



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Rules Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Aaron Peskin, Rafael Mandelman, Connie Chan*

*Clerk: Victor Young (415) 554-7723*

---

**Monday, December 12, 2022**

**10:00 AM**

**Regular Meeting**

**IN-PERSON MEETING**  
**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

**(remote access provided)**  
**(remote public comment provided via teleconference)**

---

**Present:** 3 - Aaron Peskin, Rafael Mandelman, and Connie Chan

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone, on Monday, December 12, 2022, with Chair Aaron Peskin presiding. Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.*

**Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*The Board of Supervisors and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, remote access, and public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website at ([www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)) to stream the live meetings and watch meetings on demand or watch live meetings on San Francisco Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider). Members of the public may provide public comment in-person or remotely via teleconference (detailed instructions available at: <https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>).*

*Members of the public may submit their comments by email to: [victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org); all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Regularly scheduled Rules Committee Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. every Monday of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/committees>.*

*Please visit the Board's website ([www.sfbos.org](http://www.sfbos.org)) regularly to be updated on the current situation as it affects the legislative process. For more information contact the Clerk, Victor Young, at (415) 554-7723 or [victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org).*

**ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Peskin (remote), Vice-Chair Mandelman, and Member Chan. A quorum was present.*

## COMMUNICATIONS

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments for up to two minutes by dialing the provided telephone number. When connected, they will receive another prompt to dial \* 3 to be added to the queue to speak. Make sure to call from a quiet location, speak clearly and slowly, and turn down your television or radio. Written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## AGENDA CHANGES

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **221226 [Mayoral Reappointment, Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Board - Anna Van Degna]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for reappointment of Anna Van Degna to the Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Board, term ending January 24, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: December 2, 2022)

12/06/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: Anna Van Degna; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for reappointment of Anna Van Degna to the Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Board, term ending January 24, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: December 2, 2022)

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221227 [Mayoral Reappointment, Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Board - Moses Corrette]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for reappointment of Moses Corrette to the Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Board, term ending January 24, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: December 2, 2022.)

12/02/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be CONTINUED to the January 23, 2023, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221240 [Intent to Reappoint, Police Commission - Cindy Elias]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending April 30, 2027, to the Police Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2023, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning April 30, 2023, and ending April 30, 2027.

12/05/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Cindy Elias; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Roman Jones; Eliana Binder; Paulina Sayer; Yolanda Williams; Latoya Picture; Eric Aguayo; Peter Santina; Cheryl Thornton; Cany Smollet; Petra De Jesus; Edwin Arango; Angela Chan; Joel Highlight; Jennifer Chu; spoke in support of the reappointment of Cindy Elias. Frank Noto; Alan Burradell; Richard Perennia; Speaker; Dennis Walliam Jr.; Speaker; Anita Enchasea; Francisco Da Costa; Speaker; Speaker; Hatton Noguera; spoke in opposition of the reappointment of Cindy Elias and/or provided information on the matter.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion confirming the reappointment of Cindy Elias, term ending April 30, 2027, to the Police Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2023, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning April 30, 2023, and ending April 30, 2027.

*See Duplicated File No. 221264.*

**Chair Peskin requested this Motion be DUPLICATED.**

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to amend the Motion from 'confirming the reappointment of Cindy Elias' to 'intent to confirm the reappointment of Cindy Elias' to the Police Commission. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Peskin, Chan

Noes: 1 - Mandelman

Motion of intent to confirm the reappointment of Cindy Elias, term ending April 30, 2027, to the Police Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2023, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning April 30, 2023, and ending April 30, 2027.

**Supervisor Peskin RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Peskin, Chan

Noes: 1 - Mandelman

#### **221264 [Reappointment, Police Commission - Cindy Elias]**

Motion confirming the reappointment of Cindy Elias, term ending April 30, 2027, to the Police Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2023, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning April 30, 2023, and ending April 30, 2027.

12/11/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Duplicated from File No. 221240.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, to confirm the intent to reappoint Cindy Elias to the Police Commission made via File No. 221240. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Peskin, Chan

Noes: 1 - Mandelman

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2023, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning April 30, 2023, and ending April 30, 2027.

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED to the Board of Supervisors' next regular meeting occurring after January 8, 2023. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Peskin, Chan

Noes: 1 - Mandelman

#### **221239 [Mayoral Reappointment, Historic Preservation Commission - Kate Black]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination of Kate Black for reappointment to the Historic Preservation Commission, term ending December 31, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 4.135, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: December 1, 2022.)

12/05/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: Kate Black; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination of Kate Black for reappointment to the Historic Preservation Commission, term ending December 31, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.135, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: December 1, 2022.)

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221224 [Appointment, Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board of Directors - Supervisor Ahsha Safai]**

Motion appointing Supervisor Ahsha Safai, term ending January 31, 2025, to the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board of Directors. (Clerk of the Board)

11/29/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; provided information on the matter.*

*See Duplicated File No. 221263.*

**DUPLICATED**

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, by only appointing to the term ending January 31, 2023 and on Page 1, Line 13, by replacing 'Executive Director' with ' General Manager'. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

Motion appointing Supervisor Ahsha Safai, term ending January 31, 2023, to the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board of Directors. (Clerk of the Board)

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221263 [Appointment, Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board of Directors - Supervisor Ahsha Safai]**

Motion appointing Supervisor Ahsha Safai, term ending January 31, 2025, to the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board of Directors. (Clerk of the Board)

*Duplicated from File No. 221224.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, by only appointing to the two-year term ending January 31, 2025; and on Page 1, Line 13, to replace 'Executive Director' with ' General Manager'. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221228 [Reappointment, Metropolitan Transportation Commission - Supervisor Hillary Ronen]**

Motion reappointing Supervisor Hillary Ronen, term ending February 10, 2027, or the conclusion of her term as a Member of the Board of Supervisors, to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

12/02/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Ann Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; spoke in support of the reappointment of Supervisor Hillary Ronen.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**221025 [Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code - Form 700 (Statement of Economic Interests) Filing Requirements]**

**Sponsors: Walton; Chan**

Ordinance amending the Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code to update the Conflict of Interest Code's Form 700 (Statement of Economic Interests) filing requirements by adding, deleting, and changing titles of certain designated officials and employees to reflect organizational and staffing changes, and by refining disclosure requirements for certain designated officials and employees. (Meet and confer obligations not met.)

09/27/22; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 10/27/2022.

10/05/22; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to all city departments via the Mayor's Office for informational purposes.

11/07/22; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; provided information on the matter.

11/07/22; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Ann Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; provided informatoin on the matter.*

**Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

**Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 12:45 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*