

# BOARD OF SUPERVISORS CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

## MEETING MINUTES - DRAFT

January 9, 2023 - 10:00 AM

### IN-PERSON MEETING

Legislative Chamber, Room 250  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*(remote access provided)*

*(remote public comment provided via teleconference)*

[www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)

### Inaugural Meeting

---

AARON PESKIN, PRESIDENT

CONNIE CHAN, MATT DORSEY, JOEL ENGARDIO, RAFAEL MANDELMAN,  
MYRNA MELGAR, DEAN PRESTON, HILLARY RONEN, AHSHA SAFAI,  
CATHERINE STEFANI, SHAMANN WALTON

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

### BOARD COMMITTEES

#### Committee Membership

#### Meeting Days

##### **Budget and Appropriations Committee**

Supervisors Ronen, Safai, Chan, Walton

Wednesday

1:00 PM

##### **Budget and Finance Committee**

Supervisors Ronen, Safai, Chan

Wednesday

12:30 PM

##### **Government Audit and Oversight Committee**

Supervisors Preston, Chan, Mandelman

1st and 3rd Thursday

10:00 AM

##### **Land Use and Transportation Committee**

Supervisors Melgar, Preston, Peskin

Monday

1:30 PM

##### **Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee**

Supervisors Stefani, Melgar

2nd and 4th Thursday

10:00 AM

##### **Rules Committee**

Supervisors Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

Monday

10:00 AM

##### **Youth, Young Adult, and Families Committee**

Supervisors Ronen, Safai, Dorsey

2nd Friday

10:00 AM

First-named Supervisor is Chair, Second-named Supervisor is Vice-Chair of the Committee.

---

**Members Present:** Connie Chan, Matt Dorsey, Joel Engardio, Rafael Mandelman, Myrna Melgar, Aaron Peskin, Dean Preston, Hillary Ronen, Ahsha Safai, Catherine Stefani, and Shamann Walton

---

*The Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco met for the inaugural session, in-person with remote access and public comment also available via telephone, on Monday, January 9, 2023, with Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board, calling the meeting to order.*

*Clerk Calvillo called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.*

## **Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*The Board of Supervisors and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, remote access, and public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website ([www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)) to stream the live meetings and watch meetings on demand or watch live meetings on San Francisco Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider). Members of the public may provide public comment in-person or remotely via teleconference (detailed instructions available at: <https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>).*

*Members of the public may submit their comments by email to: [bos@sfgov.org](mailto:bos@sfgov.org); all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Board of Supervisors Regular Meetings begin at 2:00 p.m. on Tuesdays. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/meetings/42>.*

*Please visit the Board's website ([www.sfbos.org](http://www.sfbos.org)) regularly to be updated on the current situation as it affects the legislative process. For more information contact the Office of the Clerk of the Board at (415) 554-5184 or [bos@sfgov.org](mailto:bos@sfgov.org).*

## **ROLL CALL AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

*On the call of the roll, Supervisors Chan, Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton were noted present.*

*All Members of the Board were present.*

## COMMUNICATIONS

*Clerk Calvillo reported that she was in receipt of a communication from the Department of Elections, certifying the candidates for the Office of the Members of the Board of Supervisors who received a majority of votes cast at the election held on November 8, 2022, and have been declared elected to that office, namely:*

*District 2 - Catherine Stefani  
District 4 - Joel Engardio  
District 6 - Matt Dorsey  
District 8 - Rafael Mandelman  
District 10 - Shamann Walton*

*Clerk Calvillo informed the Board Members that she had received a communication from the Controller confirming that certification of surety bond requirements were established for all newly elected and re-elected Board Members, pursuant to Administrative Code, Article IX, Section 16.122(a)(e).*

*Clerk Calvillo then stated that, pursuant to Charter Section 2.116, on the eighth day of January in odd numbered years, the Board of Supervisors shall elect one of its Members as President of the Board. If January 8th falls on a holiday or weekend, as it did this year, Rule 6.1 of the Board's Rules of Order requires the Board to schedule its organization and Presidential election at 10:00 a.m. the following business day. Today's meeting satisfies these requirements.*

*Finally, Clerk Calvillo reported that, as of 12:00 noon on January 8, 2023, there were no vacancies in the District offices as each newly elected and re-elected Members of the Board were officially sworn in and assumed their duties as public servants, continuing the tradition that binds officials across more than 100 years of San Francisco history in service to the residents of San Francisco.*

## OATH OF OFFICE - MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

*Clerk Calvillo introduced the Honorable Anne-Christine Massullo, Presiding Judge, Superior Court of California, County of San Francisco. Judge Massullo requested the newly elected and re-elected Members of the Board to stand; whereupon Judge Massullo administered the Oath of Office as Members of the Board of Supervisors and Commissioners of the County Transportation Authority.*

## NOMINATIONS FOR THE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

*Clerk Calvillo provided the nominating principles, as follows:*

- Members may nominate one person, either themselves or another Member;*
- Nominees state on the record if they accept the nomination;*
- Nominees do not need to vacate the Chamber;*
- Nominees may withdraw their own nomination without a second at any time;*
- At completion of nominations, the nominations will be closed;*
- Members may vote for themselves;*
- The Board may adopt a motion to reopen nominations with a majority vote; and*
- If nominations are reopened, those Members who have not nominated may do so or a Member may withdraw their previous nomination and nominate a different Member.*

*Supervisor Ronen nominated Supervisor Walton.*

*Supervisor Stefani nominated Supervisor Mandelman.*

*Supervisor Melgar nominated Supervisor Chan.*

*Clerk Calvillo inquired if there were any further nominations. There being no response, the nominations for the Office of the President of the Board of Supervisors were then closed.*

## GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

*Del Seymour; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Paulina Fayer; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*William Jake; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Yolanda Williams; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Joanna Hernandez; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Joe Kunzler; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Marie Hurabiell; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Naj Daniels; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Annabelle Ibanez; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Cheryl Traverse; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Jared Goldpine; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Theodore Randolph; expressed concerns regarding affordable housing.*  
*Dr. Monique LeSarre; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Venetia Margarita; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Brenda Barros; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Fred Winograd; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Gloria Berry; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Alice Savior; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Marina; spoke in support of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman for President of the Board.*  
*Pastor Sweetie Kigata; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Gaynor Siataga; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Cheryl Thornton; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Alexandra Grainer; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*  
*Jameel Patterson; spoke in support of Supervisor Shamann Walton for President of the Board.*

## ELECTION OF THE PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

*Supervisor Walton accepted the nomination.*

*Supervisor Mandelman accepted the nomination.*

*Supervisor Chan accepted the nomination.*

*Clerk Calvillo provided the principles for the election of the President of the Board of Supervisors, as follows:*

- Voting occurs in alphabetical order;*
- There are no abstentions or passes;*
- When called upon, Members vote by stating the name of their preference from among the nominees;*
- The first nominee to receive a majority vote will be the President of the Board;*
- The nominee with the least number of votes is not obligated to withdraw their name nor will they be automatically withdrawn from the ballot;*
- If no nominee received a majority of the votes, they will proceed to the next round of voting; and*
- If nominations are reopened, those Members who have not nominated may do so or a Member may withdraw their previous nomination and nominate a different Member.*

*The roll was called on the nominations of Supervisors Chan, Mandelman, and Walton.*

*ROUND 1 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*ROUND 2 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*ROUND 3 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

ROUND 4 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 5 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 6 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 7 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 8 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 9 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

ROUND 10 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar  
Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani  
Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

*ROUND 11 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*ROUND 12 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*Supervisor Chan, seconded by Supervisor Peskin, moved to reopen nominations for the election of the President of the Board of Supervisors. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 9 - Chan, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton*

*Noes: 2 - Dorsey, Engardio*

*Supervisor Peskin nominated himself.*

*Supervisor Mandelman moved, seconded by Supervisor Peskin, moved to recess the meeting beginning at 11:33 a.m. The motion carried without objection.*

*Clerk Calvillo reconvened the meeting at 11:48 a.m.*

*ROUND 13 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Chan: 2 - Chan, Melgar*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 5 - Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*Peskin: 0 - None*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*ROUND 14 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Peskin: 3 - Chan, Melgar, Peskin*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 4 - Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*Chan: 0 - None*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

*ROUND 15 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:*

*Peskin: 3 - Chan, Melgar, Peskin*

*Mandelman: 4 - Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Stefani*

*Walton: 4 - Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton*

*Chan: 0 - None*

*No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.*

ROUND 16 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Peskin: 4 - Chan, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin

Mandelman: 3 - Dorsey, Engardio, Stefani

Walton: 4 - Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

Chan: 0 - None

No nominee received a majority of the votes; the Board proceeded to the next round.

Supervisor Ronen, seconded by Supervisor Chan, moved to recess the meeting beginning at 11:57 a.m. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 11 - Chan, Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton

Clerk Calvillo reconvened the meeting at 12:09 p.m.

ROUND 17 - Vote to select the President of the Board of Supervisors among the names in nomination were declared, as follows:

Peskin: 7 - Chan, Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Stefani

Walton: 4 - Preston, Ronen, Safai, Walton

Chan: 0 - None

Mandelman: 0 - None

President Peskin received a majority of the votes in Round 17 and requested the honor of having Supervisors Chan, Mandelman and Walton escort him to the dais as he assumed the chair.

**PRESIDENT AARON PESKIN ASSUMED THE CHAIR**

President Peskin presented the ancestral homeland acknowledgement of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula, pursuant to Board Rule 4.7.1.

## **REMARKS FROM THE MAYOR OF THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO, THE HONORABLE LONDON N. BREED**

Privilege of the floor was granted unanimously to Tom Paulino (Mayor's Office) who reported on the Mayor's attendance.

Mayor London N. Breed congratulated President Peskin and all of the newly elected and re-elected Members of the Board of Supervisors. She shared the various issues and challenges ahead for the City - including homelessness, open air drug use and housing - and shared her desire to continue working with the Members of the Board to ensure the success of the City's future.

## **REMARKS BY THE HONORABLE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

President Peskin called on each of the newly elected, re-elected, and continuing Members of the Board of Supervisors and afforded each an opportunity for brief remarks and introduction of family members and guests in attendance.

## REMARKS BY THE HONORABLE PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

*President Peskin recognized the many elected officials and department heads in attendance for today's meeting. President Peskin thanked Supervisor Walton for his work and efforts during his tenure as President of the Board during the last term and bestowed a plaque recognizing his service.*

*President Peskin then humbly expressed his appreciation for the Members of the Board for electing him President and encouraged the continued collaboration between the District offices. He looked forward to working together as they anticipate navigating the many challenges facing San Francisco.*

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Board adjourned at the hour of 1:27 p.m.*