Sun Francisco. There are plans to demolish the existing building and develop the site as a server story mice use building. The existing restaurant will be relocated in the new building on the ground floor and second floor mezarane. ARG was added to provide feedback regarding the feesibility of incorporating existing failures of the restaurant loss stands to provide feedback regarding the feesibility of incorporating existing failures of the restaurant loss the new construction.

Assessment

Aussumm Korrpersentatives wither the size on April 3 and again on April 3 to survey existing materials. The original landwages structure at 1329 Per Street has features commonly characteristic of the build's the structure of the size of the structure of the size of the build's Structure of the size of the Curvest conflict Portment signage Media Jab perioder windows Description of define by lunch counter with limited sizeting Description of the size only characteristic of the building

Alterations to the original lunch wagon structure include

Replacement of original linear counter with angled wood counter
 Removal of glazing at eastern windows
 Replacement of fixed stools with freestanding stools

nterest in the 1975 addition include the murals, which were painted by Jason Philips in 197 over the length of the east wall and are painted directly on ½" sheet rock over a layer of th

Recommendations

- ormendations Photo Documentation Prior to demolition, the subject property, materials, and surrounding context be photographed in accordance with Historic American Building Survey (HABS) stardards. Photograph views shall include (a) contextual views; (b) views of cash side of the building and interior views, where possible; (c) oblique views of the building and (d) detail views of character-defining features.
- Historic Resource Interpretation Provide a permanent display of Interpretive materials concerning the history and significance of 1525 Pine Street. The historic interpretation shall be supervised by a preservation architect and architectural historian and conducted in consultation with an enhibit designer. The interpretive materials shall be placed in a prominent public setting in the new building in another appropriate public setting like a community creater.
- One option for interpretation is salvaging select architectural features for reuse or replication in the

- Dee option for interpretation is subject authorizant features for resuse or replication in the evolution, Design considerations include:
 Incorporate the lunch wagon in a way that respects the original footgrain, crimeration, and evolution, Design consultantons include:
 Man to be setted, Locard (the funch wagon' on the points) foor is any effective of a regional ways in a solution, and the setter locard (the funch wagon' on the points) for a regional ways.
 Man the existing scale and proportion of original ways in a cloudy a possible. The limits of material, and a feator final.
 Replicate metal barrle wall colling to create a same of enciosure.
 Bord in the interview of the limit ways in the limits of material, and a feor final.
 Replicate metal barrle wall colling to create a same of enciosure.
 Bord in the interview of the limit ways in the limit way who are in the windows are in the windows are in the set of the limit.
 Repoint enciption window including green colored topicities where possible. The windows are in the backets stock in a global mark, should as a the tile floor, linear counter, and backets stock in the cloud in the panels not be needed, solect mustal, like backets stock.
 Soluties the interviction and potential retractions can be needed, solect mustal, like permission for relations target outer fractions and potential retractions and potent



4010050

March 20, 2019 mmary of Grubstake Redesign

In April 2018, Architectural Resources Group (ARG) was retained by Pine Street Development to survey In right a subject study, inclusion the bisolates study prior termined of your a stellar development. To prior you the Guidatake Direct and make recommendations regarding architectural features that could be subaged for reuse or replicated in the new development. In October, ARG was asked to provide design consultations nervices to identify opportunities for better incorporating these features into the design consultations nervices to identify opportunities for better incorporating these features into the design consultations.

unch wagon in a way that respects the original footprint, orientation, and relatio



Original: The original design had the arched lunch cade was at an angle to the property line and

Revised: The lunch wagon facade was n

the ground floor in the exact footprint of the existing. As lunch wagons were originally com as movable structures, locating the volume at ground level is important for interpretation.





Replicate metal barrel vault ceiling to create a sense of enclosure. Jeuse or replicate side globe lights. etain or recreate characteristic diner features such as the tile floor.



Original: The barrel vault ceiling is not symmetrically defined. The globe lights are inconsistently placed and located on walls outside the barrel vault. The Revised: The barrel vault ceiling, symmetrical glot lights, and replica black and white floor tile define the original lunch wagon footprint. The lunch unch wagon is not defined by unique finishes or wagon has a unique material palette and color scheme that contrasts with the adjacent restaurant



8. Salvage, restore, and reinstall murals



Revised: Existing windows including gree Original: New windows had a similar style ng but did not match in size or





FOR 7/22/21 PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING **ISSUED JULY 14, 2021** 1525 PINE STREET

BLOCK/LOT: 0667/020 PRJ: 2015-009955 BPA: 2018-02080768

kerman morris architects up

GRUBSTAKE PRESERVATION MEASURES













AGREEMENT TO IMPLEMENT MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM

Record No.:	2015-009955ENV	Block/Lot:	0667/020
Project Title:	1525 Pine Street	Lot Size:	3,000 square feet
BPA Nos:	201802080768	Project Sponsor:	1525 Pine Street Dev LLC – c/o Toby Morris,
Zoning:	Polk Street NCD		(415) 749-0302
	65-A Height and Bulk District	Lead Agency:	San Francisco Planning Department
		Staff Contact:	Michael Li, (628) 652-7538

The table below indicates when compliance with each mitigation measure must occur. Some mitigation measures span multiple phases. Substantive descriptions of each mitigation measure's requirements are provided on the following pages in the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program.

Adopted Mitigation Measure	Prior to the start of Construction*	During Construction**	Post- Construction or Operational	Compliance with MM completed?
Mitigation Measure M-CR-2: Archeological Testing	Х	Х		
Mitigation Measure M-TC-1: Tribal Cultural Resources Archeological Resource Preservation Plan and/or Interpretive Program		х	x	
Mitigation Measure M-NO-2: Protection of Adjacent Buildings/Structures and Vibration Monitoring During Construction	x	x	х	
Mitigation Measure M-AQ-2: Construction Air Quality	Х	Х		
Mitigation Measure M-GE-6a: Worker Environmental Awareness Training	Х	Х		
Mitigation Measure M-GE-6b: Discovery of Unanticipated Paleontological Resources		Х		

Adopted Improvement Measure		During Construction**	Post- Construction or Operational	Compliance with IM completed?
Improvement Measure I-CR-1a: Documentation	Х			
Improvement Measure I-CR-1b: Interpretation	Х		Х	
Improvement Measure I-CR-1c: Salvage Architectural Materials from the Site for Public Information and Reuse	X	X	X	
Improvement Measure I-TR-1: Coordinated Construction Traffic Management Plan	Х	Х		

*Prior to any ground disturbing activities at the project site.

**Construction is broadly defined to include any physical activities associated with construction of a development project including, but not limited to: site preparation, clearing, demolition, excavation, shoring, foundation installation, and building construction.

MP I agree to implement the attached mitigation measure(s) as a condition of project approval.

Property Owner or Legal Agent Signature

01/25/2021 Date

Note to sponsor: Please contact <u>CPC.EnvironmentalMonitoring@sfgov.org</u> to begin the environmental monitoring process prior to the submittal of your building permits to the San Francisco Department Building Inspection.

MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM ²			
Implementation Responsibility	Mitigation Schedule	Monitoring/ Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Actions/ Schedule and Verification of Compliance
	Schedule	Responsibility	compliance
Project sponsor / contractor(s).	Prior to issuance of the architectural addendum to the site permit.	Project sponsor and contractor(s) to submit a salvage plan to the Planning Department.	Considered complete upon approval of the salvage plan by the Planning Department and implementation of the salvage plan by the project sponsor and contractor(s).
	Responsibility	Implementation ResponsibilityMitigation ScheduleProject sponsor / contractor(s).Prior to issuance of the architectural addendum to the	Implementation Responsibility Mitigation Schedule Monitoring/ Reporting Responsibility Project sponsor / contractor(s). Prior to issuance of the architectural addendum to the Project sponsor and contractor(s) to submit a salvage plan to the

	MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM ¹			
Adopted Mitigation Measures preservation staff prior to issuance of the architectural addendum to the	Implementation Responsibility	Mitigation Schedule	Monitoring/ Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Actions/ Schedule and Verification of Compliance
ite permit.				
RANSPORTATION AND CIRCULATION				
mprovement Measure I-TR-1: Coordinated Construction Traffic Nanagement Plan				
The project sponsor should participate in the preparation and mplementation of a coordinated construction traffic management plan hat includes measures to reduce hazards between construction-related raffic and pedestrians, bicyclists, and transit vehicles. The coordinated construction traffic management plan should be prepared in coordination with other public and private projects within a one-block radius that may have overlapping construction schedules and should be subject to review and approval by the City's interdepartmental Transportation Advisory Staff Committee (TASC). The plan should include, but not necessarily be imited to, the following measures:	Project sponsor / contractor(s).	Prior to and during construction activities.	Project sponsor and contractor(s) to prepare and submit a coordinated construction traffic management plan to the City's interdepartmental Transportation Advisory Staff Committee.	Considered complete upon end of construction activities.
<i>Restricted Construction Access Hours:</i> Limit truck movements and deliveries requiring lane closures to occur between 9:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., outside of peak morning and evening weekday commute hours.				
Alternative Transportation for Construction Workers: Provide incentives to construction workers to carpool, use transit, bike, and walk to the project site as alternatives to driving alone to and from the project site. Such incentives may include, but not be limited to, providing secure bicycle parking spaces, participating in the free-to- employee-and-employer ride matching program from <u>www.511.org</u> , participating in the emergency ride home program through the City of San Francisco (<u>www.sferh.org</u>), and providing transit information to construction workers.				
<i>Construction Worker Parking Plan:</i> The location of construction worker parking will be identified as well as the person(s) responsible for monitoring the implementation of the proposed parking plan. The use of on-street parking to accommodate construction worker parking will be discouraged.				