



City and County of San Francisco
Meeting Minutes
Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, Gordon Mar

Clerk: Victor Young (415) 554-7723

Monday, February 25, 2019

10:00 AM

City Hall, Committee Room 263

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, and Gordon Mar

The Rules Committee met in regular session on Monday, February 25, 2019, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Ronen, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Mar were noted present. There was a quorum.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

190197 [Reappointment, Police Commission - Cindy Elias]

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending April 30, 2023, to the Police Commission. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Cindy Elias, term expiring April 30, 2019, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term ending April 30, 2023.

02/20/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Cindy Elias; Reginald Daniels; Marilyn Murrillo; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Donna Mandel and Jacque Wilson (Office of the Public Defender); Speaker; Rachel Kilshaw; Peter Santina; M. Rano, Brian Pearlman, DeMarris Evans and Tamarin Acres (Office of the Public Defender); spoke in support of the reappointment of Cindy Elias.

Reappointment of Cindy Elias, seat 1, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion confirming the reappointment of Cindy Elias, term ending April 30, 2023, to the Police Commission. (Rules Committee)

Cindy Elias, seat 1, succeeding herself, must be nominated by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term ending April 30, 2023.

Chair Ronen, seconded by Vice Chair Walton, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

190001 [Administrative Code - County Adult Assistance Programs]

Sponsor: Ronen

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to expand eligibility for assistance under the Personal Assistance Employment Services (PAES) Program, the Cash Assistance Linked to Medi-Cal (CALM) Program, and the Supplemental Security Income Pending (SSIP) Program, to adults who are ineligible for assistance under the CalWORKs Program due to the lifetime limit on the receipt of assistance, and whose children are no longer minors, or are no longer under the care and control of the adult. (Human Services Agency)

12/17/18; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

01/15/19; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 2/14/2019.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Susie Smith (Human Services Agency); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

Member Mar moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

Chair Ronen requested that File Nos. 190034, 190035 and 190036 be heard together.

190034 [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 1 - Scott Spertzel, Edward Campana, Kristine Nelson and Paul Bellar]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending September 6, 2021, two alternate members, terms ending September 6, 2021, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee)

Seat 2, succeeding Scott Spertzel, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Seat 5, succeeding Edward Campana, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vacant Seat 6 (Alternate Member), succeeding Scott Spertzel, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vacant Seat 8 (Alternate Member), succeeding Donna Crowder, resigned, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

01/09/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dawn Duran (Assessment Appeals Board); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Scott Spertzel; Edward Campana; Kristine Nelson; Louisa Mendoza; Estrella Bryant; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Gloria Bear; spoke in support of the reappointment of Paul Bellar.

Reappointment of Scott Spertzel, seat 2, recommended.

Reappointment of Edward Campana, seat 5, recommended.

Reappointment of Kristine Nelson, seat 6, recommended.

Appointment of Paul Bellar, seat 8, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Scott Spertzel, Edward Campana, Kristine Nelson and Paul Bellar, terms ending September 6, 2021, to Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee)

Scott Spertzel, seat 2, succeeding himself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Edward Campana, seat 5, succeeding himself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Kristine Nelson, seat 6 (Alternate Member), succeeding Scott Spertzel, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Paul Bellar, seat 8 (Alternate Member), succeeding Donna Crowder, resigned, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

190035 [Reappointments, Assessment Appeals Board No 2 - Louisa Mendoza, Daniel Hershkowitz, Joyce Lewis, and Angela Cheung]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending September 6, 2021, and two alternate members, terms ending September 6, 2021, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Louisa Mendoza, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Seat 5, succeeding Daniel Hershkowitz, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Seat 6 (Alternate Member), succeeding Joyce Lewis, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Seat 7 (Alternate Member), succeeding Angela Cheung, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

01/09/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dawn Duran (Assessment Appeals Board); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Scott Spertzel; Edward Campana; Kristine Nelson; Louisa Mendoza; Estrella Bryant; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Gloria Bear; spoke in support of the reappointment of Paul Bellar.

*Reappointment of Louisa Mendoza, seat 1, recommended.
Reappointment of Daniel Hershkowitz, seat 5, recommended.
Reappointment of Joyce Lewis, seat 6, recommended.
Reappointment of Angela Cheung, seat 7, recommended.*

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion reappointing Louisa Mendoza, Daniel Hershkowitz, Joyce Lewis and Angela Cheung, terms ending September 6, 2021, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee)

Louisa Mendoza, seat 1, succeeding herself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Daniel Hershkowitz, seat 5, succeeding himself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Joyce Lewis, seat 6 (Alternate Member), succeeding herself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Angela Cheung, seat 7 (Alternate Member), succeeding herself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Hearing be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

190036 [Appointment, Assessment Appeals Board 3 - Estrella Bryant]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending September 6, 2021, and one member term ending September 7, 2020, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Rules Committee) Seat 2, succeeding Kristine Nelson, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vacant Seat 3, succeeding Anne Ferrel, resigned, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 7, 2020.

Seat 5, succeeding Estrella Bryant, term expires September 3, 2018, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

01/09/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dawn Duran (Assessment Appeals Board); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Scott Spertzel; Edward Campana; Kristine Nelson; Louisa Mendoza; Estrella Bryant; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Gloria Bear; spoke in support of the reappointment of Paul Bellar.

Reappointment of Estrella Bryant, seat 5, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion reappointing Estrella Bryant, terms ending September 6, 2021, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Rules Committee)

Estrella Bryant, seat 5, succeeding herself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for a three-year term ending September 6, 2021.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

190186 [Reappointment, Park, Recreation, and Open Space Advisory Committee - Wendy Aragon]

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending February 1, 2020, to the Park, Recreation and Open Space Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Seat 13, succeeding Wendy Aragon, term expired, must be nominated by the District 1 Supervisor from the organizations listed in Resolution No. 391-13, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending February 1, 2020.

02/15/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Wendy Aragon; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Reappointment of Wendy Aragon, seat 13, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion reappointing Wendy Aragon, term ending February 1, 2020, to the Park, Recreation and Open Space Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Wendy Aragon, seat 13, succeeding herself, term expired, must be nominated by the District 1 Supervisor from the organizations listed in Resolution No. 391-13, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending February 1, 2020.

Chair Ronen moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

190187 [Appointments, Bicycle Advisory Committee - Kristin Tieche and Elbert Hill]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending November 19, 2020, to the Bicycle Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Vacant Seat 1, succeeding Devon Warner, resigned, must be a nominee of the District 1 Supervisor, to serve a two-year term ending November 19, 2020, or for the tenure of the nominating Supervisor, whichever is shorter in duration.

Seat 7, succeeding Elbert Hill, term expired, must be a nominee of the District 7 Supervisor, to serve a two-year term ending November 19, 2020, or for the tenure of the nominating Supervisor, whichever is shorter in duration.

02/15/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Kristin Tieche; Bert Hill; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Andy Thornlane; spoke in support of the appointment of Kristin Tieche and Bert Hill.

Appointment of Kristin Tieche, seat 1, recommended.

Reappointment of Elbert Hill, seat 7, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Kristin Tieche and Elbert Hill, terms ending November 19, 2020, to the Bicycle Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Kristin Tieche, seat 1, succeeding Devon Warner, resigned, must be a nominee of the District 1 Supervisor, to serve the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 19, 2020, or for the tenure of the nominating Supervisor, whichever is shorter in duration.

Elbert Hill, seat 7, succeeding himself, term expired, must be a nominee of the District 7 Supervisor, to serve the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 19, 2020, or for the tenure of the nominating Supervisor, whichever is shorter in duration.

Chair Ronen moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

181098 [Appointments, Sugary Drinks Distributor Tax Advisory Committee - Vanessa Bohm, John Maa, Joi Jackson-Morgan, Roberto Ariel Vargas, Johnathan Butler, Janna Cordeiro, and Derik Aoki]

Hearing to consider appointing seven members, terms ending December 31, 2020, to the Sugary Drinks Distributor Tax Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Vanessa Bohm, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 2, succeeding Kent Woo, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 3, succeeding Joi Jackson-Morgan, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 4, succeeding Roberto Ariel Vargas, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be an individual who is employed at a medical institution in San Francisco and who has experience in the diagnosis or treatment of, or in research or education about, chronic and other diseases linked to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 5, succeeding Jonathan Butler, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be an individual who is employed at a medical institution in San Francisco and who has experience in the diagnosis or treatment of, or in research or education about, chronic and other diseases linked to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 15, succeeding Janna Cordeiro, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be a parent or guardian of a student enrolled in the San Francisco Unified School District at the time of appointment, nominated by the San Francisco Unified School District's Parent Advisory Council, and appointed by the Board of Supervisors, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Seat 16, succeeding Lyra Ng, term expiring December 31, 2018, must be a person with experience or expertise in services and programs for children five years old and under, for a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

11/14/18; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Joi Jackson-Morgan; Jonathan Butler; Roberto Ariel Vargas; John Maa; Derik Aoki; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Reappointment of Vanessa Bohm, seat 1, recommended.

Appointment of John Maa, seat 2, recommended.

Reappointment of Joi Jackson-Morgan (residency requirement waived), seat 3, recommended.

Reappointment of Roberto Ariel Vargas (residency requirement waived), seat 4, recommended.

Reappointment of Jonathan Butler (residency requirement waived), seat 5, recommended.

Reappointment of Janna Cordeiro, seat 15, recommended.

Appointment of Derik Aoki, seat 16, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Vanessa Bohm, John Maa, Joi Jackson-Morgan (residency requirement waived), Roberto Ariel Vargas (residency requirement waived), Johnathan Butler (residency requirement waived), Janna Cordeiro, and Derik Aoki, terms ending December 31, 2020, to the Sugary Drinks Distributor Tax Advisory Committee. (Rules Committee)

Vanessa Bohm, seat 1, succeeding herself, term expired, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

John Maa, seat 2, succeeding Kent Woo, term expired December 31, 2018, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Joi Jackson-Morgan (residency requirement waived), seat 3, succeeding herself, term expired December 31, 2018, must be held by a representative of a nonprofit organization that advocate for health equity in communities that are disproportionately impacted by diseases related to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Roberto Ariel Vargas (residency requirement waived), seat 4, succeeding himself, term expired December 31, 2018, must be an individual who is employed at a medical institution in San Francisco and who has experience in the diagnosis or treatment of, or in research or education about, chronic and other diseases linked to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Jonathan Butler (residency requirement waived), seat 5, succeeding himself, term expired December 31, 2018, must be an individual who is employed at a medical institution in San Francisco and who has experience in the diagnosis or treatment of, or in research or education about, chronic and other diseases linked to the consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Janna Cordeiro, seat 15, succeeding herself, term expired December 31, 2018, must be a parent or guardian of a student enrolled in the San Francisco Unified School District at the time of appointment, nominated by the San Francisco Unified School District's Parent Advisory Council, and appointed by the Board of Supervisors, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Derik Aoki, seat 16, succeeding Lyra Ng, term expired December 31, 2018, must be a person with experience or expertise in services and programs for children five years old and under, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending December 31, 2020.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

181188 [Administrative Code - Implicit Bias Training - Department Heads and Commissioners]**Sponsor: Stefani**

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require department heads and members of City boards and commissions to complete implicit bias training by June 30, 2019; to require newly appointed department heads and members of City boards and commissions to complete implicit bias training within 60 days of assuming office; and to require the Department of Human Resources to provide the training.

12/04/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 1/3/2019.

12/07/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Department of Human Resources and to all City Department Heads for informational purposes.

02/11/19; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Wyatt Donnelly-Landolt (Office of Supervisor Stefani); Susan Gard (Department of Human Resources); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Wyatt Donnelly-Landolt (Office of Supervisor Catherine Stefani); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED to the March 18, 2019, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:57 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.