



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai, Aaron Peskin*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, October 7, 2024**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai, and Aaron Peskin

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, October 7, 2024, with Chair Shamann Walton presiding. Chair Walton called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Walton and Member Peskin were noted present. Vice Chair Safai was noted not present. A quorum of the Committee was present.*

*Vice Chair Safai was noted present at 10:05 a.m.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

**240805 [Administrative Code - Street Teams Reporting]****Sponsor: Preston**

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require regular reporting to the Board of Supervisors by the Department of Emergency Management, Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing, Department of Public Health, and Fire Department, concerning the efficiency and effectiveness of the City's street teams.

07/30/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 8/29/2024.

09/03/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Emergency Management, Homelessness and Supportive House, Public Health and the Fire Dept for informational purposes.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Dean Preston (Board of Supervisors); Maryellen Carroll, Director, and Lauren Bell (Department of Emergency Management); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Lema Deverson; provided information on the matter.*

**Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, on Page 2, Line 20, after 'street team' strike' and '; Page 2, Line 21, after 'services' insert 'offered'; Page 2, Lines 22 -25, strike '(5) whether there are vacancies at any of the SF Coordinated Street Response Departments that are impacting deliverables; (6) whether contractors are meeting staffing obligations and if applicable, how contractor staffing levels are impacting deliverables'; Page 3, Line 1, strike "(7) a summary of services provided'; Page 3, Line 5. strike 'resource utilization and' and Page 3, Lines 5-6, to replace 'in order to identify and measure' with 'that indicate' Page 3, Lines 8-9, to strike '(10) a description of how the SF Coordinated Street Response Departments coordinate the provision of services and offers of shelter'; Page 3 Line 21-24, th change the starting date in 2025, to the last Friday of September'; and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Walton, Safai, Peskin

**Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Walton, Safai, Peskin

**240947 [Appointments, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force - Bruce Wolfe, Dean Schmidt, Lila Lahood, Saul Sugarman, Maxine Anderson, Laura Stein, Matthew Yankee, Chris Hyland, and David Pilpel]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term expiring April 27, 2025, and nine members, terms ending April 27, 2026, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Dean Schmidt, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be an attorney, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 2, succeeding Lila LaHood, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be a journalist, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 3, succeeding Saul Sugarman, term expired, must be a member from the press or electronic media, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 5, succeeding Maxine Anderson, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the League of Women Voters, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 6, succeeding Laura Stein, term expired, must be a member of the public experienced in consumer advocacy, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 7, succeeding Matthew Yankee, term expired, must be a member of the public experienced in consumer advocacy, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 8, succeeding Chris Hyland, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 9, succeeding David Pilpel, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Vacant seat 10, succeeding Thuan Thao Hill, resigned, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

Seat 11, succeeding Bruce Wolfe, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government (and member of the public who is physically handicapped), for a two-year term ending April 27, 2025.

09/27/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Dean Schmidt; Lila LaHood; Saul Sugarman, Maxine Anderson, Laura Stein; Matthew Yankee; Chris Hyland; David Pilpel; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

*Dean Schmidt, seat 1, recommended.*

*Lila Lahood, seat 2, recommended.*

*Saul Sugarman, seat 3, recommended.*

*Maxine Anderson, seat 5, recommended.*

*Laura Stein, seat 6, recommended.*

*Matthew Yankee, seat 7, recommended.*

*Chris Hyland, seat 8, recommended.*

*David Pilpel, seat 9, recommended.*

*Bruce Wolfe, seat 11, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Bruce Wolfe, term expiring April 27, 2025, and Dean Schmidt, Lila LaHood, Saul Sugarman, Maxine Anderson, Laura Stein, Matthew Yankee, Chris Hyland, and David Pilpel, terms expiring April 27, 2026, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Bruce Wolfe, seat 11, succeeding himself, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government (and member of the public who is physically handicapped), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2025;

Dean Schmidt, seat 1, succeeding himself, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be an attorney, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Lila LaHood, seat 2, succeeding herself, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be a journalist, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Saul Sugarman, seat 3, succeeding himself, term expired, must be a member from the press or electronic media, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Maxine Anderson, seat 5, succeeding herself, term expired, must be nominated by the local chapter of the League of Women Voters, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Laura Stein, seat 6, succeeding herself, term expired, must be a member of the public experienced in consumer advocacy, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Matthew Yankee, seat 7, succeeding himself, term expired, must be a member of the public experienced in consumer advocacy, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

Chris Hyland, seat 8, succeeding himself, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026;

David Pilpel, seat 9, succeeding himself, term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2026.

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Walton, Safai, Peskin

### **Supervisor Peskin Excused from Attendance**

**Chair Walton moved that Supervisor Peskin be excused from the October 7, 2024, Rules Committee meeting at 10:41 a.m. and for the remainder of the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

**240867 [Mayoral Appointment, Public Utilities Commission - Avni Jamdar]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Avni Jamdar to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

09/10/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Avni Jamdar; Joshua Arce; Stephen Leveroni; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Kitha Rath; Sara Troopman; Antonio Diaz; David Pilpel; Randell DeMartini; Shepeda; Ms. Jackson; James Richard; Ashen Rose; Roberto Hernandez; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicants.*

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Avni Jamdar to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

**240868 [Mayoral Appointment, Public Utilities Commission - Joshua Arce]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Joshua Arce to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

09/10/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Avni Jamdar; Joshua Arce; Stephen Leveroni; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Kitha Rath; Sara Troopman; Antonio Diaz; David Pilpel; Randell DeMartini; Shepeda; Ms. Jackson; James Richard; Ashen Rose; Roberto Hernandez; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicants.*

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Joshua Arce to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai  
Excused: 1 - Peskin

#### **240869 [Mayoral Appointment, Public Utilities Commission - Stephen Leveroni]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Stephen Leveroni to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

09/10/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Avni Jamdar; Joshua Arce; Stephen Leveroni; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Kitha Rath; Sara Troopman; Antonio Diaz; David Pilpel; Randell DeMartini; Shepeda; Ms. Jackson; James Richard; Ashen Rose; Roberto Hernandez; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicants.*

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai  
Excused: 1 - Peskin

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Stephen Leveroni to the Public Utilities Commission, for a term ending August 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: September 9, 2024.)

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai  
Excused: 1 - Peskin

#### **240891 [Appointment, Treasury Oversight Committee - Greg Wagner]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Treasurer's nomination of Greg Wagner, for a term ending June 17, 2026, to the Treasury Oversight Committee. (Clerk of the Board)

09/06/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

09/10/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Treasurer's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai  
Excused: 1 - Peskin

Motion approving the Treasurer's nomination of Greg Wagner, for a term ending June 17, 2026, to the Treasury Oversight Committee. (Clerk of the Board)

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

**240949 [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 1 - Adena Gilbert, Hilary Winslow, Quirina Mitchell, and Paul Bellar]**

Hearing to consider appointing four members, terms ending September 6, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee)

Seat 2, succeeding Adena Gilbert, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Seat 5, succeeding Elizabeth Zareh, resigned, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Seat 6 succeeding Quirina Mitchell, term expired, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Seat 8 succeeding Paul Bellar, term expired, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

09/30/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Adena Gilbert, Quirina Mitchell; Paul Bellar; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

*Adena Gilbert, seat 2, recommended.*

*Hilary Winslow, seat 5, recommended.*

*Quirina Mitchell, seat 6, recommended.*

*Paul Bellar, seat 8, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Adena Gibert, Hilary Winslow, Quirina Mitchell, and Paul Bellar, term ending September 7, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee)

Adena Gilbert, seat 2, succeeding themselves, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Hilary Winslow, seat 5, succeeding Elizabeth Zareh, resigned, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Quirina Mitchell, seat 6, succeeding themselves, term expired, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Paul Bellar, seat 8 succeeding themselves, term expired, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin



**240950 [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 2 - Louisa Mendoza, Nicholas Goldman, Michelle Domingo, Joyce Lewis, and Claire Ervin Lee]**

Hearing to consider appointing five members, terms ending September 6, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Louisa Mendoza, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Seat 5, succeeding Stephen Wasserman, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Vacant Seat 6, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Vacant Seat 7, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Vacant Seat 8, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

09/30/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Louisa Mendoza; Nicholas Goldman; Michella Domingo; Joyce Lewis; Claire Ervin Lee; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

*Louisa Mendoza, seat 1, recommended.*

*Nicholas Goldman, seat 5, recommended.*

*Michella Domingo, seat 6, recommended.*

*Joyce Lewis seat 7, recommended.*

*Claire Ervin Lee, seat 8, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Louisa Mendoza, Nicholas Goldman, Michelle Domingo, Joyce Lewis, and Claire Ervin Lee, term ending September 7, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee)

Louisa Mendoza, seat 1, succeeding herself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Nicholas Goldman, seat 5, succeeding Stephen Wasserman, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Michelle Domingo, vacant seat 6, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Joyce Lewis, vacant seat 7, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027;

Claire Ervin Lee, vacant seat 8, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

**240951 [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board 3 - Mark Dickow]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending September 7, 2025, two members terms ending September 7, 2026, and two members, terms ending September 6, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Real Estate Department)

Seat 2, Elizabeth Miller, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Vacant Seat 3, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 7, 2026.

Seat 5, Mark Dickow, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

Vacant Seat 7, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 7, 2025.

Vacant Seat 8, (ALTERNATE MEMBER) must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 7, 2026.

09/30/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Mark Dickow; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Dennis Mendoza; spoke in support of the appointment of Marc Dickow.*

*Mark Dickow, seat 5, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Mark Dickow, term ending September 6, 2027, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Real Estate Department)

Mark Dickow, seat 5, succeeding himself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 6, 2027.

**Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Peskin

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:35 a.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*