



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Rules Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, Gordon Mar*

*Clerk: Victor Young (415) 554-7723*

---

**Monday, May 6, 2019**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Committee Room 263**

**Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, and Gordon Mar

*The Rules Committee met in regular session on Monday, May 6, 2019, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding. Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.*

**ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Ronen, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Mar were noted present. A quorum was present.*

**AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

**REGULAR AGENDA**

*Chair Ronen recessed the meeting at 11:00 a.m., and reconvened at 11:58 a.m.*

**190110 [Administrative Code - Acquisition of Surveillance Technology]****Sponsors: Peskin; Yee, Walton, Ronen and Haney**

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require that City departments acquiring Surveillance Technology, or entering into agreements to receive information from non-City owned Surveillance Technology, submit a Board of Supervisors approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance, based on a policy developed by the Committee on Information Technology (COIT), and a Surveillance Impact Report to the Board in connection with any request to appropriate funds for the purchase of such technology or to accept and expend grant funds for such purpose, or otherwise to procure Surveillance Technology equipment or services; require each City department that owns and operates existing surveillance technology equipment or services to submit to the Board a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance governing the use of the surveillance technology; and requiring the Controller, as City Services Auditor, to audit annually the use of surveillance technology equipment or services and the conformity of such use with an approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and provide an audit report to the Board of Supervisors.

01/29/19; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 2/28/2019.

02/06/19; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Department of Technology, Mayor's Office, Controller, Office of the Sheriff and the District Attorney for informational purposes.

04/15/19; CONTINUED. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); Bill Barnes (Office of the City Administrator); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Steven Renderous (Center for Media Justice); Tim Kingston and Deonarvir Evans (Racial Justice Committee, Office of the Public Defender); Tracy Rosenberg; Shahid Buttar; Nitin Sapra; Spencer Hudson; Gladys Rosario (Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights of the San Francisco Bay Area); Speaker; Alexander Post; Aneeqa Abid (Council on American-Islamic Relations); Nathan Sheard (Electronic Frontier Foundation); Brian Hofer (Secure Justice); spoke in support of the hearing matter. Chris Ward Kline (PAVEN); spoke in opposition to the hearing matter. Speaker; Mr. Wright; Speaker; spoke neither in support nor opposition to the hearing matter.

(Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.)

04/22/19; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Nathan Shear; spoke in support of the matter. Alice Xavier; Susan Gard (Department of Human Resources); Frank Noto; spoke in opposition of the matter.

04/22/19; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Matt Caagle (ACLU); Richard Ow; Tim Kingston; Peter Hosey; Sumino Suman; Tracy Almandere; Frank Noto; Bridget Sharnet; Lin Sanpro (Office of the Public Defender); spoke in support of the matter. Pius Lee; Marlene Tran; Mr. Su; Paul Lee; Nancy Sito; Alice Xavier; Speaker; Speaker; Ms. Jun; Patricia Boyd; Meredith Sera (Stop Crime); Sureke Duke; spoke in opposition of the matter. Richard Fond; Nathan Share; spoke neither in support nor opposition on the matter.*

Chair Ronen moved that this Ordinance be **AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE**, on Page 4, Lines 4-8, to insert '(10) A description of products and services acquired or used in the preceding year that are not already included in the Surveillance Technology Policy, including manufacturer and model numbers, and the identity of any entity or individual that provides to the Department services or equipment essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology; and'; Page 5, Lines 1-3, clarifying that City Department and Department shall not include federally regulated facilities at the Airport and the Port; Page 7, Lines 18 -21, to strike Item 10; Pages 10-11, to insert additional circumstances where a Department must acquire Board of Supervisors approval in the use of Surveillance Technology and set circumstances where the Board of Supervisors may approve a Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance; Page 12, Lines 6-15, to clarify that the ordinance shall not prohibit, restrict, or interfere with the receipt, access to, or use by a City department of information gathered by non-City entity or individuals from Surveillance Technology; and adding other clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require that City departments acquiring Surveillance Technology, or entering into agreements to receive information from non-City owned Surveillance Technology, submit a Board of Supervisors approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance, based on a policy or policies developed by the Committee on Information Technology (COIT), and a Surveillance Impact Report to the Board in connection with any request to appropriate funds for the purchase of such technology or to accept and expend grant funds for such purpose, or otherwise to procure Surveillance Technology equipment or services; require each City department that owns and operates existing surveillance technology equipment or services to submit to the Board a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance governing the use of the surveillance technology; and requiring the Controller, as City Services Auditor, to audit annually the use of surveillance technology equipment or services and the conformity of such use with an approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and provide an audit report to the Board of Supervisors.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be **RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

Chair Ronen requested that File Nos. 190409, 190410 and 190411 be heard together.

**190409 [Mayoral Reappointment, Successor Agency Commission (Commonly Known as Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure) - Mara Rosales]**

Motion confirming/rejecting the Mayor's reappointment of Mara Rosales to the Successor Agency Commission (commonly known as the Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure), for a four-year term ending November 3, 2022. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: April 12, 2019)

04/16/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Mara Rosales; Desi Danganan; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Duss Lomparas; spoke in support of the appointment of Desi Danganan.*

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be **AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE**, by striking the word 'rejecting' throughout the legislation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

Motion approving the Mayor's reappointment of Mara Rosales to the Successor Agency Commission (commonly known as the Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure), for a four-year term ending November 3, 2022. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: April 12, 2019)

**Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

**190410 [Mayoral Appointment, Successor Agency Commission (Commonly Known as Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure) - Bivett Brackett]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's appointment of Bivett Brackett to the Successor Agency Commission (commonly known as the Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure), for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending November 3, 2020. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: April 12, 2019)

04/16/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Mara Rosales; Desi Danganan; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Duss Lomparas; spoke in support of the appointment of Desi Danganan.*

**Chair Ronen moved that this Motion be CONTINUED to the May 20, 2019, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

**190411 [Mayoral Appointment, Successor Agency Commission (Commonly Known as Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure) - Desi Danganan]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's appointment of Desi Danganan to the Successor Agency Commission (commonly known as the Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure), for a four-year term ending November 3, 2022. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: April 12, 2019)

04/16/19; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Mara Rosales; Desi Danganan; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Duss Lomparas; spoke in support of the appointment of Desi Danganan.*

**Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, by striking the word 'rejecting' throughout the legislation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

Motion approving the Mayor's appointment of Desi Danganan to the Successor Agency Commission (commonly known as the Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure), for a four-year term ending November 3, 2022. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Ordinance No. 215-12, Section 6(b), provides that this member shall be appointed by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action. Transmittal date: April 12, 2019)

**Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Mar

## **ADJOURNMENT**

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 12:20 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*